current issues in consciousness research

Conscious and Unconscious Mentality

Examining their Nature, Similarities, and Differences

Edited by JURAJ HVORECKÝ, TOMÁŠ MARVAN, and MICHAL POLÁK

A Psychology Press Book



CONSCIOUS AND UNCONSCIOUS MENTALITY

In this collection of essays, experts in the field of consciousness research shed light on the intricate relationship between conscious and unconscious states of mind.

Advancing the debate on consciousness research, this book puts centre stage the topic of commonalities and differences between conscious and unconscious contents of the mind. The collection of cutting-edge chapters offers a breadth of research perspectives, with some arguing that unconscious states have been unjustly overlooked and deserve recognition for their richness and wide scope. Others contend that significant differences between conscious and unconscious states persist, highlighting the importance of their distinct characteristics. Explorations into the nature of the transition from unconscious to conscious mind further complicate the picture, with some authors questioning whether a sharp divide between unconscious and conscious states truly exists.

Delving into ontological, epistemological, and methodological issues, this thought-provoking text challenges established paradigms and paves the way for a reimagining of consciousness research. It does so in an understandable and accessible way, making this a perfect companion for both experts and students of philosophy, psychology, and related fields.

Juraj Hvorecký is a researcher at the Department of Applied Philosophy and Ethics at the Institute of Philosophy of the Czech Academy of Sciences in Prague. He also teaches at the Undergraduate Program in Central European Studies (UPCES) in the Czech capital. He combines his interests in philosophy of mind with applied ethics, especially in the domain of disruptive technologies. **Tomáš Marvan** is the head of the Department of Analytic Philosophy at the Institute of Philosophy of the Czech Academy of Sciences in Prague. Marvan is a philosopher of mind working at the intersection of philosophy, neuroscience, and psychology. He works on mental qualities, and on the differences between conscious and unconscious perceptual processing.

Michal Polák is Professor of Philosophy at the University of West Bohemia, Pilsen, Czech Republic, where he is responsible for teaching and research in the field of philosophy of mind and cognitive sciences. He explores various aspects of phenomenal consciousness from a naturalistic perspective, the neural basis of consciousness, mind-brain identity, and selfhood.

Current Issues in Consciousness Research Series Editor: John Vervaeke, Aarhus University, Denmark

Current Issues in Consciousness Research is a series of edited books which reflect the state of the art in areas of current and emerging interest in the psychological and philosophical study of consciousness.

Each volume is tightly focussed on a particular topic and consists of chapters contributed by international experts. The editors of individual volumes are leading figures in their areas and provide an introductory overview.

Sensation of Movement

Edited by Thor Grünbaum and Mark Schram Christensen

Transitions Between Consciousness and Unconsciousness

Edited by Guido Hesselmann

Beyond Neural Correlates of Consciousness Edited by Morten Overgaard, Jesper Mogensen and Asger Kirkeby-Hinrup

Conscious and Unconscious Mentality

Examining their Nature, Similarities, and Differences Edited by Juraj Hvorecký, Tomáš Marvan, and Michal Polák

For more information about this series, please visit: www.routledge.com/Current-Issues-in-Consciousness-Research/book-series/CURRISSCONSC



CONSCIOUS AND UNCONSCIOUS MENTALITY

Examining their Nature, Similarities, and Differences

Edited by Juraj Hvorecký, Tomáš Marvan, and Michal Polák



Designed cover image: © Shutterstock

First published 2024 by Routledge 4 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN

and by Routledge 605 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10158

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

© 2024 selection and editorial matter, the Institute of Philosophy of the Czech Academy of Sciences, Juraj Hvorecký, Tomáš Marvan, Michal Polák, and University of West Bohemia; individual chapters, the contributors.

The right of Juraj Hvorecký, Tomáš Marvan and Michal Polák to be identified as the authors of the editorial material, and of the authors for their individual chapters, has been asserted in accordance with sections 77 and 78 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

With the exception of Chapters 2, 4, 9, 10, 14 and 16, no part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

Chapters 2, 4, 9, 10, 14, and 16 of this book are freely available as a downloadable Open Access PDF at http://www.taylorfrancis.com under a Creative Commons Attribution-Non Commercial-No Derivatives (CC-BY-NC-ND) 4.0 license.

Trademark notice: Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data Names: Hvorecký, Juraj, editor. | Marvan, Tomáš, editor. | Polák, Michal (Professor of philosophy), editor. Title: Conscious and unconscious mentality : examining their nature, similarities and differences / efited by Juraj Hvorecký, Tomáš Marvan and Michal Polák. Description: Abingdon, Oxon ; New York, NY : Routledge, 2024. | Series: Current issues in consciousness research | Includes bibliographical references and index. Identifiers: LCCN 2023036375 (print) | LCCN 2023036376 (ebook) | ISBN 9781032529790 (hardback) | ISBN 9781032529745 (paperback) | ISBN 9781003409526 (ebook) Subjects: LCSH: Consciousness. | Subconsciousness. Classification: LCC BF311 .C64428 2024 (print) LCC BF311 (ebook) | DDC 153-dc23/eng/20230913 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2023036375 LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2023036376 ISBN: 978-1-032-52979-0 (hbk) ISBN: 978-1-032-52974-5 (pbk)

ISBN: 978-1-003-40952-6 (ebk)

DOI: 10.4324/9781003409526

Typeset in Galliard by Newgen Publishing UK

CONTENTS

Co Pri	Contributors Preface	
1	Introduction: Mapping the contrasts and parallels between the conscious and unconscious mind Juraj Hvorecký, Tomáš Marvan, and Michal Polák	1
PAI Co	RT I Inceptual issues	9
2	Conscious and unconscious qualities: Conceptual relations between phenomenality, what-it's-likeness, and consciousness <i>Michal Polák</i>	11
3	Blindsight is unconscious perception Berit Brogaard and Dimitria Electra Gatzia	31
4	Against unconscious volition <i>Tim Bayne</i>	55

5 On the alleged misrepresentation problem: (Not a problem for HOT theories. Not a problem for any theory, really.) <i>Brice Bantegnie</i>	74
PART II Methodological issues	89
6 Methodological considerations for the study of mental qualities <i>David Rosenthal</i>	91
7 Can structuralist theories be general theories of consciousness? Sascha Benjamin Fink and Lukas Kob	112
8 The old and new criterion problems Matthias Michel	130
PART III Unconscious qualities in perception and emotion	155
9 The brain-based argument for unconscious sensory qualities <i>Tomáš Marvan</i>	157
10 Troubles with the orthogonality thesis Juraj Hvorecký	174
11 Unconsciously smelling self and others Benjamin D. Young	185
12 A feeling theory of unconscious emotions Sam Coleman	207

PART IV Attention, degrees of consciousness, and graduality	
13 Degrees of attention and degrees of consciousness Azenet Liora Lopez Lopez	229
14 Template tuning and graded consciousness Berit Brogaard and Thomas Alrik Sørensen	251
15 Colour bit-by-bit: The puzzle of colour development Kathleen Akins and Martin Hahn	274
16 (Un)conscious perspectival shape and attention guidance in visual search: A reply to Morales, Bax, and Firestone (2020) <i>Benjamin Henke and Assaf Weksler</i>	311
Index	

CONTRIBUTORS

Kathleen Akins is Professor of Philosophy at Simon Fraser University, James S. McDonnell Centennial Fellow in Philosophy of Science, and a Burnaby Mountain Endowed Research Professor. Her work incorporates current research within philosophy of mind, neurophysiology, neuropsychology, neuroethology and psychophysics in order to understand the nature of perception, cognition, consciousness, the emotions and mental representation in general. She has published extensively, for example in *The Behavioral and Brain Sciences, Current Biology*, and *Consciousness and Cognition*. Together with Martin Hahn, she has been working on the book, which argues for a new account of colour perception, and solves some long-standing puzzles in neuroscience, phenomenology, and metaphysics of colour.

Brice Bantegnie received his PhD from the Jean Nicod Institute in Paris and is currently a Marie Skłodowska-Curie Action Global Postdoctoral Fellow at the University of California, Riverside, and at the University of Southampton. He was previously a member of the research group on 'Dual Models of Phenomenal Consciousness' at the Institute of Philosophy of the Czech Academy of Sciences.

Berit 'Brit' Brogaard is Professor of Philosophy and Senior Cooper Fellow at the University of Miami. Her areas of research include philosophy of perception, philosophical psychology, and cognitive science. She is the author of *Transient Truths* (Oxford University Press, 2012), *On Romantic Love* (Oxford University Press, 2015), *The Superhuman Mind* (Penguin, 2015), *Seeing & Saying* (Oxford University Press, 2018), and *Hatred: Understanding Our Most Dangerous Emotion* (Oxford University Press, 2020). **Tim Bayne** is a philosopher of mind and cognitive science, with a particular interest in the nature of consciousness. A Senior Fellow at the Brain, Mind and Consciousness program of the Canadian Institute for Advanced Research (CIFAR), Toronto; he is Professor of Philosophy at Monash University (Melbourne), having taught previously at Macquarie University, the University of Western Ontario, the University of Manchester, and the University of Oxford. He has published widely, and is the author of *The Unity of Consciousness* (OUP, 2010) and *Thought: A Very Short Introduction* (OUP, 2013), *Philosophy of Religion: A Very Short Introduction* (OUP, 2013), and *Philosophy of Mind: An Introduction* (Routledge, 2022). His current research focus concerns the problem of other minds, and the challenge of identifying the presence of consciousness in infants, non-human animals, and artificial systems.

Sam Coleman is Reader in Philosophy of Mind and Cognitive Science at the University of Hertfordshire. He works on consciousness, especially the relationship between conscious and unconscious forms of mentality, and has written articles on these topics. His book *Dark Mind: Subjectivity without Consciousness* is forthcoming with Oxford University Press.

Sascha Benjamin Fink is Junior Professor of Neurophilosophy at Otto-von-Guericke-University, Magdeburg, Germany, and substituted as Professor for Cognitive Anthropology at University Leipzig. At Magdeburg, he coheads the Philosophy-Neurosciences-Cognition-Program and is a member of the Center for Behavioral Brain Sciences. His publications focus on philosophical issues in the neuroscience of consciousness, especially concerning neural correlates of consciousness, the structure of conscious experiences, and the status of first-person methods. He has edited issues on the neural correlates of consciousness, the philosophy of psychedelics, thinking and perceiving, the legacy of Thomas Metzinger and, being a strong advocate for fair and sustainable scientific publishing, works as an editor-in-chief for the diamond open access journal Philosophy and the Mind Sciences. Currently, he works on sensory engineering, structural approaches to consciousness, the psychology of vagueness and philosophical issues of psychedelics in the BMBF-project PsychedELSI. He loves good food and ancient forests.

Dimitria Electra Gatzia is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Akron, Ohio. She specializes in Philosophy of Mind and Cognitive Neuroscience. She is the recipient of research fellowships at the Centre of Philosophy Psychology at the University of Antwerp (2016–2017) and the Czech Academy of Sciences, Institute of Philosophy (Summer 2021), and the coeditor (with Berit Brogaard) of *The Epistemology of Non-visual Perception* (OUP, 2020) and *The Philosophy and Psychology of Ambivalence: Being of Two Minds* (Routledge, 2021).

Martin Hahn is an Associate Professor of Philosophy at Simon Fraser University, British Columbia, Canada, Department of Philosophy. He is especially interested in the connections, and differences, between linguistic reference and intentionality and the consequences of direct reference theory for accounts of mental representation. He is a co-editor (with Bjørn Ramberg) of *Reflections and Replies: Essays on the Philosophy of Tyler Burge* (MIT Press, 2003).

Benjamin Henke is a Postdoctoral Research Fellow at the Centre for Philosophical Psychology at the University of Antwerp and a Research Fellow with the Psyphas Program in Psychology and Philosophy at the University of Haifa. He has research interests in cognitive science, artificial intelligence, and epistemology.

Juraj Hvorecký is a researcher at the Department of Applied Philosophy and Ethics at the Institute of Philosophy of the Czech Academy of Sciences in Prague. He also teaches at the Undergraduate Program in Central European Studies (UPCES) program in the Czech capital. He combines his interests in philosophy of mind with applied ethics, especially in the domain of disruptive technologies. More specifically, he is interested in emotions, conscious/ unconscious divide, and the ethical implications of social robotics and autonomous technology.

Lukas Kob is in the final year of his doctoral studies on the topic of structuralism in consciousness science. This work is being conducted as part of the research project 'Extrospection. External access to higher cognitive processes', which is primarily based at the Berlin School of Mind and Brain and Otto-von-Guericke University Magdeburg. He received a B.Sc. in Psychology from the University of Leipzig and an M.Sc. in Philosophy-Neurosciences-Cognition from Ottovon-Guericke University Magdeburg, where he currently works as a research assistant. His academic interests include unexplored connections between the philosophy of science and the philosophy of consciousness, as well as systems neuroscience and cognitive psychology.

Azenet Lopez is a postdoctoral researcher at the interdisciplinary research group Cognition, Values and Behavior at the Ludwig Maximilian University of Munich. She holds a temporary position as principal investigator of the project 'From Information to Consciousness through Attention and Integration', funded by the German Research Council (DFG). She earned her Ph.D. in Philosophy from the University of Miami in 2020.

Tomáš Marvan is the head of the Department of Analytic Philosophy at the Institute of Philosophy, Czech Academy of Sciences (Prague). Marvan is a philosopher of mind working at the intersection of philosophy, neuroscience, and psychology. He works on mental qualities, and on the differences between conscious and unconscious perceptual processing. He has also published on conceptual relativism, ontological realism, and free will. He (co-)authored three books and numerous papers. The papers appeared in journals such as *Consciousness and Cognition, Neuroscience of Consciousness* and *Philosophy and the Mind Sciences*.

Matthias Michel is a postdoctoral researcher at the Center for Mind, Brain, and Consciousness, New York University. His research focuses on foundational and methodological issues in the cognitive neuroscience of consciousness. He is interested in the goals of consciousness science, its main explanatory concepts, and its experimental and inferential methods.

Michal Polák is Professor of Philosophy at the University of West Bohemia, Pilsen, Czech Republic, where he is responsible for teaching and research in the field of philosophy of mind and cognitive sciences. He explores various aspects of phenomenal consciousness from a naturalistic perspective, the neural basis of consciousness, mind-brain identity, and selfhood. His work includes three books and articles which have appeared in *Consciousness and Cognition*, *Philosophy and the Mind Sciences, Neuroscience of Consciousness, Frontiers in Psychology*, and the *European Journal of Analytic Philosophy*.

David Rosenthal is Professor of Philosophy at the Graduate Center, City University of New York, and Coordinator of the Graduate Center's Interdisciplinary Concentration in Cognitive Science. He works mainly in philosophy of mind and has published extensively on the nature of consciousness, especially on his higher-order-thought theory of consciousness, on his quality-space theory that individuates mental qualities independently of consciousness, and on the awareness and identification of the self. He has also published on the nature of intentional content, mind-body materialism, the emotions, Descartes's theory of freedom, Moore's paradox, and the importance of the history of philosophy, and related topics.

Thomas Alrik Sørensen is an Associate Professor of Cognitive Neuroscience and Neuropsychology at Aalborg University in Denmark, where he is heading the Center for Cognitive Neuroscience. He is also affiliated with the Sino-Danish Center for Education and Research in Beijing as well as the Center of Functionally Integrative Neuroscience at Aarhus University, Denmark. He has investigated a range of diverse topics, but currently his main area of research is in the field of perception and memory, where he has explored topics like synesthesia, multi-sensory perception, attention, and expertise.

Assaf Weksler is a Teaching Faculty Member at the Department of History, Philosophy, and Judaic Studies at the Open University of Israel, and a Research Fellow with the Psyphas Program in Psychology and Philosophy at the University of Haifa. His work focuses mainly on philosophy of perception, informed by its psychology and neuroscience.

Benjamin D. Young is an Associate Professor of Philosophy and a member of the graduate faculty in interdisciplinary neuroscience and the Institute for Neuroscience at the University of Nevada, Reno. He conducts research at the intersection of cognitive neuroscience and philosophy with a particular emphasis on olfaction. His research on nonconceptual content, qualitative consciousness in the absence of awareness and the perceptible objects of smell appeared in journals such as *Mind & Language, Neuroscience and Biobehavioral Reviews, Pacific Philosophical Quarterly* and *Philosophical Studies.* His most recent projects include the co-edited textbook *Mind, Cognition, and Neuroscience* (Routledge 2022) and a co-edited collection *Theoretical Perspectives on Smell* (Routledge 2023). Ben just finished a book on olfactory philosophy tentatively titled *Stinking Philosophy* (MIT press, forthcoming) and is currently working on a book about the unconscious and our sense of self, tentatively titled *Don't Tell Anyone.*

PREFACE

The journey leading to this book began several years ago when a small team of researchers at two Czech institutions started to debate intricacies of the theories of consciousness. Initial discussions and the first common results were significantly boosted by a grant from the Czech Science Foundation that the team was awarded in 2020. Since then, our work has been more systematic. Besides publications, we were able to establish research connections to people with similar interests across the globe. This latter effort led to the conference in the summer of 2021. The editors of this volume (together with Brice Bantegnie and Veronika Lorencová) organized the event titled "Conscious and Unconscious Mind: Commonalities and Differences", with over twenty participants. The conference took place in the Dominican Monastery in the heart of Prague, and was jointly organized by the Institute of Philosophy of the Czech Academy of Sciences and the Department of Philosophy at the University of West Bohemia. The two days of the conference were filled with lively talks and debates about conscious and unconscious mentality. Most of the papers presented at the conference were later reworked into the chapters of this volume. Three chapters were additionally commissioned to make the topics of the volume more comprehensive.

We would like to thank all the conference participants and authors of the chapters, Emilie Coin, Khyati Sanger, Ceri McLardy, and Tori Sharpe at Routledge, and everyone who contributed in one way or another to this volume. Work on it was generously supported by the Czech Science Foundation (GAČR) project 'Dual Models of Phenomenal Consciousness' (project no. 20-14445S), realized jointly at the Institute of Philosophy of the Czech Academy of Sciences and at the Department of Philosophy, University of West Bohemia.

To make communication more jovial while working on the grant, on the conference, and on the present volume, we sometimes referred to ourselves as 'Phenomenals'. By this we meant all who are deeply interested in phenomenal experience and its enigmas. We hope that the book will be enjoyed by the Phenomenals out there who ponder the relations between conscious and unconscious episodes in perception, emotion, volition, and thought.

The Editors

1 INTRODUCTION

Mapping the contrasts and parallels between the conscious and unconscious mind

Juraj Hvorecký, Tomáš Marvan, and Michal Polák

Debates in the field of consciousness research concentrate mostly on outlines and defences of theories of consciousness. Such theories are concerned with how contents become phenomenally conscious, what is phenomenality, and how qualitative and cognitive aspects of consciousness combine. Yet comparatively little attention has been paid to how our increasing understanding of the unconscious mind determines the explanatory success of such theories (for exceptions to this trend, see, e.g., the essays collected in Radman 2017 and Hesselman 2019). Many mental processes that were historically associated solely with consciousness seem to also be present at the unconscious level, and we are getting an ever more-refined picture of the scope, richness, and functions of such processes. Theories of consciousness not infrequently include strong assumptions about unconscious processing without thinking through this new evidence. Often observed is cherry-picking of various empirical results from tasks that tap into unconscious processes, and their utilization in consciousness research to advance a particular position. What is missing is a global perspective on how theories of consciousness should be shaped by what we know about unconscious mentality. The present volume reverses this current by putting the topic of commonalities and differences between conscious and unconscious contents of the mind at the centre of the stage.

Neglecting the connection between the unconscious and conscious parts of the mind leads to the following issue: Unless we have a clear notion of how exactly conscious and unconscious states differ, we don't know what it is that the theory of consciousness is supposed to explain. In consequence, we may burden ourselves with unnecessary worries regarding the function(s) of consciousness. It seems fair to presume that the vast majority of theories of consciousness postulate that conscious and unconscious mental states have a radically different nature. Unconscious states, if they are presumed by a theory at all, lack the defining features of the conscious ones. Yet the more we learn about unconscious states and processes, the more intricate an image of this part of mind is revealed, often leading to surprising discoveries. In many domains, unconscious states turn out to be richer and more complex than previously thought, often coming indistinguishably close to their conscious counterparts. If that is so, implications for theories of consciousness are forthcoming. The more work on creating mental content is done unconsciously, the less is demanded of consciousness. Perhaps, then, we should not assume that consciousness is fulfilling all those tasks that were traditionally assigned to it. Instead of a maximal strategy that considers consciousness as a tool that creates, structures, and endows contents with various properties, one could explore less demanding roles for it. In its extreme form, consciousness could be regarded as playing one role only—that of making the already prepared and fully determined contents conscious.

Intentional, temporal, motivational, subjective, and other properties of mental states are clearly present at the conscious level. The central issue is to what degree analogous (or possibly identical) properties are to be found at the unconscious level. If the unconscious existence of some, or even most of them, could be well established, there is no reason to assume that consciousness plays a significant role in making them real. Importantly, there is one set of properties that conscious states are widely assumed to possess exclusively, namely phenomenal properties. However, even this central assumption of consciousness research can be challenged by showing that the opposite approach is consistent with much recent evidence. In many cases, the identity of conscious and unconscious phenomenal contents seems to be supported by relevant experiments and conceptual considerations. Furthermore, there is evidence suggesting that unconscious contents are sometimes richer than their conscious counterparts. These scenarios, uncovered by recent research on unconscious mental states, call for the rethinking of some of the theories of consciousness promoted today-and of the very relation between conscious and unconscious mind.

Several of the contributors to this volume take the recent evidence on unconscious mentality as indicating that unconscious states have been unfairly belittled: Unconscious states are every bit as real and richly structured as conscious ones. Other authors push back, arguing that at least some categories of conscious states do not have their unconscious counterparts, or that the differences between conscious and unconscious states remain more important than any possible commonalities. A closely related strand in this volume is represented by authors exploring the nature of the transition from unconscious to conscious mind. What does it take for an unconscious mental state to enter consciousness? Is major transformation required? Or, perhaps the talk of 'entering consciousness' is altogether misleading because there is no sharp divide between unconscious and conscious parts of mind. The transition from unconscious to conscious states may be a *graded* one—and the very contents that we experience may have gradually emerging properties. The remaining chapters complement these two strands in various ways, addressing ontological, epistemological, and methodological issues surrounding unconscious mental states and their relations to the contents of consciousness.

Michal Polák's opening chapter starts from the assumption that phenomenality (or qualitativeness) is a trait that may pertain to unconscious states. Polák argues that separating phenomenality from consciousness requires a reconsideration of the meaning of three concepts that are essential in the discourse on the nature and emergence of phenomenal consciousness. The notions of 'phenomenality', 'what-it's-likeness', and 'consciousness' are all closely related, and accepting the assumption of unconscious qualities changes the relations among them as well as the meanings commonly assigned to the terms. This can be seen most significantly in the very notion of consciousness itself.

Berit Brogaard and Dimitria E. Gatzia's chapter follows up recent controversies about whether *blindsight* is a form of unconscious perception or not. It has been argued by Phillips (2020) and others that blindsight is not unconscious perception but rather a form of degraded conscious perception. Brogaard and Gatzia defend the opposite view. They accept that blindsight produces residual awareness but argue that this residual awareness is non-perceptual. They focus on the residual visual abilities to detect and discriminate colour found in some blindsight patients, showing that residual conscious vision. The perceptual aspects of blindsight are therefore entirely unconscious.

Unlike Brogaard and Gatzia, who defend a wide functionality of the unconscious states, Tim Bayne argues that volitional states are necessarily conscious, and there are no unconscious counterparts to volitions. Bayne starts off from a careful delineation of volition and argues that, as it is a personallevel phenomenon interacting with a central processing agency, it cannot be unconscious. He discusses and rejects various objections to his thesis and goes over several purported examples of unconscious volition to demonstrate they do not represent genuine cases of the phenomenon. Bayne also offers some general remarks on the diversity of mental states that should preclude scholars from simply assuming uniformity of existence of all mental states in their conscious and unconscious forms.

Brice Bantegnie tackles a question pressing the higher-order thought accounts of consciousness. On a standard reading of these accounts, there are two states to any higher-order theory, the lower-level target state and the higher-level state that targets the lower-level one. This is the so-called relational reading of HOT. It is worrisome that the higher-order thought can misrepresent the first-order state, with assumed consequences for conscious perception. Bantegnie offers reasons to adopt the non-relational HOT view and makes a case against the purported threat of misrepresentation cases. He goes on to argue that misrepresentation is a problem that affects no version of HOT theory, and should therefore be discarded.

David Rosenthal, in his chapter ('Methodological considerations for the study of mental qualities'), points out a major methodological drawback of those conceptions—he calls them intrinsicalist—which do not allow for unconscious mental qualitative character. Intrinsicalist conceptions, Rosenthal claims, not only lack independent support but preclude any informative account of what conscious qualitative character consists in. Rosenthal goes on to develop an alternative account of mental qualities, an account that proceeds independently of consciousness, and is supported by robust empirical findings. The chapter also offers an explanation of why the intrinsicalist picture is widely endorsed, as well as why many authors maintain that the subjective appearances of consciousness exhaust its mental reality.

In 'Can structuralist theories be general theories of consciousness?', Sascha Benjamin Fink and Lukas Kob scrutinize the distinction between conscious and unconscious mental states through the lens of 'neurophenomenal structuralism'. This view assumes that phenomenal states are individuated by their relational structure and that this structure is reflected in neural activation spaces. Taking this view as their starting point, Fink and Kob ask whether it is possible to develop a structuralist account of the transition between unconscious and conscious mental states. They carefully explore the structuralist options, disagreeing with each other about the promise of neurophenomenal structuralism to become a general theory of consciousness. While Kob thinks that the neurophenomenalist solution can only elucidate the structure of experience, Fink is more optimistic in holding that, with suitable adjustments and conceptual innovations, one could devise an all-encompassing structuralist account of how unconscious states turn into conscious ones.

Matthias Michel's chapter ('The old and new criterion problems') revives the recent methodological debates about the so-called 'criterion problem'. This problem issues from the fact that negative subjective reports such as, 'I didn't see the stimulus', can be interpreted as indicating either that the subject really didn't see the stimulus, or as indicating that, while the subject did see the stimulus, the strength of the sensory signals associated with the stimulus dropped to a level that elicited a conservative response. Michel presents two solutions of the criterion problem. He then goes on to propose what he calls the 'new criterion problem', which consists in determining whether criteria effects reflect perceptual changes, or changes in the subject's response strategy. Working through case studies, he argues that, although there is currently no systematic way to solve it, this new version of the criterion problem can in principle be solved as well. Tomáš Marvan presents two arguments for unconscious sensory qualities the behavioural and the neural. The upshot of both arguments is that the similarities between conscious and unconscious sensory states are much greater than typically assumed in both the philosophy of mind and the cognitive neuroscience of consciousness. In fact, both arguments (and especially the latter one, which is explored at some length in the chapter) support the view that the mechanisms of sensory qualities are literally the same in conscious and unconscious perceptual conditions. This view has important implications for general theories of consciousness and for research on neural correlates of consciousness.

The next chapter, by Juraj Hvorecký ('Troubles with the orthogonality thesis'), presents a series of challenges for the thesis that conscious and unconscious mental states share the same properties. Hvorecký starts off by evaluating criteria for their sameness and discovers that the claims of identity require stronger arguments than standardly offered. He then offers empirical and conceptual arguments against the thesis of orthogonality that assumes the independence of content and consciousness and, in doing so, he attacks the so-called two-factor theories of consciousness. At the end of his chapter, Hvorecký outlines an alternative one-factor theory in which contents of consciousness result from a cumulative aggregation of properties that, upon crossing a certain critical threshold, simply make contents conscious without the need for any additional functional steps.

In 'Unconsciously smelling the self and others', Benjamin D. Young complicates the picture of the conscious/unconscious divide even further. His detailed knowledge of the olfactory domain leads him to a thorough exploration of the role of unconscious smells in guiding our everyday behaviour. Young illustrates how smells, unlike other forms of perception, are not transparent. One might perceive them as pleasant or disgusting, but in fact they inform us about many other properties of ourselves and others illnesses, family linkages, states of oneself. This is all done unconsciously, yet via a medium that is consciously present. His chapter is a strong reminder that constructing theories of consciousness in a single, usually visual, modality could be deeply misleading.

Sam Coleman presents a novel argument for the existence of unconscious emotional states with qualitative character. Feeling theories of emotions equate emotions with episodes of conscious qualitative character possessing a distinctive emotional 'feel'. The feeling theory cannot be true simpliciter, argues Coleman, since there are unconscious emotions, but no such thing as unconscious feelings. The author claims that prominent feeling theories of emotions (such as those advocated by Jesse Prinz and Uriah Kriegel) founder on a dilemma: They can say that either conscious emotions are feelings, or that there are unconscious emotions, but not both. In their place Coleman proposes a simple alternative feeling theory, which identifies emotions with emotional qualitative characters. Since emotions can exist unconsciously, emotional qualitative character can exist unconsciously, Coleman concludes.

Azenet Lopez asks whether consciousness arises gradually or is a discontinuous (all-or-nothing, categorical) phenomenon. The option that consciousness is a gradual affair assumes a spectrum going from completely unconscious to fully conscious states. In contrast, the discontinuity thesis asserts that the transition from unconscious to conscious states contains no intermediate steps. In order to answer this empirical question, Lopez argues, it is important to consider which properties consciousness must have anyway, regardless of one's preferred theory of consciousness. One of these key properties, according to the author, is attention. Lopez goes on to argue that attention is a gradual phenomenon, which, in turn, supports the claim that consciousness must also be a gradual affair.

Berit Brogaard and Thomas Alrik Sørensen extend their previously introduced 'template tuning theory' to answer the puzzling question about the gradability of perceptual consciousness. Upon reviewing ample empirical evidence, they side with defenders of gradable consciousness. According to them, inexact categorization of visual input often results in working memory storage that is not fully available to the perceiver, thereby issuing in graded phenomenal awareness of the target. While their template tuning theory proves to be compatible with both graded and dichotomous accounts of consciousness, their exploration of further empirical data supports the gradable view.

Kathleen Akins and Martin Hahn present a gradualist account of colour phenomenology. Their chapter introduces a new puzzle about how human infants begin to see colour. Human cortical vision, in all its complexity, develops slowly over many years. So, when does the human capacity for colour vision arise, and how does it develop? The chapter presents a partial explanation of how colour vision arrives 'bit by bit'. The authors conclude with the suggestion that the distinction between 'black and white' and 'colour' one that applies so cleanly to physical images—is unlikely to map onto human visual phenomenology in any informative way.

The closing chapter, written by Benjamin Henke and Assaf Weksler, revisits a recent controversy about the nature of perspectival shape perception. Many objects have known shapes, yet under specific viewing conditions, they are perceived as possessing a different, perspectival shape as well. For instance, when viewing a circular coin rotated in depth, it fills an elliptical region of the visual scene. Henke and Weksler criticize a recent experiment (Morales et al. 2020) that endorses perspectivalism—the view that perspectival shapes are genuinely presented in perceptual experience alongside the real ones. Interpreting the same evidence with the help of unconscious pre-attentive guidance, the authors conclude that the alternative view, anti-perspectivalism, can also successfully explain the results of the experiment. The debate thus continues.

It is our hope that the present volume will stimulate further interest in similarities and differences between conscious and unconscious states and episodes, and will spark new debates on this topic. As we stressed at the beginning of this Introduction, the subject matter is not just interesting in its own right, but it has important implications for any empirically grounded theory of consciousness. The theory of consciousness of those who believe that conscious and unconscious episodes are dramatically different is bound to be very different from the theory of those who think conscious and unconscious episodes are in their core properties nearly indistinguishable. Hence, parallel to the ongoing honing of the individual theories—such as the global workspace theory, neural recurrence theory, or Higher Order Thought theory—we also need to think more deeply about the basic assumptions underlying any such theory. Among these, assumptions about the scope, richness, and functions of unconscious states should be seen as particularly important.

Acknowledgements

Work on this chapter was supported by the Czech Science Foundation (GAČR), project no. 20–144458 ('Dual Models of Phenomenal Consciousness') realized at the Institute of Philosophy, Czech Academy of Sciences, and the Department of Philosophy, University of West Bohemia.

References

- Hesselman, Guido (ed.). 2019. Transitions Between Consciousness and Unconsciousness. London and New York: Routledge.
- Morales, Jorge, Axel Bax, and Chaz Firestone. 2020. "Sustained Representation of Perspectival Shape." *PNAS* 117 (26): 14873–14882. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.2000715117
- Phillips, Ian. 2020. "Blindsight Is Qualitatively Degraded Conscious Vision." Psychological Review 128 (3): 558–584. https://doi.org/10.1037/rev0000254
- Radman, Zdravko (ed.). 2017. Before Consciousness: In Search of the Fundamentals of Mind. Exeter: Imprint Academic.

Introduction

Hesselman, Guido (ed.). 2019. Transitions Between Consciousness and Unconsciousness. London and New York: Routledge.

Morales, Jorge , Axel Bax , and Chaz Firestone . 2020. "Sustained Representation of Perspectival Shape." PNAS 117 (26): 14873–14882. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.2000715117 Phillips, Ian . 2020. "Blindsight Is Qualitatively Degraded Conscious Vision." Psychological Review 128 (3): 558–584. https://doi.org/10.1037/rev0000254

Radman, Zdravko (ed.). 2017. Before Consciousness: In Search of the Fundamentals of Mind. Exeter: Imprint Academic.

Conscious and unconscious qualities

Aru, Jaan , Mototaka Suzuki , and Matthew E. Larkum . 2020. "Cellular Mechanisms of Conscious Processing." Trends in Cognitive Sciences 24 (10): 814–825. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tics.2020.07.006

Aru, Jaan , Mototaka Suzuki , Renate Rutiku , Matthew E. Larkum , and Talis Bachmann . 2019. "Coupling the State and Contents of Consciousness." Frontiers in Systems Neuroscience 13: 43. https://doi.org/10.3389/fnsys.2019.0004

Bachmann, Talis . 2011. "Attention as a Process of Selection, Perception as a Process of Representation, and Phenomenal Experience as the Resulting Process of Perception Being Modulated by a Dedicated Consciousness Mechanism." Frontiers in Psychology 2: 397. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2011.00387

Bayne, Tim , Jacob Hohwy , and Andreas M. Owen . 2016. "Are There Levels of Consciousness?" Trends in Cognitive Sciences 20 (6): 405–413.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tics.2016.03.009

Block, Ned . 1995. "On a Confusion about the Function of Consciousness." Behavioral and Brain Sciences 18: 227–247. doi:https://10.1017/S0140525X00038188

Block, Ned . 2011. "Perceptual Consciousness Overflows Cognitive Access." Trends in Cognitive Sciences 15 (12): 567–575. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tics.2011.11.001

Brogaard, Berit . 2011. "Color Experience in Blindsight?" Philosophical Psychology 24 (6): 767–786. https://doi.org/10.1080/09515089.2011.562641

Carruthers, Peter . 2000. Phenomenal Consciousness. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Casali, Adenauer G ., Olivia Gosseries , Mario Rosanova , Mélanie Boly , Simone Sarasso , Karina R. Casali , Silvia Casarotto , Marie-Aurélie Bruno , Steven Laureys , Giulio Tononi , and Marcello Massimini . 2013. "A Theoretically Based Index of Consciousness Independent of Sensory Processing and Behavior." Science Translational Medicine 5 (198): 198ra105. https://doi.org/10.1126/scitransImed.3006294

Cavanna, Andrea E ., Marco Mula , Serena Servo , Strigaro Gionata , G. Tota , Bruno Barbagli , L. Collimedaglia , Michele Viana , Roberto M. Cantello , and F. Monaco . 2008. "Measuring the Level and Content of Consciousness During Epileptic Seizures: The Ictal Consciousness Inventory." Epilepsy & Behavior 13 (1): 184–188. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.yebeh.2008.01.009 Chalmers, David . 1996. The Conscious Mind. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Chalmers, David . 2018. "The Meta-Problem of Consciousness." Journal of Consciousness Studies 25 (9-10): 6–61.

D'Ambrosio, Justin , and Daniel Stoljar . 2022. "Two Notions of Resemblance and the Semantics of 'What It's Like'." Inquiry, 1–12. https://doi.org/10.1080/0020174X.2022.2075453 Dorsch, Fabian . 2018. "Phenomenal Presence: An Introduction to the Debate." In Phenomenal Presence, edited by Fiona Macpherson , and Fabian Dorsch , 1–38. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Drayson, Zoe . 2015. "The Philosophy of Phenomenal Consciousness: An Introduction." In The Constitution of Phenomenal Consciousness: Toward a Science and Theory, edited by Steven M. Miller , 273–292. John Benjamins Publishing Company.

Ffytche, Dominic H . 2000. "Imaging Conscious Vision." In Neural Correlates of Consciousness, edited by Thomas Metzinger , 221–230. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Gaskin, Richard . 2019. "A Defence of the Resemblance Meaning of 'What it's like'." Mind 128 (511): 673–698. https://doi.org/10.1093/mind/fzx023

Koch, Christopher . 2004. The Quest for Consciousness: A Neurobiological Approach. Englewood: Roberts & Company Publishers.

Kriegel, Uriah . 2003. "Consciousness as Sensory Quality and as Implicit Self-awareness." Phenomenology and the Cognitive Sciences 2: 1–26. https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1022912206810 Kriegel, Uriah . 2005. "Naturalizing Subjective Character." Philosophy and Phenomenological Research 71 (1): 23–57. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1933-1592.2005.tb00429.x

Kriegel, Uriah . 2009. Subjective Consciousness: A Self-Representational Theory. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press.

Kripke, Saul A . 2001. Naming and Necessity. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press. Levine, Joseph . 2001. Purple Haze: The Puzzle of Consciousness. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Lewis, Clarence I . 1929. Mind and the World Order. New York: Scribner's.

Lycan, William G . 1996. Conscious Experience. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Marvan, Tomáš , and Michal Polák . 2017. "Unitary and Dual Models of Phenomenal

Consciousness." Consciousness and Cognition 56 (November): 1–12.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.concog.2017.09.006

Marvan, Tomáš , and Michal Polák . 2020. "Generality and Content-specificity in the Study of the Neural Correlates of Perceptual Consciousness." Philosophy and the Mind Sciences 1(II): 1–17. https://doi.org/10.33735/phimisci.2020.II.61

Marvan, Tomáš, Michal Polák, Talis Bachmann, and William A. Phillips . 2021. "Apical Amplification – A Cellular Mechanism of Conscious Perception?" Neuroscience of Consciousness 2021 (2): 1–17. https://doi.org/10.1093/nc/niab036

McKilliam, Andy K . 2020. "What Is a Global State of Consciousness?" Philosophy and the Mind Sciences 1 (II): 1–22. https://doi.org/10.33735/phimisci.2020.II.58

Norman, Liam J., Kathleen Akins, Charles A. Heywood, and Robert W. Kentridge. 2014. "Color Constancy for An Unseen Surface." Current Biology 24 (23): 2822–2826. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cub.2014.10.009

Prinz, Jesse . 2012. The Conscious Brain. New York: Oxford University Press.

Prinz, Jesse . 2015. "Unconscious Perception." In The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy of Perception, edited by Mohan Matthen , 371–389. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Prinz, Jesse . 2017. "Unconscious Perception and the Function of Consciousness." In Before Consciousness: In Search of the Fundamentals of Mind, edited by Zdravko Radman , 142–163. Imprint Academic.

Railo, Henri , Nina Salminen-Vaparanta , Linda Henriksson , Antti Revonsuo , and Mika Koivisto . 2012. "Unconscious and Conscious Processing of Color Rely on Activity in Early Visual Cortex: A TMS Study." Journal of Cognitive Neuroscience 24 (4): 819–829.

https://doi.org/10.1162/jocn_a_00172

Revonsuo, Antti . 2010. Consciousness: The Science of Subjectivity. Hove: Psychology Press. Ro, Tony , Neel S. Singhal , Bruno G. Breitmeyer , and Javier O. Garcia . 2009. "Unconscious Processing of Color and Form in Metacontrast Masking". Attention, Perception, & Psychophysics 71 (1): 95–103. https://doi.org/10.3758/APP.71.1.95

Rosenthal, David M . 1991. "The Independence of Consciousness and Sensory Quality." Philosophical Issues 1: 15–36. https://doi.org/10.2307/1522921

Rosenthal, David M . 2004. "Varieties of Higher-Order Theory." In Higher-Order Theories of Consciousness: An Anthology, edited by Rocco Gennaro , 17–44. Philadelphia and Amsterdam: John Benjamins.

Rosenthal, David M . 2005a. "Sensory Qualities, Consciousness, and Perception." In Consciousness and Mind, edited by David M. Rosenthal , 175–226. Oxford: Clarendon Press. Rosenthal, David M . 2005b. "Thinking That One Thinks." In Consciousness and Mind, edited by David M. Rosenthal , 46–70. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

Rosenthal, David M . 2010. "How to Think about Mental Qualities." Philosophical Issues 20: 368–393. https://doi.org/10.2307/1522921

Rosenthal, David . 2015. "Quality Spaces and Sensory Modalities." In Phenomenal Qualities, edited by Paul Coates , and Sam Coleman , 33–65. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Schlicht, Tobias . 2011. "Nonconceptual Content and the Subjectivity of Consciousness." International Journal of Philosophical Studies 19 (3): 489–518.

https://doi.org/10.1080/09672559.2011.595197

Schlicht, Tobias . 2012. "Phenomenal Consciousness, Attention and Accessibility." Phenomenology and the Cognitive Sciences 11 (3): 309–334. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11097-012-9256-0

Snowdon, Paul . 2010. "On the What-it-is-like-ness of Experience." Southern Journal of Philosophy 48 (1): 8–27. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.2041-6962.2010.01003.x

Tye, Michael . 1995. Ten Problems of Consciousness. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Tye, Michael . 2021. "Qualia." The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy (Fall 2021 Edition), edited by Edward N. Zalta . https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2021/entries/qualia/

Van Gulick, Robert . 2004. "Higher-order Global States (HOGS): An Alternative Higher-Order Model." In Higher-Order Theories of Consciousness: An Anthology, edited by Rocco J. Gennaro , 67–92. Philadelphia and Amsterdam: John Benjamins.

Young, Benjamin D ., Andreas Keller , and David M. Rosenthal . 2014. "Quality Space Theory in Olfaction," Frontiers in Psychology 5: 1. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2014.00001

Blindsight is unconscious perception

Alexander, Iona , and Alan Cowey . 2010. "Edges, Colour and Awareness in Blindsight." Consciousness and Cognition 19 (2): 520–533. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.concog.2010.01.008 Azzopardi, Paul , and Alan Cowey . 1997. "Is Blindsight Like Normal, Near-threshold Vision?" Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America 94 (25): 14190–14194. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.94.25.14190

Azzopardi, Paul , and Alan Cowey . 1998. "Blindsight and Visual Awareness." Consciousness and Cognition 7 (3): 292–311. https://doi.org/10.1006/ccog.1998.0358

Berger, Jacob , and Myrto Mylopoulos . 2019. "On Skepticism about Unconscious Perception." Journal of Consciousness Studies 26 (11-12): 8–32.

Block, Ned . 1995. "On a Confusion about a Function of Consciousness." Behavioral and Brain Sciences 18 (2): 227–247. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0140525X00038188

Boyer, Jennifer L., Stephenie Harrison, and Tony Ro. 2005. "Unconscious Processing of Orientation and Color Without Primary Visual Cortex." Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America 102 (46): 16875–16879.

https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0505332102

Brent, P. J., Christopher Kennard, and Keith H. Ruddock . 1994. "Residual Colour Vision in a Human Hemianope: Spectral Responses and Colour Discrimination." Proceedings: Biological sciences 256 (1347): 219–225. https://doi.org/10.1098/rspb.1994.0073

Brogaard, Berit . 2011a. "Are There Unconscious Perceptual Processes?" Consciousness and Cognition 20 (2): 449–463. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.concog.2010.10.002

Brogaard, Berit . 2011b. "Color Experience in Blindsight?" Philosophical Psychology 24 (6): 767–786. https://doi.org/10.1080/09515089.2011.562641

Brogaard, Berit . 2015. "Type 2 Blindsight and the Nature of Visual Experience." Consciousness and Cognition 32: 92–103. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.concog.2014.09.017

Brogaard, Berit . 2018. Seeing and Saying: The Language of Perception and the Representational View of Experience. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Brogaard, Berit , and Dimitria E. Gatzia (in press). "Dogmatism, Seemings, and Non-deductive Inferential Justification." In Seemings: New Arguments, New Angles, edited by Kevin McCain , Scott Stapleford , and Matthias Setup . New York: Routledge.

Brogaard, Berit , and Thomas A. Sørensen S (in press). "Template Tuning and Graded Consciousness." In Conscious and Unconscious Mentality: Examining Their Nature, Similarities, and Differences, edited by Juraj Hvorecký , Tomáš Marvan , and Michal Polák . London: Routledge.

Chalmers, David J . 2004. "The Representational Character of Experience." In The Future for Philosophy, edited by Brian Leiter , 339–380. New York: Oxford University Press.

Cowey, Alan . 2010. "The Blindsight Saga." Experimental Brain Research 200 (1): 3–24. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00221-009-1914-2

Cowey Alan , and Petra Stoerig . 1993. "Insights into Blindsight?" Current Biology 3 (4): 236–238. https://doi.org/10.1016/0960-9822(93)90343-M

Eriksen, Charles W . 1960. "Discrimination and Learning Without Awareness: A Methodological Survey and Evaluation." Psychological Review 67 (5): 279–300. https://doi.org/10.1037/h0041622

Ffytche, Dominic H ., and Semir Zeki . 2011. "The Primary Visual Cortex, and Feedback to It, Are Not Necessary for Conscious Vision." Brain 134 (1): 247–257.

https://doi.org/10.1093/brain/awq305

Green, David M ., and John A. Swets . 1966. Signal Detection Theory and Psychophysics. New York: Wiley.

Goodale, Melvin A., and A. David Milner . 1992. "Separate Visual Pathways for Perception and Action." Trends in Neurosciences 15 (1): 20–25. https://doi.org/10.1016/0166-2236(92)90344-8 Kentridge, Robert W., Charles A. Heywood, and Lawrence Weiskrantz . 2007. "Colour-contrast Processing in Human Striate Cortex." Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences USA 104 (38): 15129–15131. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0706603104

Macmillan, Neil A ., and Douglas C. Creelman . 2005. Detection Theory: A User's Guide. Lawrence Erlbaum Associates Publishers.

Michel, Matthias . 2023. "How (Not) to Underestimate Unconscious Perception." Mind & Language 38 (2): 413–430. https://doi.org/10.1111/mila.12406

Michel, Matthias , and Hakwan Lau . 2021. "Is Blindsight Possible under Signal Detection Theory? Comment on Phillips (2021)." Psychological Review 128 (3): 585–591. https://doi.org/10.1037/rev0000266

Morland, Antony B., Simon R. Jones, Alison L. Finlay, Emilie Deyzac, E., Sandra Lê, and Samuel Kemp, S. 1999. "Visual Perception of Motion, Luminance and Colour in a Human Hemianope." Brain 122 (Pt 6): 1183–1198. https://doi.org/10.1093/brain/122.6.1183

Mundinano, Inaki-Carril , Juan Chen , Mitchell de Souza , Marc G. Sarossy , Marc F. Joanisse , Melvyn A. Goodale , and James A. Bourne . 2019. "More than Blindsight: Case Report of a Child with Extraordinary Visual Capacity Following Perinatal Bilateral Occipital Lobe Injury." Neuropsychologia 128: 178–186. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuropsychologia.2017.11.017 Norman, Liam J ., Kathleen Akins , Charles A. Heywood , and Robert W. Kentridge . 2014. "Color Constancy for an Unseen Surface." Current Biology 24 (23): 2822–2826. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cub.2014.10.009

Overgaard, Morten , Fehl, Katrin , Kim Mouridsen , Bo Bergholt , and Axel Cleeremans . 2008. "Seeing Without Seeing? Degraded Conscious Vision in a Blindsight Patient." PLoS ONE 3 (8): e3028. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0003028

Phillips, Ian . 2021. "Blindsight is Qualitatively Degraded Conscious Vision." Psychological Review 128 (3): 558–584. https://doi.org/10.1037/rev0000254

Peters, Megan A. K., Robert W. Kentridge, Ian Phillips, and Ned Block. 2017. "Does Unconscious Perception Really Exist? Continuing the ASSC20 Debate." Neuroscience of Consciousness 2017 (1): nix015. https://doi.org/10.1093/nc/nix015

Peters, Megan A. K. , and Hakwan Lau, H . 2015. "Human Observers Have Optimal Introspective Access to Perceptual Processes Even for Visually Masked Stimuli." eLife 4: e09651. https://doi.org/10.7554/eLife.09651

Peters, Megan A. K., Tony Ro, and Hakwan Lau, H. 2016. "Who's Afraid of Response Bias?" Neuroscience of Consciousness 2016 (1): niw001. https://doi.org/10.1093/nc/niw001 Radoeva, Petya D., Sashank Prasad, David H. Brainard, and Geoffrey K. Aguirre . 2008. "Neural Activity Within Area V1 Reflects Unconscious Visual Performance in a Case of Blindsight." Journal of Cognitive Neuroscience 20 (11): 1927–1939.

https://doi.org/10.1162/jocn.2008.20139

Ramsøy, Thomas Z ., and Morten Overgaard . 2004. "Introspection and Subliminal Perception." Phenomenology and the Cognitive Sciences 3: 1–23.

https://doi.org/10.1023/B:PHEN.0000041900.30172.e8

Riddoch, George . 1917. "Dissociation of Visual Perceptions Due to Occipital Injuries, with Especial Reference to Appreciation of Movement." Brain 40 (1): 15–57. https://doi.org/10.1093/brain/40.1.15

Ro, Tony , Alessandro Farnè , Ruth M. Johnson , Van Wedeen , Zili Chu , Zhiyue J. Wang , Jill V. Hunter , Michael S. Beauchamp . 2007. "Feeling Sounds After a Thalamic Lesion." Annals of Neurology 62 (5): 433–441. https://doi.org/10.1002/ana.21219

Sahraie, Arash , Paul B. Hibbard , Ceri T. Trevethan , and Lawrence Weiskrantz . 2010. "Consciousness of the First Order in Blindsight." Proceedings of the National Academy of

Science, USA 107 (49): 21217-21222 https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1015652107 Sahraie, Arash , Lawrence Weiskrantz , John L. Burbur , Andy Simmons , Steven C. R. Williams and Michael J. Brammer . 1997. "Pattern of Neuronal Activity Associated with Conscious and Unconscious Processing of Visual Signals." Proceedings of the National Academy of Science. USA 94 (17): 9406-9411. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.94.17.9406 Sidis, Boris . 1898. The Psychology of Suggestion. New York: Appleton. Skrzypulec, Błażej . 2022. "Contents of Unconscious Color Perception." Review of Philosophy and Psychology 13 (3): 665-681. https://doi.org/10.1007/s13164-021-00552-7 Stoerig, Petra, and Erhardt Barth. 2001. "Low-level Phenomenal Vision Despite Unilateral Destruction of Primary Visual Cortex." Consciousness and Cognition 10 (4): 574–587. https://doi.org/10.1006/ccog.2001.0526 Stoerig, Petra , Aspasia Zontanou , Alan Cowey . 2002. "Aware or Unaware: Assessment of Cortical Blindness in Four Men and a Monkey." Cerebral Cortex 12(6): 565–574. https://doi.org/10.1093/cercor/12.6.565 Stoerig, Petra, and Alan Cowey. 1989. "Color Blindsight. Wavelength Sensitivity in Blindsight." Nature 342 (6252): 916-918. https://doi.org/10.1038/342916a0 Stoerig, Petra , and Alan Cowey . 1991. "Increment-threshold Spectral Sensitivity in Blindsight: Evidence for Colour Opponency." Brain 114 (3): 1487–1512. https://doi.org/10.1093/brain/114.3.1487 Stoerig, Petra , and Alan Cowey . 1992. "Wavelength Discrimination in Blindsight." Brain 115 (Pt 2): 425-444. https://doi.org/10.1093/brain/115.2.425 Weiskrantz, Lawrence, 1986. Blindsight—A Case Study and Implications. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Weiskrantz, Lawrence . 1986. "Blindsight Revisited." Current Opinion in Neurobiology 6 (2): 215-220. https://doi.org/10.1016/s0959-4388(96)80075-4 Weiskrantz, Lawrence, John L. Barbur, Arash Sahraie. 1995. "Parameters Affecting Conscious Versus Unconscious Visual Discrimination with Damage to the Visual Cortex (V1)." Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America 92: 6122-6126. PMID 7597090 DOI: 10.1073/pnas.92.13.6122 Williams. A. C. Jr. 1938. "Perception of Subliminal Visual Stimuli." Journal of Psychology 6 (1): 187–199. https://doi.org/10.1080/00223980.1938.9917596 Zeki, Semir, and Dominic H. Ffytche. 1998. "The Riddock Syndrome: Insights into the Neurobiology of Conscious Vision." Brain 121 (Pt 1): 25-45. https://doi.org/10.1093/brain/121.1.25

Against unconscious volition

Adams, Frederick , and Alfred R. Mele . 1992. "The Intention/Volition Debate." Canadian Journal of Philosophy 22 (3): 323–337. https://doi.org/10.1080/00455091.1992.10717283 Amaya, Santiago . 2013. "Slips." Nous 47 (3): 559–576. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-0068.2011.00838.x

Anscombe, Elizabeth G . 1963/2000. Intention. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press. Armstrong, David M . 1981. "The Nature of Mind." In The Nature of Mind and Other Essays, edited by David Armstrong , 1–15. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.

Bach, Kent . 1978. "A Representational Theory of Action." Philosophical Studies 34 (4): 361–379. https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00364703

Bayne, Tim . 2008. "The Phenomenology of Agency." Philosophy Compass 3 (1): 1–21. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1747-9991.2007.00122.x

Bayne, Tim . 2011. "Libet and the Case for Free Will Scepticism." In Free Will and Modern Science, edited by Richard Swinburne , 25–46. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Beilock, Sian L., and Thomas H. Carr. 2001. "On the Fragility of Skilled Performance: What Governs Choking under Pressure?" Journal of Experimental Psychology: General 130 (4): 701–725. https://doi.org/10.1037/0096-3445.130.4.701

Berger, Jacob , and Myrto Mylopoulos . 2019. "On Scepticism about Unconscious Perception." Journal of Consciousness Studies 26 (11-12): 8–32.

Block, Ned . 1995. "On a Confusion about a Function of Consciousness." Behavioral and Brain Sciences 18 (2): 227–247. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0140525X00038188

Block, Ned . 2016. "The Anna Karenina Principle and Scepticism about Unconscious Perception." Philosophy and Phenomenological Research 93 (2): 452–459. https://doi.org/10.1111/phpr.12258

Brownstein, Michael . 2014. "Rationalizing Flow: Agency in Skilled Unreflective Action." Philosophical Studies 168 (2): 545–568. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11098-013-0143-5 Carruthers, Peter . 2007. "The Illusion of Conscious Will." Synthese 159 (2): 197–213. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11229-007-9204-7

Christensen, Wayne , John Sutton , and Doris McIlwain . 2016. "Cognition in Skilled Action: Meshed Control and the Varieties of Skill Experience." Mind and Language 31 (1): 37–66. https://doi.org/10.1111/mila.12094

Clark, Andy . 2009. "Perception, Action, and Experience: Unraveling the Golden Braid." Neuropsychologia 47 (6): 1460–1468. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuropsychologia.2008.10.020 Crane, Tim . 2013. "Unconscious Belief and Conscious Thought." In Phenomenal Intentionality, edited by Uriah Kriegel , 156–173. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Della Sala , Sergio, Clelia Marchetti , and Hans Spinnler . 1991. "Right-sided Anarchic (alien) Hand: A Longitudinal Study." Neuropsychologia 29 (11): 1113–1127.

https://doi.org/10.1016/0028-3932(91)90081-i

Dennett, Daniel . 1969. Consciousness and Content. Routledge.

Drayson, Zoe . 2014. "The Personal/Subpersonal Distinction." Philosophy Compass 9 (5): 338–346. https://doi.org/10.1111/phc3.12124

Dreyfus, Hubert L . 2013. "The Myth of the Pervasiveness of the Mental." In Mind, Reason, and Being-in-the-World, edited by Joseph K. Schear , 15–38. London: Routledge.

Feinberg, Todd E., Rachel J. Schindler , Natalie G. Flanagan , and Laurence D. Haber . 1992. "Two Alien Hand Syndromes." Neurology 42 (1): 19–24. https://doi.org/10.1212/wnl.42.1.19.

Fleming, Stephen M . 2020. "Awareness as Inference in a Higher-Order State Space."

Neuroscience of Consciousness 2020 (1): niz020. https://doi.org/10.1093/nc/niaa011

Fridland, Ellen . 2014. "They've Lost Control: Reflections on Skill." Synthese 191 (12): 2729–2750. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11229-014-0411-8

Fried, Itzhak , Amiram Katz , Gregory McCarthy , Kimberlee J. Sass , Peter Williamson , Susan S. Spencer , and Dennis D. Spencer . 1991. "Functional Organization of Human Supplementary Motor Cortex Studied by Electrical Stimulation." Journal of Neuroscience 11 (11): 3656–3666. https://doi.org/10.1523/JNEUROSCI.11-11-03656.1991

Fried, Itzhak , Roy Mukamel , and Gabriel Kreiman . 2011. "Internally Generated Preactivation of Single Neurons in Human Medial Frontal Cortex Predicts Volition." Neuron 69 (3): 548–562. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuron.2010.11.045

Gasquoine, Philip G . 1993. "Alien Hand Sign." Journal of Clinical and Experimental Neuropsychology 15 (5): 653–667. https://doi.org/10.1080/01688639308402587

Ginet, Carl . 1990. On Action. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Giovannetti, Tania , Laurel J. Buxbaum , Iftah Biran , and Anjan Chatterjee . 2005. "Reduced Endogenous Control in Alien Hand Syndrome: Evidence from Naturalistic Action."

Neuropsychologia 43 (1): 75–88. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuropsychologia.2004.06.017 Goldberg, Gary , and Karen K. Bloom . 1990. "The Alien Hand Sign. Localization, Lateralization, and Recovery." American Journal of Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation 69 (5): 228–238. https://doi.org/10.1097/00002060-199010000-00002

Goldberg, Gary, Nathaniel H. Mayer, and Joseph U. Toglia. 1981. "Medial Frontal Cortex Infarction and the Alien Hand Sign." Archives of Neurology 38 (11): 683–688. https://doi.org/10.1001/archneur.1981.00510110043004

Haggard, Patrick . 2019. "The Neurocognitive Bases of Human Volition." Annual Review of Psychology 70: 9–28. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-psych-010418-103348

Horgan, Terence , John L. Tienson , and George Graham . 2003. "The Phenomenology of First-Person Agency." In Physicalism and Mental Causation, edited by Sven Walter and Heinz-Dieter Heckmann , 323–340. Exeter, UK: Imprint Academic.

Hornsby, Jennifer . 1980. Actions. London: Routledge.

Hornsby, J . 2000. "Personal and Sub-Personal: A Defense of Dennett's Early Distinction." Philosophical Explorations 3 (1): 6–24. https://doi.org/10.1080/13869790008520978

Kornhuber, Hans H., and Lüder Deecke . 1965. "Hirnpotentialänderungen bei Willkürbewegungen und passiven Bewegungen des Menschen: Bereitschaftspotential und reafferente Potentiale." Pflüger's Archiv für die gesamte Physiologie des Menschen und der Tiere 284: 1–17. https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00412364

Kritikos, Ada , Nora Breen , and Jason B. Mattingley . 2005. "Anarchic Hand Syndrome: Bimanual Coordination and Sensitivity to Irrelevant Information in Unimanual Reaches." Cognitive Brain Research 24 (3): 634–647. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cogbrainres.2005.03.015

Lau, Hakwan . 2022. In Consciousness We Trust. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Libet, Benjamin . 1985. "Unconscious Cerebral Initiative and the Role of Conscious Will in Voluntary Action." Behavioral and Brain Sciences 8 (4): 529–566.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0140525X00044903

Libet, Benjamin, Curtis A. Gleason, Elwood W. Wright, and Dennis K. Pearl. 1983. "Time of Conscious Intention to Act in Relation to Onset of Cerebral Activity (Readiness-Potential). The Unconscious Initiation of a Freely Voluntary Act." Brain 106 (Pt 3): 623–642. https://doi.org/10.1093/brain/106.3.623

Lowe, Edward J . 2008. Personal Agency. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Lycan, William . 2001. "A Simple Argument for a Higher-Order Representation Theory of Consciousness." Analysis 61 (269): 3–4. https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-8284.00261 Maoz, Uri , and Walter Sinnott-Armstrong (eds.). 2021. Free Will: Philosophers and Neuroscientists in Conversation. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Maoz, Uri , Gideon Yaffe , Christof Koch , and Liad Mudrik . 2019. "Neural Precursors of Decisions that Matter—an ERP Study of Deliberate and Arbitrary Choice." eLife 8: e39787. https://doi.org/10.7554/eLife.39787

Marchetti, Clelia , and Sergio Della Sala . 1998. "Disentangling the Alien and Anarchic Hand." Cognitive Neuropsychiatry 3 (3): 191–207. https://doi.org/10.1080/135468098396143

Mele, Alfred R . 1992. Springs of Action. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Mele, Alfred R . 2009. Effective Intentions. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Montero, Barbara . 2010. "Does Bodily Awareness Interfere with Highly Skilled Movement?" Inquiry 53 (2): 105–122. https://doi.org/10.1080/00201741003612138

Mossel, Benjamin . 2005. "Actions, Control and Sensations of Acting." Philosophical Studies 124 (2): 129–180. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11098-004-7816-z

Mylopoulos, Myrto . 2021. "Oops! I Did it Again: The Psychology of Everyday Action Slips." Topics in Cognitive Science 14 (2): 282–294. https://doi.org/10.1111/tops.12552

Mylopolous, Myrto , and Joshua Shepherd . 2020. "The Experience of Agency." In Oxford Handbook of the Philosophy of Consciousness, edited by Uriah Kriegel , 164–187. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

O'Brien, Lucy . 2003. "On Knowing One's Own Actions." In Agency and Self-Awareness, edited by Naomi Eilan and Johannes Roessler , 358–382. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

Pacherie, Elisabeth . 2000. "Levels of Perceptual Content." Philosophical Studies 100 (3): 237–254. https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1018624608680

Pacherie, Elisabeth . 2007. "The Anarchic Hand Syndrome and Utilization Behavior: A Window onto Agentive Self-awareness." Functional Neurology 22 (4): 211–217.

Pacherie, Elisabeth . 2008. "The Phenomenology of Action: A Conceptual Framework." Cognition 107 (1): 179–217. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cognition.2007.09.003

Peacocke, Christopher . 2003. "Awareness, Ownership, and Knowledge." In Agency and Self-Awareness, edited by Naomi Eilan and Johannes Roessler , 94–110. Oxford: Clarendon Press . Phillips, Ian . 2018. "Unconscious Perception Reconsidered." Analytic Philosophy 59 (4): 471–514. https://doi.org/10.1111/phib.12135

Phillips, Ian . 2021. "Scepticism about Unconscious Perception Is the Default Hypothesis." Journal of Consciousness Studies 28 (3-4): 186–205.

Phillips, Ian , and Ned Block . 2016. "Debate on Unconscious Perception." In Current Controversies in Philosophy of Perception, edited by Bence Nanay , 165–192. New York: Routledge.

Reason, James . 1984. "Little Slips and Big Disasters." Interdisciplinary Science Reviews 9 (2): 179–189. https://doi.org/10.1179/isr.1984.9.2.179

Reuter, Kevin , and Justin Sytsma . 2020. "Unfelt Pain." Synthese 197 (4): 1777–1801. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11229-018-1770-3 Rosenthal, David . 2002. "The Timing of Conscious States." Consciousness and Cognition 11 (2): 215–220. https://doi.org/10.1006/ccog.2002.0558

Roskies, Adina L . 2010. "How Does Neuroscience Affect Our Conception of Volition?" Annual Review of Neuroscience 33: 109–130. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-neuro-060909-153151 Roskies, Adina L . 2011. "Why Libet's Studies Don't Pose a Threat to Free Will." In Conscious Will and Responsibility, edited by Walter Sinnott-Armstrong and Lynn Nadel , 11–22. New York: Oxford University Press.

Schurger, Aaron , Pengbo B. Hu , Joanna Pak , and Adina L. Roskies . 2021. "What is the Readiness Potential?" Trends in Cognitive Sciences 25 (7): 558–570. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tics.2021.04.001

Schurger, Aaron , Jacobo D. Sitt , and Stanislas Dehaene . 2012. "An Accumulator Model for Spontaneous Neural Activity Prior to Self-initiated Movements. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America 109 (42): E2904–E2913. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1210467109

Searle, John . 1983. Intentionality. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Shao, Jie , Rongrong Bai , Guangyu Duan , Yujia Guan , Li Cui , and Hui Deng . 2019. "Intermittent Alien Hand Syndrome Caused by Marchiafava-Bignami Disease: A Case Report." Medicine 98 (34): 1–5. https://doi.org/10.1097/MD.00000000016891

Shepherd, Joshua . 2015. "Conscious Control Over Action." Mind and Language 30 (3): 320–344. https://doi.org/10.1111/mila.12082

Shepherd, Joshua , and Myrto Mylopoulos . 2021. "Unconscious Perception and Central Coordinating Agency." Philosophical Studies 178: 3869–3893. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11098-021-01629-w

Siegel, Susanna . 2010. The Contents of Visual Experience. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Sosa, Ernest . 2003. "Privileged Access." In Consciousness: New Philosophical Perspectives, edited by Quentin Smith and Aleksander Jokic , 238–251. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Soteriou, Matthew J . 2009. "Mental Agency, Conscious Thinking, and Phenomenal Character." In Mental Actions, edited by Lucy O'Brien and Matthew J. Soteriou , 231–252. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Sutton, John . 2007. "Batting, Habit and Memory: The Embodied Mind and the Nature of Skill." Sport in Society 10 (5): 763–786. https://doi.org/10.1080/17430430701442462

Toner, John , Barbara G. Montero , and Aidan Moran . 2014. "Considering the Role of Cognitive Control in Expert Performance." Phenomenology and the Cognitive Sciences 14 (4): 1127–1144. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11097-014-9407-6

Trevena, Judy A., and Jeff Miller . 2002. "Cortical Movement Preparation before and after a Conscious Decision to Move." Consciousness and Cognition 11 (2): 162–190. https://doi.org/10.1006/ccog.2002.0548

Vallacher, Robin R ., and Wegner, Daniel M . 1987. "What Do People Think They're Doing? Action Identification and Human Behavior." Psychological Review 94 (1): 3–15. https://doi.org/10.1037/0033-295X.94.1.3

On the alleged misrepresentation problem

Berger, Jacob . 2014. "Consciousness Is Not a Property of States: A Reply to Wilberg." Philosophical Psychology 27 (6): 829–842. https://doi.org/10.1080/09515089.2013.771241 Berger, Jacob . 2017. "How Things Seem to Higher-Order Thought Theorists." Dialogue 56 (3): 503–526. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0012217317000440

Berger, Jacob , and Richard Brown . 2021. "Conceptualizing Consciousness." Philosophical Psychology 34 (5): 637–659. https://doi.org/10.1080/09515089.2021.1914326

Block, Ned . 2011. "The Higher Order Approach to Consciousness Is Defunct." Analysis 71 (3): 419–431. https://doi.org/10.1093/analys/anr037

Brown, Richard . 2015. "The HOROR Theory of Phenomenal Consciousness." Philosophical Studies 172 (7): 1783–1794. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11098-014-0388-7

Byrne, Alex . 1997. "Some like It HOT: Consciousness and Higher-Order Thoughts." Philosophical Studies 86 (2): 103–129. https://doi.org/10.1023/a:1017959107565

Carruthers, Peter , and Rocco Gennaro . 2020. "Higher-Order Theories of Consciousness." In The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy, edited by Edward N. Zalta , Fall 2020. Metaphysics Research Lab, Stanford University.

https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2020/entries/consciousness-higher/

Coleman, Sam . 2015. "Quotational Higher-Order Thought Theory." Philosophical Studies 172 (10): 2705–2733. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11098-015-0441-1

Gottlieb, Joseph . 2018. "Verbal Disputes in the Theory of Consciousness." Ergo: An Open Access Journal of Philosophy 5 (12): 319–347.

http://dx.doi.org/10.3998/ergo.12405314.0005.012

Gottlieb, Joseph . 2020. "On Ambitious Higher-Order Theories of Consciousness." Philosophical Psychology 33 (3): 421–441. https://doi.org/10.1080/09515089.2020.1731445.

Kriegel, Uriah . 2011. Subjective Consciousness: A Self-Representational Theory. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press.

Pereplyotchik, David . 2015. "The Consciousness Paradox: Consciousness, Concepts, and Higher-Order Thoughts." Philosophical Psychology 28 (3): 434–448.

https://doi.org/10.1080/09515089.2013.838817

Rosenthal, David M . 2005a. Consciousness and Mind. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Rosenthal, David M . 2005b. "Introspection and Self-Interpretation." In Consciousness and Mind, edited by David Rosenthal, 103–131. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Rosenthal, David M . 2005c. "Thinking That One Thinks." In Consciousness and Mind, edited by David Rosenthal , 46–70. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Rosenthal, David M . 2005d. "Two Concepts of Consciousness." In Consciousness and Mind, edited by David Rosenthal , 21–45. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Rosenthal, David M . 2011. "Exaggerated Reports: Reply to Block." Analysis 71 (3): 431–437. https://doi.org/10.1093/analys/anr039

Rosenthal, David M . 2012. "Higher-Order Awareness, Misrepresentation and Function." Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 367 (1594): 1424–1438. https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2011.0353

Rosenthal, David M . 2018. "Misrepresentation and Mental Appearance." Trans/Form/Ação 41 (s1): 49–74. https://doi.org/10.1590/0101-3173.2018.v41esp.05.p49

Rosenthal, David M . 2022. "Mental Appearance and Mental Reality." In Qualitative Consciousness: Themes from the Philosophy of David Rosenthal, edited by Josh Weisberg, 243–271. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Ryder, Dan . 2009. "Problems of Representation II: Naturalizing Content." In Routledge Companion to the Philosophy of Psychology, edited by Francisco Garzon and John Symons , 251–279. London: Routledge.

Weisberg, Josh . 2011. "Misrepresenting Consciousness." Philosophical Studies 154 (3): 409–433. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11098-010-9567-3

Wilberg, Jonah . 2010. "Consciousness and False HOTs." Philosophical Psychology 23 (5): 617–638. https://doi.org/10.1080/09515089.2010.514567

Methodological considerations for the study of mental qualities

Aristotle . 2016. De Anima. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

Beauny, Arnaud , Adélaïde de Heering , Santiago Muñoz Moldes , Jean-Rémy Martin , Albert de Beir , and Axel Cleeremans . 2020. "Unconscious Categorization of Submillisecond Complex Images." PLOS ONE 15 (8): 1–23. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0236467

Block, Ned . 1978. "Troubles with Functionalism." In Minnesota Studies in the Philosophy of Science IX, edited by C. Wade Savage , 261–325. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press. Block, Ned . 1995. "On a Confusion about a Function of Consciousness." Behavioral and Brain Sciences 18 (2): 227–247. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0140525X00038188

Block, Ned . 2007. "Consciousness, Accessibility, and the Mesh between Psychology and Neuroscience." Behavioral and Brain Sciences 30 (5-6): 481–499.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0140525X07002786

Block, Ned . 2015. "The Puzzle of Perceptual Precision." In Open MIND 5 (T), edited by Thomas Metzinger , and Jennifer M. Windt , 1–52. Frankfurt am Main: MIND Group.

https://doi.org/10.15502/9783958570726

Chalmers, David J . 1995. "Facing up to the Problem of Consciousness." Journal of Consciousness Studies 2 (3): 200–219.

https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780195311105.003.0001

Cova, Florian , Maxence Gaillard , and François Kammerer . 2021. "Is the Phenomenological Overflow Argument Really Supported by Subjective Reports?" Mind & Language 36 (3): 422–450. https://doi.org/10.1111/mila.12291

Dehaene, Stanislas , and Lionel Naccache . 2001. "Towards a Cognitive Neuroscience of Consciousness: Basic Evidence and a Workspace Framework." Cognition 79 (1-2): 1–37. doi:https://10.1016/s0010-0277(00)00123-2

Fernandez-Duque, Diego , and Ian M. Thornton . 2000. "Change Detection without Awareness: Do Explicit Reports Underestimate the Representation of Change in the Visual System?" Visual Cognition 7 (1-2-3): 323–344. doi:https://10.1080/135062800394838

Frankish, Keith . 2016. "Illusionism as a Theory of Consciousness." Journal of Consciousness Studies 23 (11-12): 11–39.

Goodman, Nelson . 1951. The Structure of Appearance. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Harman, Gilbert . 1990. "The Intrinsic Quality of Experience." Philosophical Perspectives 4: 31–52. https://doi.org/10.2307/2214186

Herzog, Michael H , Leila Drissi-Daoudi , and Adrien Doerig . 2020. "All in Good Time: Long-Lasting Postdictive Effects Reveal Discrete Perception." Trends in Cognitive Sciences 24 (10): 826–837. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tics.2020.07.001

Irvine, Elizabeth . 2014. "Problems and Possibilities for Empirically Informed Philosophy of Mind." In New Waves in Philosophy of Mind, edited by Mark Sprevak , and Jesper Kallestrup , 185–207. London: Palgrave Macmillan.

Jiang, Yi , Ke Zhou , and Sheng He . 2007. "Human Visual Cortex Responds to Invisible Chromatic Flicker." Nature Neuroscience 10 (5): 657–662. https://doi.org/10.1038/nn1879 Kammerer, François . 2022. "How Can You Be So Sure? Illusionism and the Obviousness of Phenomenal Consciousness." Philosophical Studies 179 (9): 2845–2867.

Kentridge, Robert W . 2017. "Sensation and Unconscious Perception." In "Does Unconscious Perception Really Exist? Continuing the ASSC20 Debate." Neuroscience of Consciousness 2017 (1): 3–5. https://doi.org/10.1093/nc/nix015

Knotts, J. D., Brian Odegaard, Hakwan Lau, and David Rosenthal. 2019. "Subjective Inflation: Phenomenology's Get-Rich-Quick Scheme." Current Opinion in Psychology 29: 49–55. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.copsyc.2018.11.006

Laloyaux, Cédric , Arnaud Destrebecqz , and Axel Cleeremans . 2006. "Implicit Change Identification: A Replication of Fernandez-Duque and Thornton (2003)." Journal of Experimental Psychology: Human Perception and Performance 32 (6): 1366–1379.

https://doi.org/10.1037/0096-1523.32.6.1366

Lamme, Victor A . 2006. "Towards a True Neural Stance on Consciousness." Trends in Cognitive Sciences 10 (11): 494–501. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tics.2006.09.001 Levine, Joseph . 2001. Purple Haze: The Puzzle of Consciousness. New York: Oxford University Press.

Michel, Matthias , and Adrien Doerig . 2022. "A New Empirical Challenge for Local Theories of Consciousness." Mind & Language 37 (5): 840–855. https://doi.org/10.1111/mila.12319 Morrison, John . 2015. "Anti-Atomism about Color Representation." Noûs 49 (1): 94–122. https://doi.org/10.1111/nous.12018

Naccache, Lionel . 2018. "Why and How Access Consciousness Can Account for Phenomenal Consciousness." Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 373 (1755): 20170357. https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2017.0357

Nagel, Thomas . 1974. "What Is It Like to Be a Bat?" Philosophical Review 83 (4): 435–450. https://doi.org/10.2307/2183914

Norman, Liam J ., Kathleen Akins , Charles A. Heywood , and Robert W. Kentridge . 2014. "Color Constancy for an Unseen Surface." Current Biology 24 (23): 2822–2826. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cub.2014.10.009

Odegaard, Brian , Alan Lee , Isaac Lee , Addison Sans , Leo Ng , Andrew Haun , Dana Chesney , David Rosenthal , and Francis Fallon . 2022. "Using Saccade-Induced Change Blindness to Refine Existing Theories of Conscious Perception." PowerPoint presentation at ASSC 25, Amsterdam, July 13, part of the Templeton World Charity Foundation project, Replication and Extension of Crucial John Grimes Experiment: Change Detection during Saccades, grant number TWCF0445, www.davidrosenthal.org/Odegaard-et-al-ASSC-2022-CDDS.pdf

Peters, Megan A. K. 2017. "Practical and Theoretical Considerations in Seeking the Neural Correlates of Consciousness." In "Does Unconscious Perception Really Exist? Continuing the ASSC20 Debate." Neuroscience of Consciousness 2017 (1): 1–3.

https://doi.org/10.1093/nc/nix015

Peters, Megan A. K., and Hakwan Lau . 2015. "Human Observers Have Optimal Introspective Access to Perceptual Processes Even for Visually Masked Stimuli." eLife 4: e09651. https://doi.org/10.7554/eLife.09651

Phillips, Ian . 2018. "Unconscious Perception Reconsidered." Analytic Philosophy 59 (4): 471–514. https://doi.org/10.1111/phib.12135

Quine, W. V. 1951. "Two Dogmas of Empiricism." Philosophical Review 60 (1): 20–43. Raffman, Diana . 2011. "Vagueness and Observationality." In Vagueness: A Guide, edited by Giuseppina Ronzitti , 107–122. Dordrecht: Springer.

Rosenthal, David . 1986. "Intentionality." Midwest Studies in Philosophy 10 (1): 151–184. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1475-4975.1987.tb00538.x

Rosenthal, David . 1999. "Sensory Quality and the Relocation Story." Philosophical Topics 26 (1/2): 321–350. https://doi.org/10.5840/philtopics1999261/227

Rosenthal, David . 2005. Consciousness and Mind. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

Rosenthal, David . 2008. "Consciousness and Its Function." Neuropsychologia 46 (3): 829–840. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuropsychologia.2007.11.012

Rosenthal, David . 2010. "How to Think about Mental Qualities." Philosophical Issues 20 (1): 368–393. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1533-6077.2010.00190.x

Rosenthal, David . 2012. "Higher-order Awareness, Misrepresentation, and Function." Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 367 (1594): 1424–1438. https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2011.0353

Rosenthal, David . 2016. "Quality Spaces, Relocation, and Grain." In Sellars and His Legacy, edited by James R. O'Shea , 149–185. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Rosenthal, David . 2019. "Consciousness and Confidence." Neuropsychologia 128: 255–265. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuropsychologia.2018.01.018

Rosenthal, David . 2022. "Mental Appearance and Mental Reality." In Qualitative Consciousness: Themes from the Philosophy of David Rosenthal, edited by Josh Weisberg , 243–271. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Sperling, George . 1960. "The Information Available in Brief Visual Presentations." Psychological Monographs: General and Applied 74 (11): 1–29. https://doi.org/10.1037/h0093759

Can structuralist theories be general theories of consciousness?

Alkire, Michael T ., Anthony G. Hudetz , and Giulio Tononi . 2008. "Consciousness and Anesthesia." Science 322 (5903): 876–880. https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1149213 Block, Ned . 1996. "Mental Paint and Mental Latex." Philosophical Issues 7: 19–49. https://doi.org/10.2307/1522889

Brandon, Robert N . 1997. "Does Biology Have Laws? The Experimental Evidence." Philosophy of Science 64 (S4): S444–S457. https://doi.org/10.1086/392621

Brouwer, Gijs Joost , and David J. Heeger . 2009. "Decoding and Reconstructing Color from Responses in Human Visual Cortex." Journal of Neuroscience 29 (44): 13992–14003. https://doi.org/10.1523/JNEUROSCI.3577-09.2009

Chalmers, David. J. 1995. "Absent Qualia, Fading Qualia, Dancing Qualia." In Conscious Experience, edited by Thomas Metzinger , 309–328. Paderborn: Ferdinand Schöningh. Chisholm, Roderick . 1942. "The Problem of the Speckled Hen." Mind 51 (204): 368–373. Churchland, Patricia S ., and T. J. Sejnowski . 1992. The Computational Brain. Computational Neuroscience. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press. Churchland, Paul M . 2005. "Chimerical Colors: Some Phenomenological Predictions from Cognitive Neuroscience." Philosophical Psychology 18 (5): 527–560. https://doi.org/10.1080/09515080500264115

Doerig, Adrien , Aaron Schurger , Kathryn Hess , and Michael H. Herzog . 2019. "The Unfolding Argument: Why IIT and Other Causal Structure Theories Cannot Explain Consciousness." Consciousness and Cognition 72: 49–59. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.concog.2019.04.002 Engel, Andreas K ., and Wolf Singer . 2001. "Temporal Binding and the Neural Correlates of Sensory Awareness." Trends in Cognitive Sciences 5 (1): 16–25. https://doi.org/10.1016/S1364-6613(00)01568-0

Fink, Sascha Benjamin . 2016. "A Deeper Look at the 'Neural Correlate of Consciousness'." Frontiers in Psychology 7: 1044. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2016.01044

Fink, Sascha Benjamin . 2017. "Why Care Beyond the Square? Classical and Extended Shapes of Oppositions in Their Application to 'Introspective Disputes'." In The Square of Opposition: A Cornerstone of Thought. Studies in Universal Logic, edited by Jean-Yves Béziau and Gianfranco Basti , 325–337. Basel: Birkhäuser. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-45062-9_20 Fink, Sascha Benjamin . 2018. "Introspective Disputes Deflated: The Case for Phenomenal Variation." Philosophical Studies 175 (12): 3165–3194. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11098-017-1000-8

Fink, Sascha Benjamin . 2020. "Look Who's Talking! Varieties of Ego-dissolution Without Paradox." Philosophy and the Mind Sciences 1(I): 1–36.

https://doi.org/10.33735/phimisci.2020.I.40

Fink, Sascha Benjamin , Lukas Kob , and Holger Lyre . 2021. "A Structural Constraint on Neural Correlates of Consciousness." Philosophy and the Mind Sciences 2: 1–23. https://doi.org/10.33735/phimisci.2021.79

Gamma, Alex , and Thomas Metzinger . 2021. "The Minimal Phenomenal Experience

Questionnaire (MPE-92M): Towards a Phenomenological Profile of "Pure Awareness" Experiences in Meditators." PLOS ONE 16 (7): e0253694.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0253694

Grush, Rick . 2006. "How to, and How Not to, Bridge Computational Cognitive Neuroscience and Husserlian Phenomenology of Time Consciousness." Synthese 153 (3): 417–450. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11229-006-9100-6

Haynes, John-Dylan . 2009. "Decoding Visual Consciousness from Human Brain Signals." Trends in Cognitive Sciences 13 (5): 194–202. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tics.2009.02.004 Jazayeri, Mehrdad and Arash Afraz . (2017). "Navigating the Neural Space in Search of the Neural Code." Neuron 93: 1003–1014.

Kriegeskorte, Nikolaus , and Jörn Diedrichsen . 2019. "Peeling the Onion of Brain Representations." Annual Review of Neuroscience 42: 407–432.

https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-neuro-080317-061906

Ladyman, James , Don Ross , David Spurrett , and John Collier . 2007. Every Thing Must Go: Metaphysics Naturalized. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Lau, Hakwan , Matthias Michel , Joseph E. LeDoux , and Stephen M. Fleming . 2022. "The Mnemonic Basis of Subjective Experience." Nature Reviews Psychology 1: 479–488. https://doi.org/10.1038/s44159-022-00068-6

Lyre, Holger . 2022. "Neurophenomenal Structuralism. A Philosophical Agenda for a Structuralist Neuroscience of Consciousness." Neuroscience of Consciousness 2022 (1): niac012. https://doi.org/10.1093/nc/niac012

Malach, Rafael . 2021. "Local Neuronal Relational Structures Underlying the Contents of Human Conscious Experience." Neuroscience of Consciousness 2021 (2): 1–13. https://doi.org/10.1093/nc/niab028

Marvan, Tomáš , and Michal Polák . 2020. "Generality and Content-specificity in the Study of the Neural Correlates of Perceptual Consciousness." Philosophy and the Mind Sciences 1 (II): 1–17. https://doi.org/10.33735/phimisci.2020.II.61

Millière, Raphael . 2020. "The Varieties of Selflessness." Philosophy and the Mind Sciences 1 (I): 1–41. https://doi.org/10.33735/phimisci.2020.I.48

Nisbett, Richard. E., and Tomothy D. Wilson . 1977. "Telling More Than We Can Know: Verbal Reports on Mental Processes." Psychological Review 84 (3): 231–259. https://doi.org/10.1037/0033-295X.84.3.231 Pauen, Michael , and John-Dylan Haynes . 2021. "Measuring the Mental." Consciousness and Cognition 90: 103106. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.concog.2021.103106

Perry, John . 1979. "The Problem of the Essential Indexical." Noûs 13 (1): 3–21. https://doi.org/10.1075/aicr.30.10per

Preller, Katrin. H., Joshua B. Burt, Jie Lisa Ji, Charles H. Schleifer, Brendan D. Adkinson, Philipp Stämpfli, Erich Seifritz, Grega Repovs, John H. Krystal, John D. Murray, Franz X. Vollenweider, and Alan Anticevic. 2018. "Changes in Global and Thalamic Brain Connectivity in LSD-induced Altered States of Consciousness are Attributable to the 5-HT2A Receptor." eLife 7: e35082. https://doi.org/10.7554/eLife.35082

Quine, Willard Van Orman . 1976. "Grades of Discriminability." Journal of Philosophy 73 (5): 113–116. https://doi.org/10.2307/2025739

Rosenthal, David . 2010. "How to Think about Mental Qualities." Philosophical Issues 20: 368–393. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1533-6077.2010.00190.x

Rosenthal, David . 2015. "Quality Spaces and Sensory Modalities." In Quality Spaces and Sensory Modalities. Phenomenal Qualities: Sense, Perception, and Consciousness, edited by Paul Coates and Sam Coleman , 33–65. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Rosenthal, David . 2022. "Mental Appearance and Mental Reality." In Qualitative Consciousness: Themes from the Philosophy of David Rosenthal, edited by Josh Weisberg , 243–271. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Sartre, Jean-Paul . 1960. The Transcendence of the Ego. New York: Hill & Wang. Schwitzgebel, Eric . 2008. "The Unreliability of Naive Introspection." Philosophical Review 117 (2): 245–273. https://doi.org/10.1215/00318108-2007-037

Strathern, M . 1997. "Improving Ratings: Audit in the British University System." European Review 5 (3): 305–321. https://doi.org/10.1002/(SICI)1234-981X(199707)5:33.0.CO;2-4 Tononi, Giulio , and Christof Koch . 2016. "Consciousness: Here, There and Everywhere?" Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B 370 (1668): 20140167. https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2014.0167

Tsuchiya, Naotsugu, Thomas Andrillon, and Andrew Haun. 2020. "A Reply to 'the Unfolding Argument': Beyond Functionalism/Behaviorism and Towards a Science of Causal Structure Theories of Consciousness." Consciousness and Cognition 79: 102877. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.concog.2020.102877

Tsuchiya, Naotsugu , and Hayato Saigo . 2021. "A Relational Approach to Consciousness: Categories of Level and Contents of Consciousness." Neuroscience of Consciousness 2021 (2): niab034. https://doi.org/10.1093/nc/niab034

Williamson, Timothy . 2013. Identity and Discrimination. Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley. Worrall, John . 1989. "Structural Realism: The Best of Both Worlds?" Dialectica 43 (1-2): 99–124. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1746-8361.1989.tb00933.x

The old and new criterion problems

Baars, Bernard J . 1986. "What Is a Theory of Consciousness a Theory of?: The Search for Criterial Constraints on Theory." Imagination, Cognition and Personality 6 (1): 3–23. https://doi.org/10.2190/WJER-XABV-QM4W-KD6V

Baars, Bernard J . 1988. A Cognitive Theory of Consciousness. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Barthelme, Simon , and Pascal Mamassian . 2009. "Evaluation of Objective Uncertainty in the Visual System." PLOS Computational Biology 5 (9): 1–8.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pcbi.1000504

Benwell, Christopher S. Y., Chiara F. Tagliabue , Domenica Veniero , Roberto Cecere , Silvia Savazzi , and Gregor Thut . 2017. "Prestimulus EEG Power Predicts Conscious Awareness But Not Objective Visual Performance." ENeuro 4 (6): 1–17. https://doi.org/10.1523/ENEURO.0182-17.2017

Breitmeyer, Bruno G . 2015. "Psychophysical 'Blinding' Methods Reveal a Functional Hierarchy of Unconscious Visual Processing." Consciousness and Cognition 35: 234–250. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.concog.2015.01.012

Blackwell, H. Richard . 1952. "Studies of Psychophysical Methods for Measuring Visual Thresholds." Journal of the Optical Society of America 42 (9): 606–616. https://doi.org/10.1364/josa.42.000606

Block, Ned . 1995. "On a Confusion about a Function of Consciousness." Behavioral and Brain Sciences 18 (2): 227–247. doi:https://10.1017/S0140525X00038188

Block, Ned . 2007. "Consciousness, Accessibility, and the Mesh Between Psychology and Neuroscience." Behavioral and Brain Sciences 30 (5–6): 481–499.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0140525X07002786

Carrasco, Marisa , Stuart Fuller , and Sam Ling . 2008. "Transient Attention Does Increase Perceived Contrast of Suprathreshold Stimuli: A Reply to Prinzmetal, Long, and Leonhardt." Perception and Psychophysics 70 (7): 1151–1164. https://doi.org/10.3758/pp.70.7.1151

Carrasco, Marisa , Sam Ling , and Sarah Read . 2004. "Attention Alters Appearance." Nature & Neuroscience 7 (3): 308–313. https://doi.org/10.1038/nn1194

Chaumon, Maximilien , and Niko A. Busch . 2014. "Prestimulus Neural Oscillations Inhibit Visual Perception Via Modulation of Response Gain." Journal of Cognitive Neuroscience 26 (11): 2514–2529. https://doi.org/10.1162/jocn_a_00653

Cheesman, Jim , and Philip M. Merikle . 1984. "Priming With and Without Awareness." Perception & Psychophysics 36 (4): 387–395. https://doi.org/10.3758/BF03202793 Cheesman, Jim , and Philip M. Merikle . 1986. "Distinguishing Conscious from Unconscious Perceptual Processes." Canadian Journal of Psychology 40 (4): 343–367. https://doi.org/10.1037/h0080103

Clarke, Frank R ., Theodore G. Birdsall , and Wilson P. Tanner . 1959. "Two Types of ROC Curves and Definitions of Parameters." The Journal of the Acoustical Society of America 31 (5): 629–630. https://doi.org/10.1121/1.1907764

Curry, Renwick E., David C. Nagel, and Eliezer G. Gai. 1977. "Decision Behavior with Changing Signal Strength." Journal of Mathematical Psychology 15 (1): 46–69. https://doi.org/10.1016/0022-2496(77)90040-2

de Gardelle, Vincent , and Pascal Mamassian . 2014. "Does Confidence Use a Common Currency Across Two Visual Tasks?" Psychological Science 25 (6): 1286–1288. https://doi.org/10.1177/0956797614528956

Denison, Rachel , William T. Adler , Marisa Carrasco , and Wei Ji Ma . 2018. "Humans incorporate attention-dependent uncertainty into perceptual decisions and confidence." Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America 115 (43): 11090–11095. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1717720115

Dennett, Daniel C . 1988. "Quining Qualia." In Consciousness in Contemporary Science, edited by Anthony J. Marcel, and Eduard Bisiach, 42–77. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Ergenoglu, Tolgay , Tamer Demiralp , Zubeyir Bayraktaroglu , Mehmet Ergen , Huseyin Beydagi , and Yagis Uresin . 2004. "Alpha Rhythm of the EEG Modulates Visual Detection Performance in Humans." Cognitive Brain Research 20 (3): 376–383.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cogbrainres.2004.03.009

Eriksen, Charles W . 1960. "Discrimination and Learning without Awareness: A Methodological Survey and Evaluation." Psychological Review 67 (5): 279–300.

https://doi.org/10.1037/h0041622

Fechner, Gustav T . 1860/1966. Elements of Psychophysics. New York: Holt.

Fischer, Jason , and David Whitney . 2014. "Serial Dependence in Visual Perception." Nature Neuroscience 17 (5): 738–743. https://doi.org/10.1038/nn.3689

Fleming, Stephen M ., and Hakwan C. Lau . 2014. "How to Measure Metacognition." Frontiers in Human Neuroscience 8: 443. https://doi.org/10.3389/fnhum.2014.00443

Frankish, Keith . 2021. "Panpsychism and the Depsychologization of Consciousness."

Aristotelian Society Supplementary Volume 95 (1): 51–70.

https://doi.org/10.1093/arisup/akab012

Fritsche, Matthias , Pim Mostert , and Floris P. de Lange . 2017. "Opposite Effects of Recent History on Perception and Decision." Current Biology 27 (4): 590–595.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cub.2017.01.006

Galvin, Susan J., John V. Podd, Vit Drga, and John Whitmore. 2003. "Type 2 Tasks in the Theory of Signal Detectability: Discrimination Between Correct and Incorrect Decisions." Psychonomic Bulletin & Review 10 (4): 843–876. https://doi.org/10.3758/bf03196546

García-Pérez, Miguel. A. , and Rocío Alcalá-Quintana . 2013. "Shifts of the Psychometric Function: Distinguishing Bias from Perceptual Effects." Quarterly Journal of Experimental Psychology 66 (2): 319–337. https://doi.org/10.1080/17470218.2012.708761

Gallagher, Regan M., Thomas Suddendorf, and Derek H. Arnold. 2019. "Confidence as a Diagnostic Tool for Perceptual Aftereffects." Scientific Reports 9 (7124): 1–12. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-019-43170-1

Gallagher, Regan M ., Thomas Suddendorf , and Derek H. Arnold . 2021. "The Implied Motion Aftereffect Changes Decisions, but Not Confidence." Attention, Perception, and Psychophysics 83 (8): 3047–3055. https://doi.org/10.3758/s13414-021-02331-z

Gold, Joshua I., and Long Ding . 2013. "How Mechanisms of Perceptual Decision-Making Affect the Psychometric Function." Progress in Neurobiology 103: 98–114.

https://doi.org/doi:10.1016/j.pneurobio.2012.05.008 Goldiamond, Israel . 1958. "Indicators Of Perception: I. Subliminal Perception, Subception,

Unconscious Perception: An Analysis in Terms of Psychophysical Indicator Methodology." Psychological Bulletin 55 (6): 373–411. https://doi.org/10.1037/h0046992

Gorea, Andrei , and Dov Sagi . 2000. "Failure to handle more than one internal representation in visual detection tasks." Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America 97 (22): 12380–12384. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.97.22.12380

Gorea, Andrei , and Dov Sagi . 2002. "Natural extinction: A Criterion Shift Phenomenon." Visual Cognition 9 (8): 913–936. https://doi.org/10.1080/13506280143000638

Green, David M ., and John A. Swets . 1966. Signal Detection Theory and Psychophysics. New York: Wiley.

Holender, Daniel . 1986. "Semantic Activation Without Conscious Identification in Dichotic Listening, Parafoveal Vision, and Visual Masking: A Survey and Appraisal." Behavioral and Brain Sciences 9: 1–23. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0140525X00021269

Iemi, Luca , and Nico A. Busch . 2018. "Moment-To-Moment Fluctuations In Neuronal Excitability Bias Subjective Perception Rather Than Decision-Making." ENeuro 5 (3): ENEURO.0430-17.2018. https://doi.org/10.1523/ENEURO.0430-17.2018

Iemi, Luca, Maximilien Chaumon, Sébastien Crouzet, and Niko A. Busch. 2017. "Spontaneous Neural Oscillations Bias Perception by Modulating Baseline Excitability." Journal of Neuroscience 37 (4): 807–819. https://doi.org/10.1523/JNEUROSCI.1432-16.2016 Irvine, Elizabeth. 2012a. Consciousness as a Scientific Concept. Springer.

Irvine, Elizabeth . 2012b. "Old Problems with New Measures in the Science of Consciousness." British Journal for the Philosophy of Science 63 (3): 627–648. https://doi.org/10.2307/23253415 Irvine, Elizabeth . 2019. "Developing Dark Pessimism Towards the Justificatory Role of Introspective Reports." Erkenntnis 86: 1319–1344. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10670-019-00156-9 Jin, Miaomiao , and Lindsey L. Glickfeld . 2019. "Contribution of Sensory Encoding to Measured Bias." Journal of Neuroscience 39 (26): 5115–5127. https://doi.org/10.1523/JNEUROSCI.0076-19.2019

Kanai, Ryota , and Frans A. J. Verstraten . 2005. "Perceptual Manifestations of Fast Neural Plasticity: Motion Priming, Rapid Motion Aftereffect and Perceptual Sensitization." Vision research 45 (25–26): 3109–3116. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.visres.2005.05.014

Kim, Chay-Youn , and Randolph Blake . 2005. "Psychophysical Magic: Rendering the Visible 'Invisible'." Trends in Cognitive Sciences 9 (8): 381–388.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tics.2005.06.012

Knotts, Jeffrey D ., Hakwan Lau, and Megan A. K. Peters . 2018. "Continuous Flash Suppression and Monocular Pattern Masking Impact Subjective Awareness Similarly." Attention, Perception, & Psychophysics 80 (8): 1974–1987. https://doi.org/10.3758/s13414-018-1578-8

LeDoux, Joseph E ., Matthias Michel , and Hakwan Lau . 2020. "A Little History Goes a Long Way Toward Understanding Why We Study Consciousness the Way We Do Today." PNAS 117: 6976–6984. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1921623117

Limbach, Katharina , and Paul M. Corballis . 2016. "Prestimulus Alpha Power Influences Response Criterion in a Detection Task." Psychophysiology 53 (8): 1154–1164. https://doi.org/10.1111/psyp.12666

Linares, Daniel , David Aguilar-Lleyda , and Joan López-Moliner . 2019. "Decoupling Sensory from Decisional Choice Biases in Perceptual Decision Making." ELife 8 (e43994): 1–22. https://doi.org/10.7554/eLife.43994 Macmillan, Neil A . 1986. "The Psychophysics of Subliminal Perception." Behavioral and Brain Sciences 9: 38–39. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0140525X00021427

Macmillan, Neil A., and Douglas C. Creelman . 2005. Detection Theory: A User's Guide. New York: Psychology Press.

Maniscalco, Brian , and Hakwan Lau . 2012. "A Signal Detection Theoretic Approach for Estimating Metacognitive Sensitivity from Confidence Ratings. Consciousness and Cognition 21 (1): 422–430. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.concog.2011.09.021

Mather, George , and Rebecca J. Sharman . 2015. "Decision-Level Adaptation In Motion Perception." Royal Society Open Science 2 (12): 150418. https://doi.org/10.1098/rsos.150418 Merikle, Philip M . 1982. "Unconscious Perception Revisited." Perception & Psychophysics 31 (3): 298–301. https://doi.org/10.3758/BF03202538

Merikle, Philip M . 1983. "Subliminal Perception Reaffirmed." Canadian Journal of Psychology 37 (2): 324–326. https://doi.org/10.1037/h0080891

Merikle, Philip M . 1984. "Toward a Definition of Awareness." Bulletin of the Psychonomic Society 22 (5): 449–450. https://doi.org/10.3758/BF03333874

Meyerhoff, Hauke S., and Brian J. Scholl . 2018. "Auditory-induced bouncing is a perceptual (rather than a cognitive) phenomenon: Evidence from illusory crescents." Cognition 170: 88–94. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cognition.2017.08.007

Michel, Matthias . 2022a. "How (Not) to Underestimate Unconscious Perception." Mind & Language, 1–18. https://doi.org/10.1111/mila.12406

Michel, Matthias . 2022b. "Confidence in Consciousness Research." WIREs Cognitive Science, e1628. https://doi.org/10.1002/wcs.1628

Milner, David A. D., Monika Brechmann, and Luigi Pagliarini . 1992. "To Halve and to Halve Not: An Analysis of Line Bisection Judgements in Normal Subjects." Neuropsychologia 30 (6): 515–526. https://doi.org/10.1016/0028-3932(92)90055-q

Morgan, Michael , Barbara Dillenburger , Sabine Raphael , and Joshua A. Solomon . 2012. "Observers Can Voluntarily Shift Their Psychometric Functions Without Losing Sensitivity." Attention, Perception & Psychophysics 74 (1): 185–193. https://doi.org/10.3758/s13414-011-0222-7

Nelson, Thomas O . 1984. "A Comparison of Current Measures of the Accuracy of Feeling-of-Knowing Predictions." Psychological Bulletin 95 (1): 109–133. https://doi.org/10.1037/0033-2909.95.1.109

Peters, Megan A. K., Jeremy Fesi, Namema Amendi, Jeffrey D. Knotts, Hakwan Lau, and Tony Ro. 2017b. "Transcranial Magnetic Stimulation to Visual Cortex Induces Suboptimal Introspection." Cortex 93: 119–132. 10.1016/j.cortex.2017.05.017

Peters, Megan A. K., Robert W. Kentridge, Ian Phillips, and Ned Block. 2017a. "Does Unconscious Perception Really Exist? Continuing The ASSC20 Debate." Neuroscience of Consciousness 2017 (1): 1–11. https://doi.org/10.1093/nc/nix015

Peters, Megan A. K. , and Hakwan Lau . 2015. "Human Observers Have Optimal Introspective Access to Perceptual Processes Even for Visually Masked Stimuli." ELife 4 (October): 1–30. https://doi.org/10.7554/eLife.09651

Peters, Megan A. K. , Tony Ro, and Hakwan Lau . 2016. "Who's Afraid of Response Bias?" Neuroscience of Consciousness 2016 (1): 1–16. https://doi.org/10.1093/nc/niw001

Phillips, Ian . 2016. "Consciousness and Criterion: On Block's Case for Unconscious Seeing." Philosophy and Phenomenological Research 93 (2): 419–451.

https://doi.org/10.1111/phpr.12224

Phillips, Ian . 2018. "Unconscious Perception Reconsidered." Analytic Philosophy 59 (4): 471–514. https://doi.org/10.1111/phib.12135

Polat, Uri , and Dov Sagi . 2007. "The Relationship Between the Subjective and Objective Aspects of Visual Filling-In." Vision Research 47 (18): 2473–2481.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.visres.2007.06.007

Prinzmetal, William , Virginia Long , and James Leonhardt . 2008. "Involuntary attention and brightness contrast." Perception & Psychophysics 70 (7): 1139–1150.

https://doi.org/10.3758/PP.70.7.1139

Rahnev, Dobromir . 2021. "A Robust Confidence–accuracy Dissociation via Criterion Attraction." Neuroscience of Consciousness 1 (2021): niab039. https://doi.org/10.1093/nc/niab039 Rahnev, Dobromir , Brian Maniscalco , Tashina Graves , Elliot Huang , Floris P. de Lange , and Hakwan Lau . 2011. "Attention Induces Conservative Subjective Biases in Visual Perception." Nature Neuroscience 14 (12): 1513–1515. https://doi.org/10.1038/nn.2948 Rajananda, Sivananda , Jeanette Zhu , and Megan A. K. Peters . 2018. "Normal Observers Show No Evidence for Blindsight in Facial Emotion Perception." Neuroscience of Consciousness 2020 (1): niaa023. https://doi.org/10.1093/nc/niaa023

Reingold, Eyal M ., and Philip M. Merikle . 1988. "Using Direct and Indirect Measures to Study Perception without Awareness." Perception and Psychophysics 44 (6): 563–575. https://doi.org/10.3758/BF03207490

Reingold, Eyal M ., and Philip M. Merikle . 1990. "On the Inter-Relatedness of Theory and Measurement in the Study of Unconscious Processes." Mind & Language 5 (1): 9–28. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-0017.1990.tb00150.x

Sánchez-Fuenzalida, Gaal Nicolás , Van Simon , Stephen M. Fleming , and Julia M. Haaf . 2022. "Predictions and Rewards Affect Decision Making but Not Subjective Experience." https://doi.org/10.31234/osf.io/5v8dh

Samaha, Jason , Luca lemi , and Bradley R. Postle . 2017. "Prestimulus Alpha-Band Power Biases Visual Discrimination Confidence, but Not Accuracy." Consciousness & Cognition 54 (2017): 47–55. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.concog.2017.02.005

Sekuler, Robert , and Albert Erlebacher . 1971. "The Invalidity of 'Invalid Results from the Method of Constant Stimuli': A Common Artifact in the Methods of Psychophysics." Perception & Psychophysics 9 (3): 309–311. https://doi.org/10.3758/BF03212655

Sekuler, Robert , Allison B. Sekuler , and Renee Lau . 1997. "Sound Alters Visual Motion Perception." Nature 385 (6614): 308. https://doi.org/10.1038/385308a0

Shams, Ladan . 2002. "Integration in the Brain-The Subconscious Alteration of Visual Perception by Cross-Modal Integration." Science and Consciousness Review 1: 1–4.

Shams, Ladan , Yukiyasu Kamitani , and Shinsuke Shimojo . 2000. "Illusions. What You See Is What You Hear." Nature 408 (6814): 788. https://doi.org/10.1038/35048669

Snodgrass, Michael , Edward Bernat , and Howard Shevrin . 2004. "Unconscious Perception: A Model-Based Approach to Method and Evidence." Perception and Psychophysics 66 (5): 846–867. https://doi.org/10.3758/bf03194978

St. John-Saaltink, Elexa , Peter Kok , Hakwan C. Lau , and Floris P. de Lange . 2016. "Serial Dependence in Perceptual Decisions Is Reflected in Activity Patterns in Primary Visual Cortex." Journal of Neuroscience 36 (23): 6186–6192. https://doi.org/10.1523/JNEUROSCI.4390-15.2016

Swets, John A . 1973. "The Relative Operating Characteristic In Psychology." Science 182 (4116): 990–1000. https://doi.org/10.1126/science.182.4116.990

Thurlow, Willard R ., and Charles E. Jack . 1973. "Certain Determinants of the 'Ventriloquism Effect'." Perceptual and Motor Skills 36 (3): 1171–1184.

https://doi.org/10.2466/pms.1973.36.3c.1171

Winawer, Jonathan , Alexander C. Huk , and Lera Boroditsky . 2008. "A Motion Aftereffect From Still Photographs Depicting Motion." Psychological Science 19 (3): 276–283. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9280.2008.02080.x

Winawer, Jonathan , Alexander C. Huk , and Lera Boroditsky . 2010. "A Motion Aftereffect from Visual Imagery of Motion." Cognition 114 (2): 276–284.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cognition.2009.09.010

Witt, Jessica K., J. Eric T. Taylor , Mila Sugovic , and John T. Wixted . 2015. "Signal Detection Measures Cannot Distinguish Perceptual Biases from Response Biases." Perception 44 (3): 289–300. https://doi.org/10.1068/p7908

Witthoft, Nathan , Long Sha , Jonathan Winawer , and Roozbeh Kiani . 2018. "Sensory and decision-making processes underlying perceptual adaptation." Journal of Vision 18 (8): 1–20. https://doi.org/10.1167/18.8.10

Yarrow, Kielan , Nina Jahn , Szonya Durant , and Derek H. Arnold . 2011. "Shifts of Criteria or Neural Timing? The Assumptions Underlying Timing Perception Studies." Consciousness and Cognition 20 (4): 1518–1531. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.concog.2011.07.003

Yeshurun, Yaffa , Maria Carrasco , and Laurence T. Maloney . 2008. "Bias and Sensitivity in Two-Interval Forced Choice Procedures: Tests of The Difference Model." Vision Research 48 (17): 1837–1851. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.visres.2008.05.008

The brain-based argument for unconscious sensory qualities

Bachmann, Talis . 2011. "Attention as a Process of Selection, Perception as a Process of Representation, and Phenomenal Experience as the Resulting Process of Perception Being Modulated by a Dedicated Consciousness Mechanism." Frontiers in Psychology 2: 397. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2011.00387

Beck, Diane M ., Geraint Rees , Chris D. Frith , and Nilli Lavie . 2001. "Neural Correlates of Change Detection and Change Blindness." Nature Neuroscience 4 (6): 645–650. https://doi.org/10.1038/88477

Bisley, James W ., Daniel Zaksas , and Tatiana Pasternak . 2001. "Microstimulation of Cortical Area MT Affects Performance on a Visual Working Memory Task." Journal of Neurophysiology 85 (1): 187–196. https://doi.org/10.1152/jn.2001.85.1.187

Boly, Melanie , Marcello Massimini , Naotsugu Tsuchiya , Bradley R. Postle , Christof Koch , and Giulio Tononi . 2017. "Are the Neural Correlates of Consciousness in the Front or in the Back of the Cerebral Cortex? Clinical and Neuroimaging Evidence." The Journal of

Neuroscience 37 (40): 9603–9613. https://doi.org/10.1523/JNEUROSCI.3218-16.2017 Celebrini, Simona , and William T. Newsome . 1995. "Microstimulation of Extrastriate Area MST Influences Performance on a Direction Discrimination Task." Journal of Neurophysiology 73 (2): 437–448. https://doi.org/10.1152/jn.1995.73.2.437

Chalmers, David J . 2000. "What Is a Neural Correlate of Consciousness?" In Neural Correlates of Consciousness: Empirical and Conceptual Questions, edited by Thomas Metzinger , 17–39. Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press.

Cohen, Laurent , Stanislas Dehaene , Lionel Naccache , Stéphane Lehéricy , Ghislaine Dehaene-Lambertz , Marie-Anne Hénaff , and François Michel . 2000. "The Visual Word Form Area: Spatial and Temporal Characterization of an Initial Stage of Reading in Normal Subjects and Posterior Split-Brain Patients." Brain 123 (2): 291–307.

https://doi.org/10.1093/brain/123.2.291

Coleman, Sam . 2019. "Painfulness, Suffering, and Consciousness". In Philosophy of Suffering, edited by David Bain , Michael Brady , and Jennifer Corns , 55–74. London: Routledge. Coleman, Sam . 2022. "Intentionality, Qualia, and the Stream of Unconsciousness."

Phenomenology and Mind 22: 42–53. https://doi.org/10.17454/pam-2203

Coleman, Sam. Forthcoming. "An Argument for Unconscious Mental Qualities." Australasian Journal of Philosophy.

Crick, Francis , and Christof Koch . 1992. "The Problem of Consciousness." Scientific American 267 (3): 152–159. https://doi.org/10.1038/scientificamerican0992-152

Crick, Francis , and Christof Koch . 1995a. "Are We Aware of Neural Activity in Primary Visual Cortex?" Nature 375 (6527): 121–123. https://doi.org/10.1038/375121a0

Crick, Francis, and Christof Koch. 1995b. "Cortical Areas in Visual Awareness." Nature 377 (6547): 294–295. https://doi.org/10.1038/377294a0

Dehaene, Stanislas, Lionel Naccache, Laurent Cohen, Denis Le Bihan, Jean-François Mangin, Jean-Baptiste Poline, and Denis Rivière. 2001. "Cerebral Mechanisms of Word Masking and Unconscious Repetition Priming." Nature Neuroscience 4 (7): 752–758. https://doi.org/10.1038/89551

Downing, Paul E ., Yuhong Jiang , Miles Shuman , and Nancy Kanwisher . 2001. "A Cortical Area Selective for Visual Processing of the Human Body." Science 293 (5539): 2470–2473. https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1063414

Driver, Jon , and Patrik Vuilleumier . 2001. "Perceptual Awareness and Its Loss in Unilateral Neglect and Extinction." Cognition 79 (1–2): 39–88. https://doi.org/10.1016/s0010-0277(00)00124-4

Fahrenfort, Johannes J., Jonathan van Leeuwen, Christian N. L. Olivers, and Hinze Hogendoorn. 2017. "Perceptual Integration without Conscious Access." Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America 114 (14): 3744–3749. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1617268114

Fontan, Aurelie , Lenita Lindgren , Tiziana Pedale , Camilla Brorsson , Fredrik Bergström , and Johan Eriksson . 2021. "A Reduced Level of Consciousness Affects Non-Conscious

Processes." NeuroImage 244: 118571. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuroimage.2021.118571 Frith, Chris D . 2021. "The Neural Basis of Consciousness." Psychological Medicine 51 (4): 550–562. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0033291719002204

Grill-Spector, Kalanit , Nicholas Knouf , and Nancy Kanwisher . 2004. "The Fusiform Face Area Subserves Face Perception, Not Generic within-Category Identification." Nature Neuroscience 7 (5): 555–562. https://doi.org/10.1038/nn1224

Gur, Moshe , and D. Max Snodderly . 1997. "A Dissociation between Brain Activity and Perception: Chromatically Opponent Cortical Neurons Signal Chromatic Flicker That Is Not Perceived." Vision Research 37: 377–382. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0042-6989(96)00183-6 He, Sheng , and Donald I. MacLeod . 2001. "Orientation-Selective Adaptation and Tilt After-Effect from Invisible Patterns." Nature 411 (6836): 473–476. https://doi.org/10.1038/35078072 Hesse, Janis Karan , and Doris Y. Tsao . 2020. "A New No-Report Paradigm Reveals That Face Cells Encode Both Consciously Perceived and Suppressed Stimuli." ELife 9: e58360. https://doi.org/10.7554/eLife.58360

Jiang, Yi , Ke Zhou , and Sheng He . 2007. "Human Visual Cortex Responds to Invisible Chromatic Flicker." Nature Neuroscience 10: 657–662. https://doi.org/10.1038/nn1879 Kanwisher, Nancy . 2001. "Neural Events and Perceptual Awareness." Cognition 79 (1–2): 89–113. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0010-0277(00)00125-6

Keller, Andreas . 2016. Philosophy of Olfactory Perception. Cham: Palgrave Macmillan. Kirkeby-Hinrup, Asger . 2016. "Change Blindness and Misrepresentation." Disputatio 8 (42): 37–56. https://doi.org/10.2478/disp-2016-0002

Kouider, Sid , Evelyn Eger , Raymond Dolan , and Richard N. Henson . 2009. "Activity in Face-Responsive Brain Regions Is Modulated by Invisible, Attended Faces: Evidence from Masked Priming." Cerebral Cortex 19 (1): 13–23. https://doi.org/10.1093/cercor/bhn048

Lamme, Victor A. F., and Pieter R. Roelfsema . 2000. "The Distinct Modes of Vision Offered by Feedforward and Recurrent Processing." Trends in Neurosciences 23 (11): 571–579. https://doi.org/10.1016/s0166-2236(00)01657-x

Lamme, Victor A. F. 2014. "The Crack of Dawn: Perceptual Functions and Neural Mechanisms That Mark the Transition from Unconscious Processing to Conscious Vision." In Open MIND, edited by Thomas Metzinger and Jennifer M. Windt , 1–33. Frankfurt am Main: MIND Group. Lockwood, Michael . 1989. Mind, Brain, and the Quantum: The Compound 'I'. Oxford: Basil Blackwell.

Marvan, Tomáš , and Michal Polák . 2017. "Unitary and Dual Models of Phenomenal Consciousness." Consciousness and Cognition 56: 1–12.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.concog.2017.09.006

Marvan, Tomáš, and Michal Polák. 2020. "Generality and Content-Specificity in the Study of the Neural Correlates of Perceptual Consciousness." Philosophy and the Mind Sciences 1 (2): 1–17. https://doi.org/10.33735/phimisci.2020.II.61

Mashour, George A ., Pieter R. Roelfsema , Jean-Pierre Changeux , and Stanislas Dehaene . 2020. "Conscious Processing and the Global Neuronal Workspace Hypothesis." Neuron 105 (5): 776–798. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuron.2020.01.026

Michel, Matthias . 2022. "Conscious Perception and the Prefrontal Cortex: A Review." Journal of Consciousness Studies 29 (7–8): 115–157. https://doi.org/10.53765/20512201.29.7.115 Moutoussis, Konstantinos , and Semir Zeki . 2002. "The Relationship between Cortical Activation and Perception Investigated with Invisible Stimuli." Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 99 (14): 9527–9532. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.142305699 Mudrik Liad and Leon X Deouell 2022 "Neuroscientific Evidence for Processing Without

Mudrik, Liad , and Leon Y. Deouell . 2022. "Neuroscientific Evidence for Processing Without Awareness." Annual Review of Neuroscience 45 (1): 403–423. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-neuro-110920-033151

Peebles, Graham . 2022. "The Problem of Higher-Order Misrepresentation." Philosophical Psychology 35 (6): 842–861. https://doi.org/10.1080/09515089.2021.2016677

Pojoga, Sorin A ., Natasha Kharas , and Valentin Dragoi . 2020. "Perceptually Unidentifiable Stimuli Influence Cortical Processing and Behavioral Performance." Nature Communications 11 (1): 6109. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-020-19848-w

Polák, Michal , and Tomáš Marvan . 2019. "How to Mitigate the Hard Problem by Adopting the Dual Theory of Phenomenal Consciousness." Frontiers in Psychology 10: 2837. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2019.02837

Rangarajan, Vinitha , Dora Hermes , Brett L. Foster , Kevin S. Weiner , Corentin Jacques , Kalanit Grill-Spector , and Josef Parvizi . 2014. "Electrical Stimulation of the Left and Right Human Fusiform Gyrus Causes Different Effects in Conscious Face Perception." Journal of Neuroscience 34 (38): 12828–12836. https://doi.org/10.1523/JNEUROSCI.0527-14.2014 Rees, Geraint , and Chris D. Frith . 2017. "Methodologies for Identifying the Neural Correlates of Consciousness." In The Blackwell Companion to Consciousness, edited by Max Velmans and Susan Schneider , 589–606. Malden, MA: John Wiley.

Rees, Geraint, Ewa Wojciulik, Karen Clarke, Masud Husain, Chris Frith, and Jon Driver. 2002. "Neural Correlates of Conscious and Unconscious Vision in Parietal Extinction." Neurocase 8 (5): 387–393. https://doi.org/10.1076/neur.8.4.387.16190

Rosenthal, David . 2005. Consciousness and Mind. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Rosenthal, David . 2012. "Higher-Order Awareness, Misrepresentation and Function." Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 367 (1594): 1424–1438. https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2011.0353

Soto, David , Usman Ayub Sheikh , and Clive R. Rosenthal . 2019. "A Novel Framework for Unconscious Processing." Trends in Cognitive Sciences 23 (5): 372–376. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tics.2019.03.002

Stein, Timo , Daniel Kaiser , Johannes J. Fahrenfort , and Simon van Gaal . 2021. "The Human Visual System Differentially Represents Subjectively and Objectively Invisible Stimuli." PLOS Biology 19 (5): e3001241. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pbio.3001241

Sterzer, Philipp , Lauri Jalkanen , and Geraint Rees . 2009. "Electromagnetic Responses to Invisible Face Stimuli during Binocular Suppression." NeuroImage 46 (3): 803–808. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuroimage.2009.02.046

Tong, Frank , Ken Nakayama, J. Thomas Vaughan , and Nancy Kanwisher . 1998. "Binocular Rivalry and Visual Awareness in Human Extrastriate Cortex." Neuron 21 (4): 753–759. https://doi.org/10.1016/s0896-6273(00)80592-9

Vugt, Bram van , Bruno Dagnino , Devavrat Vartak , Houman Safaai , Stefano Panzeri , Stanislas Dehaene , and Pieter R. Roelfsema . 2018. "The Threshold for Conscious Report: Signal Loss and Response Bias in Visual and Frontal Cortex." Science 360 (6388): 537–542. https://doi.org/10.1126/science.aar7186

Young, Benjamin D . 2014. "Smelling Phenomenal." Frontiers in Psychology 5: 713. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2014.00713

Young, Benjamin , Andreas Keller , and David Rosenthal . 2014. "Quality-Space Theory in Olfaction." Frontiers in Psychology 5: 1. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2014.00001 Zięba, Paweł Jakub . 2022. "Seeing Colours Unconsciously." Synthese 200 (3): 260. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11229-022-03687-x

Troubles with the orthogonality thesis

Champoux, François, Olivier Collignon, Benoit A. Bacon, Franco Lepore, Robert J. Zatorre, and Hugo Théoret. 2010. "Early- and Late-Onset Blindness Both Curb Audiotactile Integration on the Parchment-Skin Illusion." Psychological Science 22 (1): 19–25.

https://doi.org/10.1177/0956797610391099

Dubova, Marina , and Robert Goldstone . 2021. "The Influences of Category Learning on Perceptual Reconstructions." Cognitive Science 45 (5): 1–24.

https://doi.org/10.1111/cogs.12981

Fink, Sascha Benjamin , Lukas Kob , and Holger Lyre . 2021. "A Structural Constraint on Neural Correlates of Consciousness." Philosophy and the Mind Sciences 2: 1–23.

https://doi.org/10.33735/phimisci.2021.79

Magnotti, John F. , and Michael S. Beauchamp . 2017. "A Causal Inference Model Explains Perception of the McGurk Effect and Other Incongruent Audiovisual Speech." PLoS Computational Biology 13 (2): e1005229. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pcbi.1005229 Marvan, Tomáš , and Michal Polák . 2017. "Unitary and Dual Models of Phenomenal Consciousness." Consciousness and Cognition 56: 1–12. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.concog.2017.09.006 McGurk, Harry , and John MacDonald . 1976. "Hearing Lips and Seeing Voices. Nature 264 (5588): 746–748. https://doi.org/10.1038/264746a0

O'Callaghan, Casey . 2017. Beyond Vision: Philosophical Essays. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

O'Callaghan, Casey . 2019. A Multisensory Philosophy of Perception. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Palmer, Terry D ., and Ashley K. Ramsey . 2012. "The Function of Consciousness in Multisensory Integration." Cognition 125 (3): 353–364.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cognition.2012.08.003

Rosenthal, David M . 2010. "How to Think about Mental Qualities." Philosophical Issues 20: 368–393. https://doi.org/10.2307/1522921

Searle, John . 1992. The Rediscovery of the Mind. Cambridge, Mass.: The MIT Press. Skrzypulec, Błażej . 2022. "Contents of Unconscious Color Perception." Review of Philosophy and Psychology 13: 665–681. https://doi.org/10.1007/s13164-021-00552-7

Tiippana, Kaisa . 2014. "What Is the McGurk Effect?" Frontiers in Psychology 5: 75. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2014.00725

Vosgerau, Gottfried , Tobias Schlicht , and Albert Newen . 2008. "Orthogonality of Phenomenality and Content." American Philosophical Quarterly 45 (4): 309–328.

Unconsciously smelling self and others

Adolph, Dirk , Sabine Schlösser , Maren Hawighorst , Betina M. 2010. "Chemosensory Signals of Competition Increase the Skin Conductance Response in Humans." Physiology and Behavior 101 (5): 666–671. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.physbeh.2010.08.004

Aksenov, Alexander A., Andrea Gojova, Weixiang Zhao, Joshua T. Morgan, Shankar Sankaran, Christian E. Sandrock, and Cristina E. Davis. 2012. "Characterization of Volatile Organic Compounds in Human Leukocyte Antigen Heterologous Expression Systems: A Cell's 'Chemical Odor Fingerprint'." Chembiochem: A European Journal of Chemical Biology 13 (7): 1053–1059. https://doi.org/10.1002/cbic.201200011

Amann, Anton , Ben de Lacy Costello , Wolfram Miekisch , Jochen Schubert , Bogusław Buszewski , Joachim Pleil , Norman Ratcliffe , and Terence Risby . 2014. "The Human Volatilome: Volatile Organic Compounds (VOCs) in Exhaled Breath, Skin Emanations, Urine, Feces and Saliva." Journal of Breath Research 8 (3): 034001. https://doi.org/10.1088/1752-7155/8/3/034001

Bensafi, Moustafa , W. M. Brown , T. Tsutsui , Joela D. Mainland , Bradley N. Johnson , E. A. Bremner , N. Young , Iris B. Mauss , B. Ray , J. Gross , J. Richards , Iris Stappen , Robert W. Levenson , and Noam Sobel . 2003. "Sex-steroid Derived Compounds Induce Sex-specific Effects on Autonomic Nervous System Function in Humans." Behavioral Neuroscience 117 (6): 1125–1134. https://doi.org/10.1037/0735-7044.117.6.1125

Bensafi, Moustafa, T. Tsutsui, Rammis Khan, Robert W. Levenson, Noam Sobel. 2004. "Sniffing a Human Sex-steroid Derived Compound Affects Mood and Autonomic Arousal in a Dose-Dependent Manner." Psychoneuroendocrinology 29 (10): 1290–1299. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.psyneuen.2004.03.007

Block, Ned . 1993. "Review of Daniel Dennett's Consciousness Explained." The Journal of Philosophy 90 (4): 181–193. https://doi.org/10.2307/2940970

Block, Ned . 1995. "On a Confusion about a Function of Consciousness." Behavioral and Brain Sciences. 18 (2): 227–247. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0140525X00038188

Block, Ned . 1996. "Mental Paint and Mental Latex." Philosophical Issues 7: 19–49.

Block, Ned . 2001. "Paradox and Cross-Purposes in Recent Work on Consciousness." Cognition 79 (1-2): 197–219. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0010-0277(00)00129-3

Block, Ned . 2007. "Consciousness, Accessibility, and the Mesh between Psychology and Neuroscience." Behavioral and Brain Sciences 30 (5-6): 481–548.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0140525X07002786

Block, Ned . 2008. "Consciousness and Cognitive Access." Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society 108 (1): 289–317. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9264.2008.00247.x

Block, Ned . 2009. "Comparing the Major Theories of Consciousness." In M. Gazzaniga (ed.), The Cognitive Neurosciences, edited by Michael Gazzaniga , 1111–1122. Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press.

Calvi, Elisa , Umberto Quassolo , Massimiliano Massaia , Anna Scandurra , Biagio D'Aniello , and Patrizia D'Amelio . 2020. "The Scent of Emotions: A Systematic Review of Human Intraand Interspecific Chemical Communication of Emotions." Brain and Behavior 10 (5): e01585. https://doi.org/10.1002/brb3.1585

Chen, Denise , Ameeta Katdare , and Nadia Lucas . 2006. "Chemosignals of Fear Enhance Cognitive Performance in Humans." Chemical Senses 31 (5): 415–423. https://doi.org/10.1093/chemse/bjj046

Ciaunica, Anna , Adam Safron , and Jonathan Delafield . 2021. Back to Square One: The Bodily Roots of Conscious Experiences in Early Life. Neuroscience of Consciousness 7 (2): 1–10. https://doi.org/10.1093/nc/niab037

Croijmans, Ilja, Laura van Erp, Annelie Bakker, Lara Cramer, Sophie Heezen, Dana Van Mourik, Sterre Weaver, and Ruud Hortensius. 2022. "No Evidence for an Effect of the Smell of Hexanal on Trust in Human-Robot Interaction." International Journal of Social Robotics 15: 1–10. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12369-022-00918-6

Croy, Ilona , Viola Bojanowski , and Thomas Hummel . 2013. "Men Without a Sense of Smell Exhibit a Strongly Reduced Number of Sexual Relationships, Women Exhibit Reduced Partnership Security—A Reanalysis of Previously Published Data." Biological Psychology 92 (2): 292–294. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biopsycho.2012.11.008

Croy, Ilona , Steven Nordin , Thomas Hummel . 2014. "Olfactory Disorders and Quality of Life — An Updated Review." Chemical Senses 39 (3): 185–194.

https://doi.org/10.1093/chemse/bjt072

de Groot, Jasper H. B., Peter A. Kirk, Jay A. Gottfried . 2020. "Encoding Fear Intensity in Human Sweat." Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series B, Biological Sciences 375 (1800): 20190271. https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2019.0271

de Groot, Jasper H. B., Gün R. Semin, Monique A. M. Smeets . 2014. "I Can See, Hear, and Smell Your Fear: Comparing Olfactory and Audiovisual Media in Fear Communication." Journal of Experimental Psychology, General 143 (2): 825–834. https://doi.org/10.1037/a0033731

de Groot, Jasper H. B., Gün R. Semin, Monique A. Smeets . 2017. "On the Communicative Function of Body Odors. A Theoretical Integration and Review." Perspectives on Psychological Science: A Journal of the Association for Psychological Science 12 (2): 306–324. https://doi.org/10.1177/1745691616676599

de Groot, Jasper H. B. , Monique A. M. Smeets , Annemarie Kaldewaij , Maarten J. Duijndam , and Gün R. Semin . 2012. "Chemosignals Communicate Human Emotions." Psychological Science 23: 1417–1424. https://doi.org/10.1177/0956797612445317

de Groot, Jasper H. B., Lisanne van Houtum, Ilse Gortemaker, Yuting Ye, Wei Chen, Wei Zhou, Monique A. Smeets. 2018. "Beyond the West: Chemosignaling of Emotions Transcends Ethno-Cultural Boundaries." Psychoneuroendocrinology 98: 177–185.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.psyneuen.2018.08.005

De Lacy, Costello B ., Anton Amann , Huda Al-Kateb , Cheryl Flynn , Wojciech Filipiak , Tanzeela Khalid , D. Osborne , and N. M. Ratcliffe . 2014. "A Review of the Volatiles from the Healthy Human Body." Journal of Breath Research 8 (1): 014001. https://doi.org/10.1088/1752-7155/8/1/014001

Doty, Richard L . 2010. The Great Pheromone Myth. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.

Endevelt-Shapira, Yaara , Ofer Perl , Aharon Ravia , Daniel Amir , Ami Eisen , Vered Bezalel , Liron Rozenkrantz , Eva Mishor , Liron Pinchover , Timna Soroka , Danielle Honigstein , and Noam Sobel . 2018. "Altered Responses to Social Chemosignals in Autism Spectrum Disorder." Nature Neuroscience 21 (1): 111–119. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41593-017-0024-x

Fialova, Jitka , S. Craig Roberts , and Jan Havlicek . 2016. "Consumption of Garlic Positively Affects Hedonic Perception of Axillary Body Odour." Appetite 97: 8–15.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.appet.2015.11.001

Fialova, Jitka , Vit Trebicky , Radim Kuba , David Stella , Jakub Binter , and Jan Havlicek . 2020. "Losing Stinks! The Effect of Competition Outcome on Body Odour Quality." Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series B, Biological Sciences *375* (1800): 20190267. https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2019.0267 Ferdenzi, Camille , Stéphane R. Ortegón , Sylvian Delplanque , Nicolas Baldovini , and Moustafa Bensafi . 2020. "Interdisciplinary Challenges for Elucidating Human Olfactory Attractiveness." Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series B, Biological Sciences 375 (1800): 20190268. https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2019.0268

Frumin, Idan , Ofer Perl , Yaara Endevelt-Shapira , Ami Eisen , Neetai Eshel , Iris Heller , Maya Shemesh , Aharon Ravia , Lee Sela , Anat Arzi , and Noam Sobel . 2015. "A Social Chemosignaling Function for Human Handshaking." eLife 4: e05154.

https://doi.org/10.7554/eLife.05154

Gelstein, Shani , Yaara Yeshurun , Liron Rozenkrantz , Sagit Shushan , Idan Frumin , Yehudah Roth , and Noam Sobel . 2011. "Human Tears Contain a Chemosignal." Science 331 (6014): 226–230. https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1198331

Gordon, Amy R ., Bruce A. Kimball , Kimo Sorjonen , Bianka Karshikoff , John Axelsson , Mats Lekander , Johan N. Lundström , and Mats J. Olsson . 2018. "mDetection of Inflammation Via Volatile Cues in Human Urine." Chemical Senses 43 (9): 711–719.

https://doi.org/10.1093/chemse/bjy059

Havlicek, Jan , S. Craig Roberts , and Jaroslav Flegr . 2005. "Women's Preference for Dominant Male Odour: Effects of Menstrual Cycle and Relationship Status." Biology Letters 1 (3): 256–259. https://doi.org/10.1098/rsbl.2005.0332

Havlicek, Jan , Jamie Winternitz , and S. Craig Roberts . 2020. "Major Histocompatibility Complex-associated Odour Preferences and Human Mate Choice: Near and Far Horizons." Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series B, Biological Sciences 375 (1800): 20190260. https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2019.0260

Jacob, Suma , Martha K. McClintock , Bethanne Zelano , and Carole Ober . 2002. "Paternally Inherited HLA Alleles Are Associated with Women's Choice of Male Odor." Nature Genetics 30 (2): 175–179. https://doi.org/10.1038/ng830

Jellinek, Paul . 1951. Die Psychologischen Grundlagen der Parfumerie Untersuchungen uber die Wirkungen von Geruchen auf das Gefuhlsleben. Heidelberg: Hüthig.

Kouider, Sid , Jérôme Sackur , and Vincent de Gardelle . 2012. "Do We Still Need Phenomenal Consciousness? Comment on Block." Trends in Cognitive Sciences 16 (3): 140–142. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tics.2012.01.003

Le Norcy, S . 1991. "Selling Perfume: A Technique or an Art?" In Perfumery: The Psychology and Biology of Fragrance, edited by Steve Van Toller , and George H. Dodd , 217–226. London: Chapman and Hall.

Lemogne, Cédric , Julien Smadja , El-Hadi Zerdazi , Yaël Soudry , Marion Robin , Sylvie Berthoz , Frédéric Limosin , Silla M. Consoli , and Pierre Bonfils . 2015. "Congenital Anosmia and Emotion Recognition: A Case-control Study." Neuropsychologia 72: 52–58. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuropsychologia.2015.04.028

Lenochova, Pavlina, Pavla Vohnoutova, S. Craig Roberts, Elisabeth Oberzaucher, Karl Grammer, and Jan Havlicek. 2012. "Psychology of Fragrance Use: Perception of Individual Odor and Perfume Blends Reveals a Mechanism for Idiosyncratic Effects on Fragrance Choice." PloS one 7 (3): e33810. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0033810

Li, Zi-Lin , Yue Qi , Mehmet K. Mahmut , and Lai-Quan Zou . 2022. "Do You Often Sniff Yourself or Others? Development of the Body Odor Sniffing Questionnaire and a Cross-cultural Survey in China and the USA." Physiology & Behavior 255: 113934.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.physbeh.2022.113934

Lundström, Johan N ., Mats J. Olsson , Benoist Schaal , and Thomas Hummel . 2006. "A Putative Social Chemosignal Elicits Faster Cortical Responses Than Perceptually Similar Odorants." NeuroImage 30 (4): 1340–1346. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuroimage.2005.10.040 Lübke, Katrin T ., and Bettina M. Pause . 2015. "Always Follow Your Nose: The Functional Significance of Social Chemosignals in Human Reproduction and Survival." Hormones and Behaviour 68: 134–144. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.yhbeh.2014.10.001

Mahmut, Mehmet K., Richard J. Stevenson , and Ian Stephen . 2019. "Do Women Love Their Partner's Smell? Exploring Women's Preferences for and Identification of Male Partner and Non-partner Body Odor." Physiology & Behavior 210: 112517.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.physbeh.2019.04.006

Milinski, Manfred , Ilona Croy , Thomas Hummel , and Thomas Boehm . 2013. "Major Histocompatibility Complex Peptide Ligands as Olfactory Cues in Human Body Odour Assessment." Proceedings. Biological Sciences 280 (1755): 20122889. https://doi.org/10.1098/rspb.2012.2889 Milinski, Manfred , and Claus Wedekind . 2001. "Evidence for MHC-correlated Perfume Preferences in Humans." Behavioral Ecology 12 (2): 140–149.

https://doi.org/10.1093/beheco/12.2.140

Miller, Saul L., and Jon K. Maner . 2010. "Scent of a Woman: Men's Testosterone Responses to Olfactory Ovulation Cues. Psychological Science 21 (2): 276–283. https://doi.org/10.1177/0956797609357733

Mishor, Eva, Daniel Amir, Tali Weiss, Danielle Honigstein, Aharon Weissbrod, Ethan Livne, Lior Gorodisky, Shiri Karagach, Aharon Ravia, Kobi Snitz, Diyala Karawani, Rotem Zirler, Reut Weissgross, Timna Soroka, Yaara Endevelt-Shapira, Shani Agron, Liron Rozenkrantz, Netta Reshef, Edna Furman-Haran, Heinz Breer, Joerg Strotmann, Tatsuya Uebi, Mamiko Ozaki, and Noam Sobel. 2021. "Sniffing the Human Body Volatile Hexadecanal Blocks Aggression in Men but Triggers Aggression in Women." Science Advances 7 (47): eabg1530. https://doi.org/10.1126/sciadv.abg1530

Nagel, Thomas . 1974. "What Is It Like to Be a Bat?" Philosophical Review 83 (4): 435–450. https://doi.org/10.2307/2183914

Natsch Andreas, and Roger Emter . 2020. "The Specific Biochemistry of Human Axilla Odour Formation Viewed in an Evolutionary Context." Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series B, Biological Sciences 375 (1800): 20190269.

https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2019.0269

Oleszkiewicz, Anna , and Thomas Hummel . 2019. "Whose Nose Does Not Know? Demographical Characterization of People Unaware of Anosmia." European Archives of Otorhinolaryngology 276 (6): 1849–1852. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00405-019-05414-8 Oleszkiewicz Anna , F. Kunkel , Maria Larsson , Thomas Hummel . 2020. "Consequences of Undetected Olfactory Loss for Human Chemosensory Communication and Well-being." Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series B, Biological Sciences 375 (1800): 20190265. https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2019.0265

Olsson, Mats J ., Johan N. Lundström , Bruce A. Kimball , Amy R. Gordon , Bianka Karshikoff , Nishteman Hosseini , Kimmo Sorjonen , Caroline Olgart Höglund , Carmen Solares , Anne Soop , John Axelsson , and Mats Lekander . 2014. "The Scent of Disease: Human Body Odor Contains an Early Chemosensory Cue of Sickness." Psychological Science 25 (3): 817–823. https://doi.org/10.1177/0956797613515681

Pause, Bettina M., Katrin Lübke, Joachim H. Laudien, and Roman Ferstl. 2010. "Intensified Neuronal Investment in the Processing of Chemosensory Anxiety Signals in Non-socially Anxious and Socially Anxious Individuals." PloS one 5 (4): e10342.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0010342

Pause, Bettina M., Dunja Storch, and Katrin T. Lübke . 2020. "Chemosensory Communication of Aggression: Women's Fine-tuned Neural Processing of Male Aggression Signals." Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series B, Biological Sciences 375

(1800): 20190270. https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2019.0270

Penn, Dustin J., Elisabeth Oberzaucher, Karl Grammer, Gottfried Fischer, Helena A. Soini, Donald Wiesler, Milos V. Novotny, Sarah J. Dixon, Yun Xu, and Richard G. Brereton. 2007. "Individual and Gender Fingerprints in Human Body Odour." Journal of the Royal Society, Interface 4 (13): 331–340. https://doi.org/10.1098/rsif.2006.0182

Perl, Ofer , Eva Mishor , Aharon Ravia , Inbal Ravreby , and Noam Sobel . 2020. "Are Humans Constantly but Subconsciously Smelling Themselves?" Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series B, Biological Sciences 375 (1800): 20190372. https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2019.0372

Prehn, Alexander , Anne Ohrt , Bernfried Sojka , Roman Ferstl , and Bettina M. Pause . 2006. "Chemosensory Anxiety Signals Augment the Startle Reflex in Humans." Neuroscience Letters 394 (2): 127–130. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neulet.2005.10.012

Ravreby, Inbal, Kobi Snitz, and Noam Sobel. 2022. "There Is Chemistry in Social Chemistry." Science Advances 8 (25): eabn0154. https://doi.org/10.1126/sciadv.abn0154

Roberts, S. Craig , Jan Havlicek , and Benoist Schaal . 2020. "Human Olfactory Communication: Current Challenges and Future Prospects." Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series B, Biological Sciences 375 (1800): 20190258. https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2019.0258

Rosenthal, David M . 2002. "How Many Kinds of Consciousness?" Consciousness and Cognition 11 (4): 653–665. https://doi.org/10.1016/S1053-8100(02)00017-X

Rosenthal, David M . 2005. Consciousness and Mind. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Rosenthal, David M . 2009. "Concepts and Definition of Consciousness." In Encyclopedia of Consciousness, edited by William P. Banks , 135–226. Oxford: Elsevier.

Rosenthal, David M . 2010. "How to Think about Mental Qualities." Philosophical Issues 20 (1): 368–393. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1533-6077.2010.00190.x

Sarolidou, Georgia , John Axelsson , Bruce A. Kimball , Tina Sundelin , Christina Regenbogen , Johan N. Lundström , Mats Lekander , and Mats J. Olsson . 2020. "People Expressing Olfactory and Visual Cues of Disease are Less Liked." Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series B, Biological Sciences 375 (1800): 20190272.

https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2019.0272

Savic, Ivanka , Hans Berglund , Balazs Gulyas , and Per Roland . 2001. "Smelling of Odorous Sex Hormone-like Compounds Causes Sex-differentiated Hypothalamic Activations in Humans." Neuron 31 (4): 661–668. https://doi.org/10.1016/s0896-6273(01)00390-7

Schaal, Benoist, Tamsin K. Saxton, Hélène Loos, Robert Soussignan, and Karine Durand. 2020. "Olfaction Scaffolds the Developing Human from Neonate to Adolescent and Beyond." Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series B, Biological Sciences 375 (1800): 20190261. https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2019.0261

Schäfer, Laura , Agnieszka Sorokowska , Jürgen Sauter , Alexander H. Schmidt , and Ilona Croy . 2020. "Body Odours as a Chemosignal in the Mother-child Relationship: New Insights Based on an Human Leucocyte Antigen-genotyped Family Cohort." Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series B, Biological Sciences 375 (1800): 20190266. https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2019.0266

Sellaro, Roberta , Bernhard Hommel , Claudia R. Paccani , and Lorenza S. Colzato . 2015b. "With Peppermints You're Not My Prince: Aroma Modulates Self-other Integration. Attention, Perception, & Psychophysics 77 (8): 2817–2825. https://doi.org/10.3758/s13414-015-0955-9 Sellaro, Roberta , Wilco W. van Dijk , Claudia R. Paccani , Bernhard Hommel, and Lorenza S. Colzato . 2015a. "A Question of Scent: Lavender Aroma Promotes Interpersonal Trust." Frontiers in Psychology 5: 1486. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2014.01486

Shirasu, Mika , and Kazushige Touhara . 2011. "The Scent of Disease: Volatile Organic Compounds of the Human Body Related to Disease and Disorder." Journal of Biochemistry 150 (3): 257–266. https://doi.org/10.1093/jb/mvr090

Smith, Barry C . 2023. "The Role of Smell in Consciousness." In Theoretical Perspectives on Smell, edited by Andreas Keller , and Benjamin D. Young , 13–35. New York: Routledge Press. Sorokowska, Agnieszka . 2013. "Assessing Personality Using Body Odor: Differences Between Children and Adults." Journal of Nonverbal Behavior 37 (3): 153–163. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10919-013-0152-2

Sorokowska, Agnieszka, Piotr Sorokowski, and Jan Havlicek. 2016. "Body Odor Based Personality Judgments: The Effect of Fragranced Cosmetics." Frontiers in Psychology 7: 530. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2016.00530

Stevenson, Richard J . 2009. "Phenomenal and Access Consciousness in Olfaction." Consciousness and Cognition 18 (4): 1004–1017. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.concog.2009.09.005 Tafalla Marta . 2013. "A World Without the Olfactory Dimension." Anatomical Record 296 (9): 1287–1296. https://doi.org/10.1002/ar.22734

Wedekind, Claus , Thomas Seebeck , Florence Bettens , and Alexander J. Paepke . 1995. "MHC-Dependent Mate Preferences in Humans." Proceedings. Biological Sciences 260 (1359): 245–249. https://doi.org/10.1098/rspb.1995.0087

Wyart, Claire , Wallace W. Webster , Jonathan H. Chen , Sarah R. Wilson , Andrew McClary , Rehan M. Khan , and Noam Sobel . 2007. "Smelling a Single Component of Male Sweat Alters Levels of Cortisol in Women." The Journal of Neuroscience 27 (6): 1261–1265. https://doi.org/10.1523/JNEUROSCI.4430-06.2007

Young, Benjamin D . 2012. "Stinking Consciousness." Journal of Consciousness Studies 19 (3-4): 223–243.

Young, Benjamin D . 2014. "Smelling Phenomenal." Frontiers in Psychology 5: 713. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2014.00713

Young, Benjamin D . 2015. "Formative Non-conceptual Content." Journal of Consciousness Studies 22 (5-6): 201–214.

Young, Benjamin D . 2016. "Smelling Matter." Philosophical Psychology 29 (4): 520–534. https://doi.org/10.1080/09515089.2015.1126814

Young, Benjamin D . 2019a. "Smelling Molecular Structure." In Perception, Cognition, and Aesthetics, edited by Dena Shottenkirk , Manuel Curado , and Steven S. Gouveia , 64–84. Routledge Press.

Young, Benjamin D . 2019b. "The Many Problems of Distal Olfactory Perception." In Spatial Senses: Philosophy of Perception in an Age of Science, edited by Tony Cheng , Ophelia Deroy , and Charles Spence , 148–169. Routledge Press.

Young, Benjamin D . 2019c. "Smell's Puzzling Discrepancy." Mind & Language 35 (1): 90–114. https://doi.org/10.1111/mila.12233

Young, Benjamin D . 2020. "Perceiving Smellscapes." Pacific Philosophical Quarterly 101 (2): 203–223. https://doi.org/10.1111/papq.12309

Zahavi, Dan . 2005. Subjectivity and Selfhood: Investigating the First-person Perspective. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Zakrzewska, Marta . 2022. "Olfaction and Prejudice." [Doctoral dissertation, Stockholm University]. http://urn.kb.se/resolve?urn=urn:nbn:se:su:diva-204430

Zhou Wen , and Denise Chen . 2008. "Encoding Human Sexual Chemosensory Cues in the Orbitofrontal and Fusiform Cortices." The Journal of Neuroscience 28 (53): 14416–14421. https://doi.org/10.1523/JNEUROSCI.3148-08.2008

A feeling theory of unconscious emotions

 $Coleman, Sam . \ 2015. ``Neuro-Cosmology.'' In Phenomenal Qualities, edited by Paul Coates , and Sam Coleman , 66-102. Oxford: Oxford University Press.$

Coleman, Sam . 2019. "Painfulness, Suffering, and Consciousness." In The Philosophy of Suffering, edited by David Bain , Michael Brady , and Jennifer Corns , 55–74. London: Routledge.

Coleman, Sam . 2022a. "Intentionality, Qualia, and the Stream of Unconsciousness." Phenomenology and Mind 22: 42–53. https://doi.org/10.17454/pam-2203

Coleman, Sam. 2022b. "The Ins and Outs of Conscious Belief." Philosophical Studies 179 (2): 517–548. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11098-021-01669-2

Coleman, Sam (forthcoming) . "An Argument for Unconscious Mental Qualities." Australasian Journal of Philosophy.

Damasio, Antonio R . 1994. Descartes' Error: Emotion Reason and the Human Brain. New York: Gossett/Putnam.

James, William . 1884. "What is an Emotion?" Mind 9 (2): 188-205.

Kriegel, Uriah . 2007. "Consciousness: Phenomenal Consciousness, Access Consciousness, and Scientific Practice." In Handbook of Philosophy of Psychology and Cognitive Science,

edited by Paul R. Thagard , 195–218. Amsterdam: Elsevier, North-Holland.

Kriegel, Uriah . 2009. Subjective Consciousness: A Self-Representational Theory. New York: Oxford University Press.

Kriegel, Uriah . 2011. "Towards a New Feeling Theory of Emotions." European Journal of Philosophy 22 (3): 420–442. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-0378.2011.00493.x

Kripke, Saul . 1980. Naming and Necessity. Harvard: Harvard University Press.

 $\label{eq:leibniz} Leibniz, Gottfried W \ . \ 1714/1991. \ Monadology. \ Pittsburgh, PA: University of Pittsburgh Press.$

Lockwood, Michael . 1989. Mind, Brain and the Quantum. Oxford: Blackwell.

Mach, Ernst . 1886/1959. The Analysis of Sensations. New York: Dover.

Madell, Geoffrey C ., and Aaron Ridley . 1997. "Emotion and Feeling." Aristotelian Society Supplementary *Volume* 71 (1): 147–162. https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-8349.00023

Montero, Barbara, and Coleman, Sam. Forthcoming. "Unconscious Transformative Experience." *Synthese*.

Polák, Michal , and Tomáš Marvan . 2019. "How to Mitigate the Hard Problem by Adopting the Dual Theory of Phenomenal Consciousness." Frontiers in Psychology 10: 2837. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2019.02837

Prinz, Jesse . 2005. "Are Emotions Feelings?" Journal of Consciousness Studies 12 (8–10): 9–25.

Prinz, Jesse . 2012. The Conscious Brain. New York: Oxford University Press. Rosenthal, David M . 2005. Consciousness and Mind. Oxford: Clarendon Press. Russell, Bertrand . 1927. The Analysis of Matter. London: Kegan Paul. Scarantino, Andrea , and Ronald de Sousa . 2018. "Emotion." In The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy (Fall 2018 edition), edited by Edward N. Zalta . Retrieved from https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/sum2021/entries/emotion/ Searle, John . 1992. The Rediscovery of the Mind. Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press. Stubenberg, Leopold . 1998. Consciousness and Qualia. Amsterdam: John Benjamins. Whiting, Demian . 2011. "The Feeling Theory of Emotion and the Object-Directed Emotions." European Journal of Philosophy 19 (2): 281–303. https://doi.org/10.1111/J.1468-0378.2009.00384.X

Winkielman, Piotr , and Kent C. Berridge . 2004. "Unconscious Emotion." Current Directions in Psychological Science 13 (3): 120–123. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.0963-7214.2004.00288.x

Degrees of attention and degrees of consciousness

Asplund, Christopher L ., Daryl Fougnie , Samir Zughini , Justin Martin , and René Marois . 2014. "The Attentional Blink Reveals the Probabilistic Nature of Discrete Conscious Perception." Psychological Science 25 (3): 824–831. https://doi.org/10.1177/0956797613513810 Baars, Bernard J ., Natalie Geld , and Robert Kozma . 2021. "Global Workspace Theory (GWT) and Prefrontal Cortex: Recent Developments." Frontiers in Psychology 12: 749868. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2021.749868

Bayne, Tim , and David J. Chalmers . 2010. "What is the Unity of Consciousness?" In The Character of Consciousness, edited by David J. Chalmers , 497–539. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Bayne, Tim , Jakob Hohwy , and Adrian M. Owen . 2016. "Are There Levels of Consciousness?" Trends in Cognitive Sciences 20 (6): 405–413. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tics.2016.03.009 Birch, Jonathan , Alexandra K. Schnell , and Nicola S. Clayton . 2020. "Dimensions of Animal Consciousness." Trends in Cognitive Sciences 24 (10): 789–801.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tics.2020.07.007

Block, Ned . 2011. "Perceptual Consciousness Overflows Cognitive Access." Trends in Cognitive Sciences 15 (12): 567–575. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tics.2011.11.001 Campbell, Alana M ., and Deana B. Davalos . 2015. "Levels of Attention and Task Difficulty in the Modulation of Interval Duration Mismatch Negativity." Frontiers in Psychology 6: 1619.

https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2015.01619

Carrasco, Marisa . 2011. "Visual Attention: The Past 25 Years." Vision Research 51 (13): 1484–1525. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.visres.2011.04.012

Chun, Marvin M ., Julie D. Golomb and Nicholas B. Turk-Browne . 2011. "A Taxonomy of External and Internal Attention." Annual Review of Psychology 62 (1): 73–101. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.psych.093008.100427

Costines, Cyril, Tilmann Lhündrup Borghardt, and Marc Wittmann. 2021. "The Phenomenology of 'Pure' Consciousness as Reported by an Experienced Meditator of the Tibetan Buddhist Karma Kagyu Tradition. Analysis of Interview Content Concerning Different Meditative States." Philosophies 6 (2): 50. https://doi.org/10.3390/philosophies6020050 Dehaene, Stanislas, and Lionel Naccache . 2001. "Towards a Cognitive Neuroscience of Consciousness: Basic Evidence and a Workspace Framework." Cognition 79 (1–2): 1–37. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0010-0277(00)00123-2

Del Cul, Antoine , Sylvain Baillet , and Stanislas Dehaene . 2007. "Brain Dynamics Underlying the Nonlinear Threshold for Access to Consciousness." PLoS biology 5 (10): e260. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pbio.0050260

Eiserbeck, Anna , Alexander Enge , Milena Rabovsky , and Rasha Abdel Rahman . 2022. "Electrophysiological Chronometry of Graded Consciousness during the Attentional Blink." Cerebral Cortex 32 (6): 1244–1259. https://doi.org/10.1093/cercor/bhab289

Fazekas, Peter , and Bence Nanay . 2021. "Attention is Amplification, Not Selection." British Journal for the Philosophy of Science 72 (1): 299–324. https://doi.org/10.1093/bjps/axy065

Fazekas, Peter , and Morten Overgaard . 2018. "A Multi-factor Account of Degrees of Awareness ." Cognitive Science 42: 1833–1859. https://doi.org/10.1111/cogs.12478 Frässle, Stefan , Jens Sommer , Andreas Jansen , Marnix Naber , and Wolfgang Einhäuser . 2014. "Binocular Rivalry: Frontal Activity Relates to Introspection and Action but Not to Perception." The Journal of Neuroscience: The Official Journal of the Society for Neuroscience 34 (5): 1738–1747. doi:10.1523/JNEUROSCI.4403-13.2014

Fujino, Masahiro , Yoshiyuki Ueda , Hiroaki Mizuhara , Jun Saiki , and Michio Nomura . 2018. "Open Monitoring Meditation Reduces the Involvement of Brain Regions Related to Memory Function." Scientific Reports 8 (1): 9968. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-018-28274-4 Graziano, Michael S. A. 2013. Consciousness and the Social Brain. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Graziano, Michael S. A. 2019. Rethinking Consciousness: A Scientific Theory of Subjective Experience. W. W. Norton.

Jennings, Carolynn Dicey . 2020. The Attending Mind. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Jonkisz, Jakub , Michał Wierzchoń , and Marek Binder . 2017. "Four-Dimensional Graded Consciousness." Frontiers in Psychology 8: 420. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2017.00420 Kimchi, Ruth . 2009. "Perceptual Organization and Visual Attention." Progress in Brain Research 176: 15–33. https://doi.org/10.1016/s0079-6123(09)17602-1

Kuo, Bo-Cheng , Mark G. Stokes , and Anna Christina Nobre . 2012. "Attention Modulates Maintenance of Representations in Visual Short-Term Memory." Journal of Cognitive Neuroscience 24 (1): 51–60.

Lee, Andrew Y . 2022. "Degrees of Consciousness." Noûs: 1–23.

https://doi.org/10.1111/nous.12421

Levy, Yair . 2022. "The Most General Mental Act." In Mental Action and The Conscious Mind, edited by Michael Brent and Lisa Miracchi , 79–99. New York: Routledge.

Luck, Steven J., Steven A. Hillyard, Mustapha Mouloua and Harold L. Hawkins . 1996. "Mechanisms of Visual-Spatial Attention: Resource Allocation or Uncertainty Reduction?" Journal of Experimental Psychology. Human Perception and Performance (22): 3, 725–737. doi:10.1037//0096-1523.22.3.725

Lutz, Antoine , Heleen A. Slagter , John D. Dunne , and Richard J. Davidson . 2008. "Cognitive-Emotional Interactions: Attention Regulation and Monitoring in Meditation." Trends in Cognitive Sciences 12 (4): 163–169.

Mack, Arien , Muge Erol , and Jason Clarke . 2015. "Iconic Memory is not a Case of Attention-Free Awareness." Consciousness and Cognition 33: 291–299.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.concog.2014.12.016

Matsukura, Michi , Steven J. Luck , and Shaun P. Vecera . 2007. "Attention Effects During Visual Short-Term Memory Maintenance: Protection or Prioritization?" Perception & Psychophysics 69 (8): 1422–1434. https://doi.org/10.3758/BF03192957

Metzinger, Thomas . 2020. "Minimal Phenomenal Experience: Meditation, Tonic Alertness, and the Phenomenology of 'pure' Consciousness." Philosophy and the Mind Sciences 1 (I): 1–44. https://doi.org/10.33735/phimisci.2020.I.46

Michel, Matthias . 2019. "The Mismeasure of Consciousness: A Problem of Coordination for the Perceptual Awareness Scale." Philosophy of Science 86 (5): 1239–1249. https://doi.org/10.1086/705509

Montemayor, Carlos , and Harry H. Haladjian . 2015. Consciousness, Attention, and Conscious Attention. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Mortu, Ancuta . 2018. "Degrees of Attention in Experiencing Art." Estetika: The European Journal of Aesthetics 55 (1): 45–66. https://doi.org/10.33134/eeja.170

Nieuwenhuis, Sander , and Roy de Kleijn . 2011. "Consciousness of Targets during the Attentional Blink: A Gradual or All-or-None Dimension?" Attention, Perception and Psychophysics 73: 364–373. https://doi.org/10.3758/s13414-010-0026-1

Noah, Sean and George R. Mangun . 2019. "Recent Evidence that Attention is Necessary, but not Sufficient, for Conscious Perception." Annals of the New York Academy of Sciences 1464 (1): 52–63. https://doi.org/10.1111/nyas.14030

Norman, Liam J., Charles A. Heywood, and Robert W. Kentridge . 2013. "Object-Based Attention without Awareness." Psychological Science 24 (6): 836–843. https://doi.org/10.1177/0956797612461449 Pitts, Michael A., Lyuda A. Lutsyshyna, and Steven A. Hillyard . 2018. "The Relationship between Attention and Consciousness: An Expanded Taxonomy and Implications for 'No-report' Paradigms." Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B 373 (1755): 20170348. https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2017.0348

Pitts, Michael A., Jennifer Padwal, Daniel Fennelly, Antígona Martínez and Steven A. Hillyard . 2014. "Gamma Band Activity and the P3 Reflect Post-Perceptual Processes, not Visual Awareness." NeuroImage 101: 337–350. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuroimage.2014.07.024 Pretorius, Henk . 2014. Is Conscious Perception a Continuous or Dichotomous Phenomenon? PhD dissertation, Cape Town, South Africa: University of Cape Town.

http://hdl.handle.net/11427/12965

Prettyman, Adrienne . 2014. Attention and Conscious Perception. PhD dissertation. Toronto: University of Toronto.

https://tspace.library.utoronto.ca/bitstream/1807/65560/8/Prettyman_Adrienne_A_201403_PhD Thesis.pdf

Prettyman, Adrienne . 2022. "What is Diffuse Attention?" Mind & Language, 1–20. https://doi.org/10.1111/mila.12365

Ramsøy, Thomas Z ., and Morten Overgaard . 2004. "Introspection and Subliminal Perception." Phenomenology and the Cognitive Sciences 3 (1): 1–23.

https://doi.org/10.1023/B:PHEN.0000041900.30172.e8

Raymond, Jane E., Kimron L. Shapiro , and Karen M. Arnell . 1992. "Temporary Suppression of Visual Processing in an RSVP Task: An Attentional Blink?" Journal of Experimental Psychology: Human Perception and Performance 18 (3): 849–860. https://doi.org/10.1037/0096-1523.18.3.849

Sauret, Wesley , and William G. Lycan . 2014. "Attention and Internal Monitoring: A Farewell to HOP." Analysis 74 (3): 363–370.

Schwitzgebel, Eric. 2023. "Borderline Consciousness, When It's Neither Determinately True nor Determinately False that Experience is Present. Philosophical Studies.

https://doi.org/10.1007/s11098-023-02042-1

Sebastian, Miguel Angel . 2020. "Perspectival Self-Consciousness and Ego-Dissolution: An Analysis of (some) Altered States of Consciousness." Philosophy and the Mind Sciences 1 (I): 1–27. https://doi.org/10.33735/phimisci.2020.I.44

Sergent, Claire , Sylvain Baillet , and Stanislas Dehaene . 2005. "Timing of the Brain Events Underlying Access to Consciousness during the Attentional Blink." Nature Neuroscience 8 (10): 1391–1400. https://doi.org/10.1038/nn1549

Sergent, Claire and Stanislas Dehaene . 2004. "Is Consciousness a Gradual Phenomenon?" Psychological Science 15 (11): 720–728. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.0956-7976.2004.00748.x Smithies, Declan . 2011. "Attention is Rational-Access Consciousness." In Attention:

Philosophical and Psychological Essays, edited by Christopher Mole , Declan Smithies and Wayne Wu , 247–73. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Stoljar, Daniel . 2019. "In Praise of Poise." In Blockheads! Essays on Ned Block's Philosophy of Mind and Consciousness, edited by Adam Pautz and Daniel Stoljar , 511–536. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Talsma, Durk , Daniel Senkowski , Salvador Soto-Faraco , and Marty Woldorff . 2010. "The Multifaceted Interplay between Attention and Multisensory Integration." Trends in Cognitive Sciences 14 (9): 400–410. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tics.2010.06.008

Travis, L. E. , and M. E. Hall . 1938. "Effect of Visual After-Sensations upon Brain Potential Patterning under Different Degrees of Attention." Journal of Experimental Psychology 22 (5): 472–479.

Treisman, Anne . 2006. "How the Deployment of Attention Determines What We See." Visual Cognition 14 (4–8): 411–443. https://doi.org/10.1080/13506280500195250

Watzl, Sebastian . 2017. Structuring Mind: The Nature of Attention and how it Shapes Consciousness. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Wiese, Wanja . 2018. Experienced Wholeness. Integrating Insights from Gestalt Theory, Cognitive Neuroscience, and Predictive Processing. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Wiese, Wanja . 2020. "The Science of Consciousness does not Need Another Theory, it Needs a Minimal Unifying Model." Neuroscience of Consciousness 2020 (1): niaa013. https://doi.org/10.1093/nc/niaa013

Wiese, Wanja . 2022. "Attentional Structure and Phenomenal Unity." Open Philosophy 5 (1): 254–264. https://doi.org/10.1515/opphil-2022-0197

Windey, Bert , Astrid Vermeiren , Anne Atas , and Axel Cleeremans . 2014. "The Graded and Dichotomous Nature of Visual Awareness." Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B 369: 20130282. https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2013.0282

Wood, Noelle L ., and Nelson Cowan . 1995. "The Cocktail Party Phenomenon Revisited: Attention and Memory in the Classic Selective Listening Procedure of Cherry (1953)." Journal of Experimental Psychology: General 124 (3): 243–262. http://dx.doi.org/10.1037/0096-3445.124.3.243

Young, Mark S . and Neville A. Stanton . 2002. "Malleable Attentional Resources Theory: A New Explanation for the Effects of Mental Underload on Performance." Human Factors 44 (3): 365–375. https://doi.org/10.1518/0018720024497709

Template tuning and graded consciousness

Asplund, Christopher L ., Daryl Fougnie , Samir Zughni , Justin W. Martin , and René Marois . 2014. "The Attentional Blink Reveals the Probabilistic Nature of Discrete Conscious Perception." Psychological Science 25 (3): 824–831. https://doi.org/10.1177/0956797613513810 Atkinson, Richard C ., and Richard M. Shiffrin . 1968. "Human Memory: A Proposed System and Its Control Processes." In The Psychology of Learning and Motivation: Advances in Research and Theory, Vol. 2, edited by Kenneth W. Spence , and Janet T. Spence , 89–195. New York: Academic Press.

Auckland, Mark E., Kyle R. Cave, and Nick Donnelly. 2007. "Nontarget Objects Can Influence Perceptual Processes During Object Recognition." Psychonomic Bulletin Review *14* (2): 332–337. https://doi.org/10.3758/BF03194073

Baars, Bernard J . 1997. "In the Theatre of Consciousness: Global Workspace Theory, a Rigorous Scientific Theory of Consciousness." Journal of Consciousness Studies 4 (4): 292–309.

Baddeley, Alan . 2012. "Working Memory: Theories, Models, and Controversies." Annual Review of Psychology 63, 1–29. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-psych-120710-100422 Bar, Moshe . 2004. "Visual Objects in Context." Nature Reviews Neuroscience 5 (8): 617–629. https://doi.org/10.1038/nrn1476

Bar, Moshe , K. S. Kassam , K. S., Ghuman Singh Avniel , Jasmine Boshyan , A. M. Schmidt , Anders M. Dale , Matti S. Hamalainen , Ksenija Marinkovic , Daniel L. Schacter , Bruce Rosen , and Eric Halgren . 2006. "Top-down Facilitation of Visual Recognition." Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America 103 (2): 449–454. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0507062103

Block, Ned . 1995. "On a Confusion about a Function of Consciousness." Behavioral and Brain Sciences 18 (2): 227–247. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0140525X00038188

Block, Ned . 2005. "Two Neural Correlates of Consciousness." Trends in Cognitive Sciences 9 (2): 46–52. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tics.2004.12.006

Block, Ned . 2007. "Consciousness, Accessibility, and the Mesh between Psychology and Neuroscience." Behavioral and Brain Sciences 30 (5–6): 481–499.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0140525X07002786

Brogaard, Berit . 2011a. "Are There Unconscious Perceptual Processes?" Consciousness and Cognition 20 (2): 449–463. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.concog.2010.10.002

Brogaard, Berit . 2011b. "Conscious Vision for Action vs. Unconscious Vision for Action."

Cognitive Science 35: 1076–1104. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1551-6709.2011.01171.x

Brogaard, Berit . 2015. "Type 2 Blindsight and the Nature of Visual Experience." Consciousness and Cognition 32: 92–103. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.concog.2014.09.017

Brogaard, Berit . 2018. Seeing and Saying: The Language of Perception and the Representational View of Experience. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Brogaard, Berit , and Thomas A. Sørensen (2023). "Perceptual Variation in Object Perception." In Sensory Individuals: Unimodal and Multimodal Perspectives, edited by Aleksandra Mroczko-Wąsowicz , and Rick Grush , 113–129. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Brogaard, Berit, and Thomas A. Sørensen (*in press*, a). "Predictive Processing and Object Recognition." In Expected Experiences: The Predictive Mind in an Uncertain World, edited by Tony Cheng , and Jakob Hohwy . New York: Routledge.

Brogaard, Berit , and Thomas A. Sørensen (in press, b). "The Role of Long-term Memory in Visual Perception." In The Roles of Representation in Visual Perception, edited by Robert French and Berit Brogaard . New York: Springer.

Bundesen, Claus . 1990. "A Theory of Visual Attention." Psychological Review 97 (4): 523–547. https://doi.org/10.1037/0033-295x.97.4.523

Bundesen, Claus , and Thomas Habekost . 2008. Principles of Visual Attention. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Bundesen, Claus , Thomas Habekost , and Soren Kyllingsbæk . 2005. "A Neural Theory of Visual Attention." Psychological Review 112 (2): 291–328. https://doi.org/10.1037/0033-295X.112.2.291

Carrasco, Marisa , Sam Ling , and Sarah Read . 2004. "Attention Alters Appearance." Nature Neuroscience 7 (3): 308–313. https://doi.org/10.1038/nn1194

Cohen, Michael A., Kevin Ortego, Andrew Kyroudis, and Michael Pitts. 2020. "Distinguishing the Neural Correlates of Perceptual Awareness and Post-perceptual Processing." The Journal of Neuroscience 40 (25): 4925–4935. https://doi.org/10.1523/JNEUROSCI.0120-20.2020

Conci, Markus, Philipp Kreyenmeier, Lisa Kröll, Connor Spiech, and Hermann J. Müller. 2021. "The Nationality Benefit: Long-term Memory Associations Enhance Visual Working Memory for Color-Shape Conjunctions." Psychonomic Bulletin & Review 28 (6): 1982–1990. https://doi.org/10.3758/s13423-021-01957-2

Dall, Jonas O ., Yong-ming Wang , Xin-lu Cai , Raymond C. Chan , and Thomas A. Sørensen . 2021. "Visual Short-term Memory and Attention: An Investigation of Familiarity and Stroke Count in Chinese Characters." Journal of Experimental Psychology 47 (2): 282–294. https://doi.org/10.1037/xlm0000950

Dall, Jonas O., Katsumi Watanabe, and Thomas A. Sørensen . 2016. "Category Specific Knowledge Modulate Capacity Limitations of Visual Short-term Memory." 8th International Conference on Knowledge and Smart Technology (KST). IEEE: 275–280. https://doi.org/10.1109/KST.2016.7440508

Eiserbeck, Anna , Alexander Enge , Milena Rabovsky , and Rasha Abdel Rahman . 2022. "Electrophysiological Chronometry of Graded Consciousness During the Attentional Blink." Cerebral Cortex 32 (6): 1244–1259. https://doi.org/10.1093/cercor/bhab289

Gazzaniga, Michael S ., Richard B. Ivry, and George R. Mangun . 2018. Cognitive Neuroscience. The Biology of the Mind. New York and London: W. W. Norton.

Koch Christof , Marcello Massimini , Melanie Boly , and Giulio Tononi . 2016. "Neural Correlates of Consciousness: Progress and Problems." Nature Reviews. Neuroscience 17 (5): 307–321. https://doi.org/10.1038/nrn.2016.22

Koivisto, Mika , Mikko Lähteenmäki , and Thomas A. Sørensen , Signe Vangkilde , Morten Overgaard , and Antti Revonsuo . 2008. "The Earliest Electrophysiological Correlate of Visual Awareness?" Brain and Cognition 66 (1): 91–103. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bandc.2007.05.010 Koivisto, Mika , and Antti Revonsuo . 2003. "An ERP Study of Change Detection, Change Blindness, and Visual Awareness." Psychophysiology 40 (3): 423–429. https://doi.org/10.1111/1469-8986.00044

Koivisto, Mika , and Antti Revonsuo . 2007. "Electrophysiological Correlates of Visual Consciousness and Selective Attention." Neuroreport 18 (8): 753–756.

https://doi.org/10.1097/WNR.0b013e3280c143c8

Koivisto, Mika , and Antti Revonsuo . 2010. "Event-related Brain Potential Correlates of Visual Awareness." Neuroscience & Biobehavioral Reviews 34 (6): 922–934.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neubiorev.2009.12.002

Kveraga, Kestutis , Jasmine Boshyan , and Moshe Bar . 2007. "Magnocellular Projections as the Trigger of Top-down Facilitation in Recognition." Journal of Neuroscience 27 (48): 13232–13240. https://doi.org/10.1523/JNEUROSCI.3481-07.2007

Lopez, Azenet . 2020. "Information Gating and the Structure of Consciousness." Doctoral Dissertation. The University of Miami.

Lowe, Matthew X ., Jason Rajsic , Susanne Ferber , and Dirk B. Walther . 2018. "Discriminating scene categories from brain activity within 100 milliseconds." Cortex 106: 275–287. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cortex.2018.06.006

Luce, R. Duncan . 1963. "A Threshold Theory for Simple Detection Experiments." Psychological Review 70 (1): 61–79. https://doi.org/10.1037/h0039723

Oliva, Aude , and Antonio Torralba . 2007. "The Role of Context in Object Recognition." Trends in Cognitive Sciences 11 (12): 520–527. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tics.2007.09.009

Overgaard, Morten , Mika Koivisto , Thomas A. Sørensen , Signe Vangkilde , and Antti Revonsuo, A . 2006. "The Electrophysiology of Introspection." Consciousness and Cognition 15 (4): 662–672. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.concog.2006.05.002

Overgaard, Morten , and Thomas A. Sørensen . 2004. "Introspection Distinct from First-order Experiences." Journal of Consciousness Studies 11 (7–8): 77–95.

Pincham, Hannah L ., Howard Bowman , and Dénes Szucs . 2016. "The Experiential Blink: Mapping the Cost of Working Memory Encoding onto Conscious Perception in the Attentional Blink." Cortex 81 (6): 35–49. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cortex.2016.04.007

Pins, Delphine , and Dominic Ffytche . 2003. "The Neural Correlates of Conscious Vision." Cerebral Cortex 13 (5): 461–474. https://doi.org/10.1093/cercor/13.5.461

Pitts, Michael A., Antígona Martínez, and Steven A. Hillyard. 2012. "Visual Processing of Contour Patterns under Conditions of Inattentional Blindness." Journal of Cognitive Neuroscience 24 (2): 287–303. https://doi.org/10.1162/jocn a 00111

Ramsøy, Thomas Z ., and Morten Overgaard . 2004. "Introspection and Subliminal Perception." Phenomenology and the Cognitive Sciences 3: 1–23.

https://doi.org/10.1023/B:PHEN.0000041900.30172.e8

Raymond, Jane E., Kimron L. Shapiro , and Karen M. Arnell . 1992. "Temporary Suppression of Visual Processing in an RSVP Task: An Attentional Blink?" Journal of Experimental Psychology 18 (3): 849–860. https://doi.org/10.1037//0096-1523.18.3.849

Schyns, Philippe G., and Aude Oliva . 1994. From Blobs to Boundary Edges: Evidence for Time- and Spatial-dependent Scene Recognition. Psychological Science 5 (4): 195–200. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9280.1994.tb00500.x

Sergent, Claire , and Stanislas Dehaene . 2004. "Is Consciousness a Gradual Phenomenon? Evidence for an All-or-none Bifurcation During the Attentional Blink." Psychological Science 15 (11): 720–728. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.0956-7976.2004.00748.x

Sperling, George . 1960. "The Information Available in Brief Visual Presentations."

Psychological Monographs: General and Applied 74 (11): 1–29.

https://doi.org/10.1037/h0093759

Sørensen, Thomas A ., Árni Gunnar Ásgeirsson , Camilla Funch Staugaard , and Morten Overgaard . 2014. "Dissociating Contents of Consciousness from Contents of Short-term Memory." Journal of Vision 14 (10): 1382–1382. https://doi.org/10.1167/14.10.1382

Sørensen, Thomas A., and Søren Kyllingsbæk. 2012. "Short-term Storage Capacity for Visual Objects Depends on Expertise." Acta Psychologica 140 (2): 158–163.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.actpsy.2012.04.004

Tagliabue, Chiara F ., Chiara Mazzi , Chiara Bagattini , and Silvia Savazzi . 2016. "Early Local Activity in Temporal Areas Reflects Graded Content of Visual Perception." Frontiers in Psychology 7: 572. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2016.00572

Torralba, Antonio , Albe Oliva , Monica S. Castelhano , and John Henderson . 2006. "Contextual Guidance of Attention in Natural Scenes: The Role of Global Features on Object Search." Psychological Review 113 (4): 766–786.

Võ, Melissa Le-Hoa , Sage E. Boettcher , and Dejan Draschkow . 2019. "Reading Scenes: How Scene Grammar Guides Attention and Aids Perception in Real-world Environments." Current Opinion in Psychology 29: 205–210. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.copsyc.2019.03.009

Võ, Melissa Le-Hoa , and Jeremy M. Wolfe . 2015. "The Role of Memory for Visual Search in Scenes." Annals of the New York Academy of Sciences 1339 (1): 72–81. https://doi.org/10.1111/nyas.12667

Wilenius, Maria E ., and Antti T. Revonsuo . 2007. "Timing of the Earliest ERP Correlate of Visual Awareness." Psychophysiology 44 (5): 703–710. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-8986.2007.00546.x

Wilken, Patrick , and Wei J. Ma . 2004. "A Detection Theory Account of Change Detection." Journal of Vision 4 (12): 1120–1135. https://doi.org/10.1167/4.12.11

Windey, Bert , Wim Gevers , and Axel Cleeremans . 2013. "Subjective Visibility Depends on Level of Processing." Cognition 129 (2): 404–409.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cognition.2013.07.012

Windey, Bert , Astrid Vermeiren , Anne Atas , and Axel Cleeremans, A . 2014. "The Graded and Dichotomous Nature of Visual Awareness." Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series B, Biological Sciences 369 (1641): 20130282. http://dx.doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2013.0282

Xie, Weizhen , and Weiwei Zhang . 2017. "Familiarity Increases the Number of Remembered Pokémon in Visual Short-term Memory." Memory & Cognition 45 (4): 677–689. https://doi.org/10.3758/s13421-016-0679-7

Colour bit-by-bit

Akins, Kathleen , and Martin Hahn (forthcoming). "The Intentionality of Colour Perception." Akins, Kathleen . 2013. "Black and White or Color." In Consciousness Inside and Out: Phenomenology, Neuroscience, and the Nature of Experience, edited by Richard Brown , 173–223. Dordrecht: Springer.

Anyan, Walter R ., and Warren W. Quillian Li . 1971. "The Naming of Primary Colors by Children." Child Development 42 (5): 1629. https://doi.org/10.2307/1127934

Baraas, Rigmor C . 2005. "Perception of Chromatic Motion Requires Luminance Interaction." Perception 34 (8): 1025–1028. https://doi.org/10.1068/p5176

Bateman, W. G. 1915. "The Naming of Colors by Children the Binet Test." The Pedagogical Seminary 22 (4): 469–486. https://doi.org/10.1080/08919402.1915.10533978

Beaudot, William H. A., and Kathy T. Mullen . 2005. "Orientation Selectivity in Luminance and Color Vision Assessed Using 2-d Band-Pass Filtered Spatial Noise." Vision Research 45 (6): 687–696. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.visres.2004.09.023

Birch, Eileen , and Benno Petrig . 1996. "FPL and VEP Measures of Fusion, Stereopsis and Stereoacuity in Normal Infants." Vision Research 36 (9): 1321–1327.

https://doi.org/10.1016/0042-6989(95)00183-2

Blumenthal, Emily J., Rain G. Bosworth , and Karen R. Dobkins . 2013. "Fast Development of Global Motion Processing in Human Infants." Journal of Vision 13 (13): 8. https://doi.org/10.1167/13.13.8

Bosten, Jenny M ., Laura Smith , and John D. Mollon . 2016. "Speed and the Coherence of Superimposed Chromatic Gratings." Vision Research 122: 66–72.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.visres.2016.02.006

Braun, Doris I., Neil R. Mennie, Christoph Rasche, Alexander C. Schütz, Michael J. Hawken, and Karl R. Gegenfurtner. 2008. "Smooth Pursuit Eye Movements to Isoluminant Targets." Journal of Neurophysiology 100 (3): 1287–1300. https://doi.org/10.1152/jn.00747.2007 Braun, Doris I., Alexander C. Schütz, and Karl R. Gegenfurtner. 2017. "Visual Sensitivity for Luminance and Chromatic Stimuli during the Execution of Smooth Pursuit and Saccadic Eye Movements." Vision Research 136: 57–69. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.visres.2017.05.008

Breuil, Camille , Ben J. Jennings , Simon Barthelmé , Nathalie Guyader , and Frederick A. A. Kingdom . 2019. "Color Improves Edge Classification in Human Vision." Edited by Wolfgang Einhäuser . PLoS Computational Biology 15 (10): e1007398.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pcbi.1007398

Carey, Susan . 2009. The Origin of Concepts. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Cavanagh, Patrick , Shinya Saidaj , and Josée Rivest . 1995. "The Contribution of Color to Depth Perceived from Motion Parallax." Vision Research 35 (13): 1871–1878. https://doi.org/10.1016/0042-6989(94)00259-0

Chen, Jing , Matteo Valsecchi , and Karl R. Gegenfurtner . 2017. "Enhanced Brain Responses to Color during Smooth-Pursuit Eye Movements." Journal of Neurophysiology 118 (2): 749–754. https://doi.org/10.1152/jn.00208.2017

Chien, Sarina Hui-Lin , Kevin Bronson-Castain , John Palmer , and Davida Y. Teller . 2006. "Lightness Constancy in 4-Month-Old Infants." Vision Research 46 (13): 2139–2148. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.visres.2005.11.027

Chien, Sarina Hui-Lin , John Palmer , and Davida Y. Teller . 2005. "Achromatic Contrast Effects in Infants: Adults and 4-Month-Old Infants Show Similar Deviations from Wallach's Ratio Rule." Vision Research 45 (22): 2854–2861. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.visres.2004.07.035

Clancy, Barbara , Richard B. Darlington , and Barbara L. Finlay . 2001. "Translating Developmental Time Across Mammalian Species." Neuroscience 105 (1): 7–17. Clavadetscher, John E ., Angela M. Brown , Corlene Ankrum , and Davida Y. Teller . 1988. "Spectral Sensitivity and Chromatic Discriminations in 3- and 7-Week-Old Human Infants." Journal of the Optical Society of America A 5 (12): 2093.

https://doi.org/10.1364/JOSAA.5.002093

Dain, Stephen J ., and Barbara Y. Ling . 2009. "Cognitive Abilities of Children on a Gray Seriation Test." Optometry and Vision Science 86 (6): E701–E707.

https://doi.org/10.1097/OPX.0b013e3181a59d46

Darwin, Charles H . 1877. "A Biographical Sketch of a Young Infant." Kosmos 1: 367–376. Daw, Nigel W . 2012. How Vision Works: The Physiological Mechanisms Behind What We See. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Daw, Nigel W . 2014. Visual Development. New York: Springer.

Dobkins, Karen R., and Christina M. Anderson . 2002. "Color-Based Motion Processing Is Stronger in Infants Than in Adults." Psychological Science 13 (1): 76–80. https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-9280.00414

Dobkins, Karen R , and Vanitha Sampath . 2008. "The Use of Chromatic Information for Motion Segmentation: Differences between Psychophysical and Eye-Movement Measures." Perception 37 (7): 993–1009. https://doi.org/10.1068/p5957

Dobkins, Karen R ., and Davida Y. Teller . 1996. "Infant Contrast Detectors Are Selective for Direction of Motion." Vision Research 36 (2): 281–294. https://doi.org/10.1016/0042-6989(95)00094-G

Garcia-Suarez, L., and K. T. Mullen . 2013. "Form and Motion Processing of Second-Order Stimuli in Color Vision." Journal of Vision 13 (7): 10. https://doi.org/10.1167/13.7.10 Gheiratmand, Mina , Avital S. Cherniawsky , and Kathy T. Mullen . 2016. "Orientation Tuning of Binocular Summation: A Comparison of Colour to Achromatic Contrast." Scientific Reports 6 (1): 25692. https://doi.org/10.1038/srep25692

Gheiratmand, Mina , and Kathy T. Mullen . 2014. "Orientation Tuning in Human Colour Vision at Detection Threshold." Scientific Reports 4 (1): 4285. https://doi.org/10.1038/srep04285 Gheorghiu, Elena , and Frederick A. A. Kingdom . 2006. "Luminance-Contrast Properties of Contour-Shape Processing Revealed through the Shape-Frequency After-Effect." Vision Research 46 (21): 3603–3615. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.visres.2006.04.021

Gheorghiu, Elena, and Frederick A. A. Kingdom. 2007. "Chromatic Tuning of Contour-Shape Mechanisms Revealed through the Shape-Frequency and Shape-Amplitude After-Effects." Vision Research 47 (14): 1935–1949. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.visres.2007.03.010

Gheorghiu, Elena, and Frederick A. A. Kingdom. 2012. "Chromatic Properties of Texture-Shape and of Texture-Surround Suppression of Contour-Shape Mechanisms." Journal of Vision 12 (6): 16. https://doi.org/10.1167/12.6.16

Giesel, Martin , Thorsten Hansen , and Karl R. Gegenfurtner . 2009. "The Discrimination of Chromatic Textures." Journal of Vision 9 (9): 11. https://doi.org/10.1167/9.9.11

Goettker, Alexander , Doris I. Braun , and Karl R. Gegenfurtner . 2019. "Dynamic Combination of Position and Motion Information When Tracking Moving Targets." Journal of Vision 19 (7): 2. https://doi.org/10.1167/19.7.2

Granrud, Carl E., Albert Yonas, and Elizabeth A. Opland . 1985. "Infants' Sensitivity to the Depth Cue of Shading." Perception & Psychophysics 37 (5): 415–419. https://doi.org/10.3758/BF03202872

Hansen, Thorsten , and Karl R. Gegenfurtner . 2009. "Independence of Color and Luminance Edges in Natural Scenes." Visual Neuroscience 26 (1): 35–49.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0952523808080796

Hansen, Thorsten , and Karl R. Gegenfurtner . 2017. "Color Contributes to Object-Contour Perception in Natural Scenes." Journal of Vision 17 (3): 14–14. https://doi.org/10.1167/17.3.14 Humphreys, Glyn W ., Christian N. L. Olivers , and Jason J. Braithwaite . 2006. "The Time Course of Preview Search with Color-Defined, Not Luminance-Defined, Stimuli." Perception & Psychophysics 68 (8): 1351–1358. https://doi.org/10.3758/BF03193733

Ivanov, Iliya V ., Daniel J. Kramer , and Kathy T. Mullen . 2014. "The Role of the Foreshortening Cue in the Perception of 3D Object Slant." Vision Research 94: 41–50. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.visres.2013.10.019 Jackson, Frank . 1986. "What Mary Didn't Know." The Journal of Philosophy 83 (5): 291–295. https://doi.org/10.2307/2026143

Jennings, Ben J., and Jasna Martinovic . 2015. "Chromatic Contrast in Luminance-Defined Images Affects Performance and Neural Activity during a Shape Classification Task." Journal of Vision 15 (15): 21. https://doi.org/10.1167/15.15.21

Jennings, Ben J., Konstantinos Tsattalios, Ramakrishna Chakravarthi, and Jasna Martinovic. 2016. "Combining S-Cone and Luminance Signals Adversely Affects Discrimination of Objects within Backgrounds." Scientific Reports 6 (1): 20504. https://doi.org/10.1038/srep20504 Johnson, Scott P., and Richard N. Aslin. 2000. "Infants' Perception of Transparency." Developmental Psychology 36 (6): 808–816.

Kanazawa, So, Nobu Shirai, Yumiko Otsuka, and Masami K. Yamaguchi. 2004. "Perception of Motion Transparency in 5-Month-Old Infants." Perception 36 (1): 145–156. https://doi.org/10.1068/p5277

Kavšek, M . 2009. "The Perception of Subjective Contours and Neon Color Spreading Figures in Young Infants." Attention, Perception & Psychophysics 71 (2): 412–420.

https://doi.org/10.3758/APP.71.2.412

Kavšek, Michael . 2011. "Infants' Responsiveness to Lightness Changes on a Dynamic Three-Dimensional Surface." Vision Research 51 (23–24): 2398–2404.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.visres.2011.09.018

Kavšek, Michael . 2013. "Rotary Motion Impairs Attention to Color Change in 4-Month-Old Infants." Journal of Experimental Child Psychology 115 (2): 262–272.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jecp.2013.02.005

Kavšek, Michael , and Elmira Marks . 2015. "Infants Perceive Three-Dimensional Illusory Contours as Occluding Surfaces." Child Development 86 (6): 1865–1876. https://doi.org/10.1111/cdev.12419

Kentridge, Robert W., Charles A. Heywood, and Alan Cowey. 2004. "Chromatic Edges, Surfaces and Constancies in Cerebral Achromatopsia." Neuropsychologia 42 (6): 821–830. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuropsychologia.2003.11.002

Kim, Yeon J., Mina Gheiratmand, and Kathy T. Mullen. 2013. "Cross-Orientation Masking in Human Color Vision: Application of a Two-Stage Model to Assess Dichoptic and Monocular Sources of Suppression." Journal of Vision 13 (6): 15. https://doi.org/10.1167/13.6.15 Kingdom, Frederick A. A. 2003. "Color Brings Relief to Human Vision." Nature Neuroscience 6 (6): 641–644. https://doi.org/10.1038/nn1060

Kingdom, Frederick A. A., Jason Bell, Christian Haddad, and Alysha Bartsch. 2015. "Perceptual Scales for Chromatic and Luminance Blur in Noise Textures." Journal of Vision 15 (9): 6. https://doi.org/10.1167/15.9.6

Kingdom, Frederick A. A., and Reza Kasrai. 2006. "Colour Unmasks Dark Targets in Complex Displays." Vision Research 46 (6–7): 814–822. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.visres.2005.08.018 Kingdom, Frederick A. A., Hyung-Chul O. Li, and Elizabeth J. MacAulay. 2001. "The Role of Chromatic Contrast and Luminance Polarity in Stereoscopic Segmentation." Vision Research 41 (3): 375–383. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0042-6989(00)00251-0

Kinnear, P. R. and Arash Sahraie . 2002. "New Farnsworth-Munsell 100 Hue Test Norms of Normal Observers for Each Year of Age 5–22 and for Age Decades 30-70'." British Journal of Ophthalmology 86 (12): 1408–1411. https://doi.org/10.1136/bjo.86.12.1408

Lia, Barry, Karen R. Dobkins, John Palmer, and Davida Y. Teller. 1999. "Infants Code the Direction of Chromatic Quadrature Motion." Vision Research 39 (10): 1783–1794. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0042-6989(98)00202-8

Lin, Ying , and Duje Tadin . 2019. "Motion Perception: Slow Development of Center-Surround Suppression." Current Biology 29 (18): R878–880. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cub.2019.07.079 Lindsey, Delwin T ., Angela M. Brown , Ester Reijnen , Anina N. Rich , Yoana I. Kuzmova , and Jeremy M. Wolfe . 2010. "Color Channels, Not Color Appearance or Color Categories, Guide Visual Search for Desaturated Color Targets." Psychological Science 21 (9): 1208–1214. https://doi.org/10.1177/0956797610379861

Livingstone, Margaret , and David Hubel . 1988. "Segregation of Form, Color, Movement, and Depth: Anatomy, Physiology, and Perception." Science 240 (4853): 740–749. https://doi.org/10.1126/science.3283936

McIlhagga, William H ., and Kathy T. Mullen . 1996. "Contour Integration with Colour and Luminance Contrast." Vision Research 36 (9): 1265–1279. https://doi.org/10.1016/0042-

6989(95)00196-4

Mendelovici, Angela . 2018. The Phenomenal Basis of Intentionality. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Michna, Magda L ., Tatsuya Yoshizawa , and Kathy T. Mullen . 2007. "S-cone Contributions to Linear and Non-linear Motion Processing." Vision Research 47 (8): 1042–1054. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.visres.2007.01.014

Miller, George A., and Philip. N. Johnson-Laird . 1976. Language and Perception. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Miyahara, Eriko . 2006. "Effects of Chromaticities and Occlusion of Shaft on Magnitude of the Müller-Lyer Illusion." Perceptual and Motor Skills 102 (1): 259–264.

https://doi.org/10.2466/pms.102.1.259-264

Moutoussis, Konstantinos . 2015. "The Physiology and Psychophysics of the Color-Form Relationship: A Review." Frontiers in Psychology 6: 1407.

https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2015.01407

Mullen, Kathy T ., William H. A. Beaudot , and William H. McIlhagga . 2000. "Contour Integration in Color Vision: A Common Process for the Blue-Yellow, Red-Green and Luminance Mechanisms?" Vision Research 40 (6): 639–655.

Mullen, Kathy T ., and William H. A. Beaudot . 2002. "Comparison of Color and Luminance Vision on a Global Shape Discrimination Task." Vision Research 42 (5): 565–575. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0042-6989(01)00305-4

Mundinano, Inaki-Carril, Dylan M. Fox, William C. Kwan, Diego Vidaurre, Leon Teo, Jihane Homman-Ludiye, Melvyn A. Goodale, David A. Leopold, and James A. Bourne. 2018. "Transient Visual Pathway Critical for Normal Development of Primate Grasping Behavior." Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 115 (6): 1364–1369.

https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1717016115

Mundinano, Inaki-Carril , William Chin Kwan , and James A. Bourne . 2015. "Mapping the Mosaic Sequence of Primate Visual Cortical Development." Frontiers in Neuroanatomy 9: 132. https://doi.org/10.3389/fnana.2015.00132

Nawrot, Elizabeth , Sherryse L. Mayo , and Mark Nawrot . 2009. "The Development of Depth Perception from Motion Parallax in Infancy." Attention, Perception & Psychophysics 71 (1): 194–199. https://doi.org/10.3758/app.71.1.194

Otsuka, Yumiko , Yuka Yamazaki , Yukuo Konishi , So Kanazawa , Masami K. Yamaguchi , and Branka Spehar . 2008. "The Perception of Illusory Transparent Surfaces in Infancy: Early Emergence of Sensitivity to Static Pictorial Cues." Journal of Vision 8 (16): 6–6. https://doi.org/10.1167/8.16.6

Otsuka, Yumiko , So Kanazawa , and Masami K. Yamaguchi . 2006. "Perceptual Transparency in 3- to 4-Month-Old Infants." Perception 35 (12): 1625–1636. https://doi.org/10.1068/p5386 Pearson, Pauline M ., and Frederick A. A. Kingdom . 2002. "Texture-Orientation Mechanisms Pool Colour and Luminance Contrast." Vision Research 42 (12): 1547–1558. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0042-6989(02)00067-6

Pereverzeva, Maria , and Davida Y. Teller . 2009. "Simultaneous Color Contrast in 4-Month-Old Infants." Perception 38 (1): 30–43. https://doi.org/10.1068/p6098

Pitchford, Nicola J ., and Kathy T. Mullen . 2005. "The Role of Perception, Language, and Preference in the Developmental Acquisition of Basic Color Terms." Journal of Experimental Child Psychology 90 (4): 275–302. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jecp.2004.12.005

Pulos, Elizabeth , Davida Y. Teller , and Steven L. Buck . 1980. "Infant Color Vision: A Search for Short-Wavelength-Sensitive Mechanisms by Means of Chromatic Adaptation." Vision Research 20 (6): 485–493. https://doi.org/10.1016/0042-6989(80)90123-6

Rentzeperis, Ilias, David M. Alexander, Daniel C. Kiper, and Cees van Leeuwen. 2015. "Orientation Perception Anisotropies Indicate Functional Segregation within the Color System." Journal of Vision 15 (9): 13. https://doi.org/10.1167/15.9.13

Ruppertsberg, Alexa I., Sophie M. Wuerger , and Marco Bertamini . 2003. "The Chromatic Input to Global Motion Perception." Visual Neuroscience 20 (4): 421–428.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0952523803204077

Saarela, Toni P ., and Michael S. Landy . 2012. "Combination of Texture and Color Cues in Visual Segmentation." Vision Research 58: 59–67. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.visres.2012.01.019 Sato, Kazuki , So Kanazawa , and Masami K. Yamaguchi . 2016. "Infants' Discrimination of Shapes from Shading and Cast Shadows." Attention, Perception & Psychophysics 78 (5): 1453–1459. https://doi.org/10.3758/s13414-016-1114-7

Sato, Kazuki , So Kanazawa , and Masami K. Yamaguchi . 2017. "Infants' Perception of Lightness Changes Related to Cast Shadows." PloS One 12 (3): e0173591. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0173591

Schofield, Andrew J., and Frederick A. A. Kingdom . 2014. "Texture Variations Suppress Suprathreshold Brightness and Colour Variations." PLoS One 9 (12 (12): e114803. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0114803

Seymour, Kiley J ., Mark A. Williams , and Anina N. Rich . 2016. "The Representation of Color across the Human Visual Cortex: Distinguishing Chromatic Signals Contributing to Object Form Versus Surface Color." Cerebral Cortex 26 (5): 1997–2005.

https://doi.org/10.1093/cercor/bhv021

Sharman, Rebecca J., Paul V. McGraw, and Jonathan W. Peirce . 2013. "Luminance Cues Constrain Chromatic Blur Discrimination in Natural Scene Stimuli." Journal of Vision 13 (4): 14. https://doi.org/10.1167/13.4.14

Simmons, David R ., and Frederick A. A. Kingdom . 1995. "Differences between Stereopsis with Isoluminant and Isochromatic Stimuli." Journal of the Optical Society of America. A, Optics, image science, and vision, 12 (10): 2094–2104. https://doi.org/10.1364/josaa.12.002094 Simmons, David R ., and Frederick A. A. Kingdom . 2002. "Interactions between Chromatic- and Luminance-Contrast-Sensitive Stereopsis Mechanisms." Vision Research 42 (12): 1535–1545. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0042-6989(02)00080-9

Sun, Mengdan , Xuemin Zhang , Lingxia Fan , and Luming Hu . 2018. "Hue Distinctiveness Overrides Category in Determining Performance in Multiple Object Tracking." Attention, Perception, & Psychophysics 80 (2): 374–386. https://doi.org/10.3758/s13414-017-1466-7 Suttle, Catherine M ., Martin S. Banks, and Erich W. Graf . 2002. "FPL and Sweep VEP to Tritan Stimuli in Young Human Infants." Vision Research 42 (26): 2879–2891.

https://doi.org/10.1016/S0042-6989(02)00333-4

Teller, Davida Y . 1982. "Scotopic Vision, Color Vision, and Stereopsis in Infants." Current Eye Research 2 (3): 199–210. https://doi.org/10.3109/02713688208997695

Teller, Davida Y . 1997. "First Glances: The Vision of Infants. The Friedenwald Lecture." Investigative Ophthalmology & Visual Science 38 (11): 2183–2203.

Teller, Davida Y ., Thomas E. W. Brooks , and John Palmer . 1997. "Infant Color Vision: Moving Tritan Stimuli Do Not Elicit Directionally Appropriate Eye Movements in 2- and 4-Month-Olds'. Vision Research 37 (7): 899–911. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0042-6989(97)89820-3

Teller, Davida Y., Delwin T. Lindsey, Corinne M. Mar, Annemarie Succop, and Monika R. Mahal. 1992. "Infant Temporal Contrast Sensitivity at Low Temporal Frequencies." Vision Research 32 (6): 1157–1162. https://doi.org/10.1016/0042-6989(92)90017-d

Teller, Davida Y ., and J. Palmer . 1996. "Infant Color Vision: Motion Nulls for Red/Green vs Luminance-Modulated Stimuli in Infants and Adults." Vision Research 36 (7): 955–974. https://doi.org/10.1016/0042-6989(95)00170-0

Teller, Davida Y ., David R. Peeples , and Michael Sekel . 1978. "Discrimination of Chromatic from White Light by Two-Month-Old Human Infants." Vision Research 18 (1): 41–48. https://doi.org/10.1016/0042-6989(78)90075-5

Tyler, Christopher W ., and Patrick Cavanagh . 1991. "Purely Chromatic Perception of Motion in Depth: Two Eyes as Sensitive as One." Perception & Psychophysics 49 (1): 53–61. https://doi.org/10.3758/BF03211616

Van Den Boomen, Carlijn , Victor A. F. Lamme , and Chantal Kemner . 2014. "Parallel Development of ERP and Behavioural Measurements of Visual Segmentation." Developmental Science 17 (1): 1–10. https://doi.org/10.1111/desc.12093

Verriest, Guy . 1982. "Colour Vision in Childhood." Bulletin de la Societe belge d'ophtalmologie *202* , 71–95.

Warner, Claire E ., William C. Kwan , and James A. Bourne . 2012. "The Early Maturation of Visual Cortical Area MT Is Dependent on Input from the Retinorecipient Medial Portion of the Inferior Pulvinar." The Journal of Neuroscience: The Official Journal of the Society for Neuroscience 32 (48): 17073–17085. https://doi.org/10.1523/JNEUROSCI.3269-12.2012 White, Thomas E ., Bibiana Rojas , Johanna Mappes , Petri Rautiala , and Darrell J. Kemp . 2017. "Colour and Luminance Contrasts Predict the Human Detection of Natural Stimuli in Complex Visual Environments." Biology Letters 13 (9): 20170375.

Witzel, Christoph , Maria Olkkonen , and Karl R. Gegenfurtner . 2016. "Memory Colours Affect Colour Appearance." The Behavioral and Brain Sciences 39: e262.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0140525X15002587

Woods, Rebecca J., and Teresa Wilcox. 2010. "Covariation of Color and Luminance Facilitate Object Individuation in Infancy." Developmental Psychology 46 (3): 681–690. https://doi.org/10.1037/a0019161

Yang, Jiale , So Kanazawa , and Masami K. Yamaguchi . 2009. "Perception of Neon Color Spreading in 3–6-Month-Old Infants." Infant Behavior and Development 32 (4): 461–467. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.infbeh.2009.09.001

Yang, Jiale , So Kanazawa , and Masami K. Yamaguchi . 2010. "Perception of Munker-White Illusion in 4-8-Month-Old Infants." Infant Behavior & Development 33 (4): 589–595. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.infbeh.2010.07.010

Yang, Jiale , So Kanazawa , and Masami K. Yamaguchi . 2013. "Can Infants Tell the Difference between Gold and Yellow?' PloS One 8 (6): e67535.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0067535

Yang, Jiale , Junji Watanabe , So Kanazawa, S. Nishida , and Masami K. Yamaguchi . 2015. "Infants' Visual System Nonretinotopically Integrates Color Signals along a Motion Trajectory." Journal of Vision 15 (1): 25. https://doi.org/10.1167/15.1.25

Yang, Jiale , So Kanazawa , Masami K. Yamaguchi , and Ichiro Kuriki . 2013. "Investigation of Color Constancy in 4.5-Month-Old Infants under a Strict Control of Luminance Contrast for Individual Participants." Journal of Experimental Child Psychology 115 (1): 126–136. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jecp.2012.11.013

Zaidi, Qasim , and Andrea Li . 2006. "Three-Dimensional Shape Perception from Chromatic Orientation Flows." Visual Neuroscience 23 (3–4): 323–330.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0952523806233170

(Un)conscious perspectival shape and attention guidance in visual search

Alitto, Henry J., and W. Martin Usrey . 2008. "Spatial Attention and Visual Processing in the Lateral Geniculate Nucleus." Journal of Vision 8 (17): 3–3. https://doi.org/10.1167/8.17.3 Ansorge, Ulrich , Gernot Horstmann , and Ingrid Scharlau . 2011. "Top-Down Contingent Feature-Specific Orienting with and without Awareness of the Visual Input." Advances in Cognitive Psychology 7 (2): 108–119. https://doi.org/10.2478/v10053-008-0087-z

Ansorge, Ulrich , Monika Kiss , and Martin Eimer . 2009. "Goal-driven Attentional Capture by Invisible Colors: Evidence from Event-related Potentials." Psychonomic Bulletin & Review 16 (4): 648–653. https://doi.org/10.3758/PBR.16.4.648

Ansorge, Ulrich , and Odmar Neumann . 2005. "Intentions Determine the Effect of Invisible Metacontrast-masked Primes: Evidence for Top-down Contingencies in a Peripheral Cuing Task." Journal of Experimental Psychology: Human Perception and Performance 31 (4): 762. https://doi.org/10.1037/0096-1523.31.4.762–777

Breitmeyer, Bruno G . 1984. Visual Masking: An Integrative Approach. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Briscoe, Robert E . 2008. "Vision, Action, and Make-perceive." Mind & Language 23 (4): 457–497. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-0017.2008.00351.x

Burge, Johannes , and Tyler Burge . 2022. "Shape, Perspective, and What Is and Is Not Perceived: Comment on Morales, Bax, and Firestone (2020)." Psychological Review. https://doi.org/10.1037/rev0000363

Cheng, Tony . 2022. "Spatial Representations in Sensory Modalities." Mind & Language 37 (3): 485–500. https://doi.org/10.1111/mila.12409

Cheng, Tony , Yi Lin , and Chen-Wei Wu . 2022. "Perspectival Shapes Are Viewpointdependent Relational Properties." Psychological Review 2022: 1–4 https://doi.org/10.1037/rev0000404

Cohen, Dale J ., and Holly E. Jones . 2008. "How Shape Constancy Relates to Drawing Accuracy." Psychology of Aesthetics, Creativity, and the Arts 2 (1): 8–19. https://doi.org/10.1037/1931-3896.2.1.8 Eimer, M . 2014. "The Neural Basis of Attentional Control in Visual Search." Trends in Cognitive Sciences 18 (10): 526–535. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tics.2014.05.005

Green, E. J. , and Susanna Schellenberg . 2017. Spatial Perception: The Perspectival Aspect of Perception. Philosophy Compass 13 (2): e12472. https://doi.org/10.1111/phc3.12472

Hopp, Walter . 2013. "No Such Look: Problems with the Dual Content Theory." Phenomenology and the Cognitive Sciences 12 (4): 813–833. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11097-012-9287-6 Kelly, Sean D . 2008. "Content and Constancy: Phenomenology, Psychology, and the Content of Perception." Philosophy and Phenomenological Research 76 (3): 682–690.

https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1933-1592.2008.00164.x

Lamy, Dominique , Lamor Alon , Tomer Carmel , and Nir Shalev . 2015. "The Role of Conscious Perception in Attentional Capture and Object-file Updating." Psychological science 26 (1): 48–57. https://doi.org/10.1177/0956797614556777

Lande, Kevin J . 2018. "The Perspectival Character of Perception." The Journal of Philosophy 115 (4): 187–214. https://doi.org/0.5840/jphil2018115413

Lindsey, Delvin T ., Angela M. Brown , Ester Reijnen , Anina N. Rich , Yoana I. Kuzmova , and Jeremy M. Wolfe . 2010. "Color Channels, Not Color Appearance or Color Categories, Guide Visual Search for Desaturated Color Targets." Psychological science 21 (9): 1208–1214. https://doi.org/10.1177/0956797610379861

Morales, Jorge . 2021 April 13. "Re: Cognitive Science of Philosophy Symposium: Philosophy of Perception in the Laboratory [Discussion post]." The Brains Blog.

https://philosophyofbrains.com/2021/04/13/cognitive-science-of-philosophy-symposium-philosophy-of-perception-in-the-laboratory.aspx

Morales, Jorge, Axel Bax, and Chaz Firestone. 2020. "Sustained Representation of Perspectival Shape." Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 117 (26): 14873–14882. https://doi.org/10.1177/0956797610379861

Morales, Jorge , Axel Bax , and Chaz Firestone . 2021. "Reply to Linton: Perspectival Interference Up Close." Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 118 (28): e2025440118. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.202544011

Morales, Jorge , and Chaz Firestone . 2023. "Empirical Evidence for Perspectival Similarity." *Psychological Review*. Advance online publication. https://doi.org/10.1037/rev0000403

Neumann, Odmar , and Werner Klotz . 1994. "Motor Responses to Nonreportable, Masked Stimuli: Where Is the Limit of Direct Parameter Specification?" In Attention and performance XV: Conscious and nonconscious information processing, edited by Carlo Umiltà and Morris Moscovitch , 123–150. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

O'Connor, Daniel H ., Miki M. Fukui , Mark A. Pinsk , and Sabine Kastner . 2002. "Attention Modulates Responses in the Human Lateral Geniculate Nucleus." Nature Neuroscience 5 (11): 1203–1209. https://doi.org/10.1038/nn957

Schwenkler, John , and Assaf Weksler . 2019. "Are Perspectival Shapes Seen or Imagined? An Experimental Approach." Phenomenology and the Cognitive Sciences 18 (5): 855–877. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11097-018-9571-1

Schwitzgebel, Eric . 2006. "Do Things Look Flat?" Philosophy and Phenomenological Research 72 (3): 589–599.

Smith, Arthur D . 2005. The Problem of Perception. Harvard University Press.

Thouless, R. H. 1931. "Phenomenal Regression to the Real Object. I." British Journal of Psychology 21: 339–359. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.2044-8295.1931.tb00597.x

Thouless, R. H. 1932. "Individual Differences in Phenomenal Regression." British Journal of Psychology 22: 216–241.

Travis, Susan L., Paul E. Dux, and Jason B. Mattingley. 2019. "Neural Correlates of Goal-Directed Enhancement and Suppression of Visual Stimuli in the Absence of Conscious Perception." Attention, Perception, & Psychophysics 81 (5): 1346–1364. https://doi.org/10.3758/s13414-018-1615-7

Webb, Taylor W ., Hope H. Kean , and Michael S. Graziano . 2016. "Effects of Awareness on the Control of Attention." Journal of Cognitive Neuroscience 28 (6): 842–851. https://doi.org/10.1162/jocn a 00931

Wolfe, Jeremy M. 1998. "What Can 1 Million Trials Tell Us about Visual Search?" Psychological Science 9 (1): 33–39. https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-9280.00006

Wolfe, Jeremy M . 2010. "Visual Search." Current Biology 20 (8): R346–R349. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cub.2010.02.016 Wolfe, Jeremy M . 2014. "Approaches to Visual Search: Feature Integration Theory and Guided Search." In The Oxford Handbook of Attention, edited by Anna C. Noble , and Sabine Kastner , 11–55. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Wolfe, Jeremy M . 2020. "Visual Search: How Do we Find What we Are Looking for." Annual Review of Vision Science 6 (1): 539–562. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-vision-091718-015048

Woodman, Geoffrey F ., and Steven J. Luck . 2003. "Dissociations among Attention, Perception, and Awareness During Object-substitution Masking." Psychological Science 14 (6): 605–611. https://doi.org/10.1046/j.0956-7976.2003.psci_1472.x